

City of Madison

Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

| | Consider: Who benefits? Who is burdened? Who does not have a voice at the table? How can policymakers mitigate unintended consequences? | |
|--------------------------|---|---------|
| Wednesday, June 29, 2022 | 4:30 PM | Virtual |

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

| Present: | 7 - | Lois H. Braun-Oddo; Jessica Klehr; Cliff Goodhart; Shane A. Bernau; |
|----------|-----|---|
| | | Christian J. Harper; Rafeeq D. Asad and Russell S. Knudson |
| Excused: | 2 - | Juliana R. Bennett and Thomas A. DeChant |

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Klehr, seconded by Harper, to Approve the Minutes of June 15, 2022. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. 61804 Public Comment

Ald. Abbas spoke in support of Item #4, 3401 E. Washington Avenue.

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Asad recused himself on Item #9, 4205 Portage Road

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

2. 70848 701 Gardener Road - Comprehensive Design Review of Signage (CDR) Located in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 6. 11th Ald. Dist.

The motion noted the following:

- Approval of the 'EO' sign.
- The Whole Foods wall signage shall be reduced in size to comply with a sign size up to but not exceeding what is permitted under the Sign Code.
- Approval of the parking garage entry wall signs, projecting signs, and loading area wall sign.

A motion was made by Asad, seconded by Klehr, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

3. 70849 4728 Sheboygan Avenue - Comprehensive Design Review of Signage (CDR) Located in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 6. 11th Ald. Dist.

The motion noted the following:

Approval of four ground signs, including one each located at the development's University Avenue entrance, Segoe Road entrance, Sheboygan Avenue entrance, and a Corten landscape monument located in the central green space.

The University Avenue ground sign shall be reduced in height not to exceed 10 feet. In addition, the tenant panels shall be reduced in size to 1 foot by 3'-7".

- The tenant panels on the University Avenue monument signage shall be dark background and light letters.
- The Segoe Road ground sign shall be reduced in height not to exceed 10 feet and the tenant panels shall be removed from this sign.
- The Sheboygan Avenue ground sign shall be shall be reduced in height not to exceed 10 feet and the tenant panels shall be removed from this sign.
- Approval of the proposed banners to be decorative, seasonal or promotional. The proposed changeable copy banners shall be redesigned to meet the definition of "decorative or promotional banners."

A motion was made by Asad, seconded by Harper, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

4. <u>71151</u> 3401 E. Washington Avenue - Planned Multi-Use Site Located in Urban Design District (UDD) No. 5. 12th Ald. Dist.

The motion noted the following:

- Update the planting plan to add more diversity to the plant list, including incorporating more perennials and foundation plantings.
- Look at using a different Oak species that are shown close to the building, including Regal Prince or English Oak.
- Look at potentially pulling the Fair Oaks building over toward the access drive in order to make the walkway wider for more privacy for the apartments.
- Provide a more solid screen element than the proposed wood trellis in the pedestrian plaza space for the residential units.
- Incorporate the same screen element provided on the pedestrian plaza between Buildings 1 and 2 along the E. Washington Avenue side to buffer the commercial seating area.
- Submit a lighting plan for the pedestrian areas to be reviewed and approved administratively by the Urban Design Commission Secretary.
- Add more landscaping to the roof terrace spaces. Rooftop planting plans should match the renderings in the presentation.
- The Commission will wait for a signage package to be brought forward, noting that the shallow canopy signs presented are holding signage below the second floor, but that three signs along the E. Washington Avenue frontage seem excessive.

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Klehr, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

SPECIAL ITEM OF BUSINESS

5. <u>72248</u> Report of the Facade Grant Staff Team - 1425 Gilson Street, Black Label Auto. 13th Ald. Dist.

This item was approved as a consent item with the finding that all applicable standards are adequately addressed and with all the staff recommendations contained in the report.

A motion was made by Bernau, seconded by Klehr, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

6. <u>71985</u> Facade Grant Program Policy Updates

The Urban Design Commission Received a Presentation. No action was taken.

City of Madison

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

7. <u>69486</u> 430-432-444 State Street - New Mixed-Use Building in the Downtown Core (DC) District. 2nd Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission found that this proposal sets a precedent and recommends that the building as proposed not be approved based on the following:

- The proposal needs to relate better to the pedestrian scale.
- The proposal needs articulation of materials that is not matching, but that is not foreign to the other architectural elements on State Street.
- The corner tower element is too heavy for the scale of the building and needs articulation and more of a unification of the front, back and side façades.
- The project would benefit from, if not a complete removal of a floor, perhaps a portion going from four to three-stories at the street.
- More articulation along the State Street façade with a slight stepback to appear less sheer along the sidewalk.
- Look at the rhythm of the bays so that they are more vertical and the building reads as a series of vertical elements vs. a more egg crate design.
- The Commission recognizes that having units facing Lisa Link Peace Park on the other side is a good thing. However, it is unfortunate the building goes the full six-story height along there, whereas it's much lower along that side now.
- It is a blank wall right now and could be pretty neat to have lit apartments there at night vs. a blank brick wall.
- There are many successful infill projects that use more variety of modern materials in a creative way without mimicking the exact period of architecture next door, while still having very pedestrian scale elements.

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Knudson, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

NEW BUSINESS

 8.
 71722
 222 W. Gorham Street - Conditional Use in the Downtown Core for a Rooftop Patio.

 2nd Ald. Dist.
 2nd Ald. Dist.

The Commission noted that any noise issues would be taken care of by ordinance.

A motion was made by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Klehr, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

INFORMATIONAL PRESENTATIONS

9. 72121 4205 Portage Road - Residential Building Complex. 17th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation

 10.
 72122
 6853 McKee Road - Planned Development (PD) for the Construction of a New Funeral Home. 7th Ald. Dist.

This item was Referred to a future URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION meeting.

The Commission moved to Refer Item #10 at the request of Alder Wehelie. The motion passed on a vote of (5-1-1) with Braun-Oddo, Klehr, Harper, Knudson and Asad voting yes; Bernau voting no; and Goodhart non-voting.

The applicant, James McFadden, agreed to defer his presentation to a future

Urban Design Commission meeting.

SECRETARY'S REPORT

BUSINESS BY MEMBERS

 11.
 64940
 Announcements, Questions and/or Consideration Items for Future Agendas (No Other Action To Be Taken Under This Item)

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was Adjourned at 8:27 p.m. by unanimous consent.