

City of Madison

City of Madison Madison, WI 53703 www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, May 11, 2015

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd. Room LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Rosenblum excused. Gehrig left at 6:45 p.m. Fowler left at 7:00 p.m. Rummel left at 5:30 p.m. and returned at 6:30 p.m..

Present: 6 - Marsha A. Rummel; David W.J. McLean; Stuart Levitan; Jason T. Fowler;

Christina Slattery and Erica Fox Gehrig

Excused: 1 - Michael J. Rosenblum

APPROVAL OF APRIL 13 & 27, 2015 MINUTES

No action taken.

PUBLIC COMMENT

None

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

Slattery disclosed that she currently works with Jeff Gaard, the architect involved in the project at 206 N Spooner, but this will not impair her ability to serve as a Commissioner.

Levitan disclosed that he has a professional relationship with Tamara Packard, that Mr. Kardusian, owner of 206 N Prospect, served as editor on his first book, and that he and David Ewanowski are Rotary members, but these situations will not impair his ability to serve as a Commissioner.

REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Item #5 was taken out of order.

PUBLIC HEARING - REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

38096
117 North Prospect - University Heights Historic District - Replace siding and roofing; and build a rear addition which will include a porch. 5th Ald. Dist. Contact: Kyle Dumbleton; Midwest Modern, LLC

Kyle Dumbleton, AIA, registering in support, wishing to speak and available to answer questions.

Anne Wadsack, registering in support and available to answer questions.

Peter Wadsack, registering in support and available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed rear addition with the conditions of approval in the staff report. Motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Rummel, seconded by Gehrig, to Refer to the review of the COA for the siding and roofing to a future LANDMARKS COMMISSION meeting. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

2. 38054 411 South Dickinson Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District - New siding. 6th Ald. Dist.

Contact: Chris Jordan

Anne Schuelke, registering in support and available to answer questions.

Chris Jordan, registering in support and does not wish to speak.

Adam Tegre, registering in support and available to answer questions.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Slattery, to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement of siding with the conditions of approval in the staff report and complemented by the discussion during the meeting to retain the original or repaired in-kind front porch elements. The motion passed by voice vote.

3. 36002 206 North Spooner Street - University Heights Historic District - construct a new garage. 5th Ald. Dist.

Contact: Jeff Gaard

Jeff Gaard, registering in support and wishing to speak.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by McLean, to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing garage and the construction of a new garage as submitted. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

4. 38197 620 South Brearly Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Replace lakeside windows with door. 6th Ald. Dist.

Contact: Tamara Packard and Renee Herber

Tamara Packard, registering in support, wishing to speak, and available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the lower-level windows and replacement with a sliding patio door and sidelights with the condition of approval that the actual proportion of the glass divisions be verified against the existing divisions of adjacent windows. The motion passed by voice vote.

6. 38199 1018 Williamson Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Renovation, addition and convert into a two-unit apartment building. 6th Ald. Dist.

Contact: Brandon Cook

Brandon Cook, registering in support and available to answer questions.

Doug Pahl, registering in support, wishing to speak, and available to answer guestions.

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by Gehrig, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the rear addition and the exterior alterations including the conditions of approval in the staff report and consultation with staff on the details as conditions are uncovered. The motion passed by voice vote.

7. 38203

28 Langdon Street - Landmark Site - Mansion Hill Historic District - Alpha Phi Sorority - Window and door replacement and exterior alterations. 2nd Ald. Dist.

Contact: David J. Ewanowski, AIA, KEE Architecture, Inc.

David Ewanowski, AIA, registering in support and available to answer questions.

Sarah Skautzky, Assoc. AIA, registering in support and available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by McLean, to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed replacement windows without muntins, the guardrail, creating a door from the existing window and installation of the screen fence (if approved by PIS). The motion passed by voice vote.

8. 38200

1202 Williamson Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District - "Celebration of Life in the Willy Street Neighborhood" mural on the rear of the Social Justice Center. 6th Ald. Dist.

Contact: Sharon Kilfoy

Sharon Kilfoy, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Kelty Carew, registering in support and available to answer questions.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by McLean, to Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed mural and any exterior wall repairs with guidance from staff. The motion passed by voice vote.

ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION

9. <u>37589</u>

Consideration of a demolition permit and conditional use to demolish an existing mixed-use building and construct a new mixed-use building with 8,750 square feet of commercial space, 3,000 square feet of flex space, and 350 apartments at 510 University Avenue and 435 W. Gilman Street; 4th Ald. Dist.

Brian Munson, registering in support and wishing to speak.

Brad Mullins, registering in support and available to answer questions.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Rummel, that the Landmarks Commission regrets the demolition of 435 W Gilman Street, but welcomes the preservation of the façade in an historically relevant manner. The Commission

also finds that the proposed step backs are appreciated and allow the continuation of a varied streetscape character, but that an increase in the step back depth should be encouraged to preserve the character of the street; that the low brick sill and storefront with a non-residential use would be most appropriate for the existing façade; that the new upper portion of the "Art Deco" building has materials that are deferential to the historic portion of the façade; that the loading dock building design should be revised to better integrate the loading dock/parking garage door so that it is more appropriate in the pedestrian experience; and that the Plan Commission should review the Height Map for this area to align it with the character of the Gilman Street and the State Street District. Motion passed by voice vote (Slattery, McLean, Rummel). Levitan does not vote.

5. <u>38198</u>

1775 Norman Way - Landmark Site - Renovate house including wood siding, cedar shake roof, new windows, and dormer addition. 19th Ald. Dist. Contact: Daniel Giese

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by McLean, to Approve the Certificate of Apppropriateness with staff authority to approve compliance with the conditions of approval in the staff report and with an additional condition that the mounds must be protected during the work. The motion passed by voice vote.

REGULAR BUSINESS

10. <u>07804</u> Secretary's Report

Staff reminded the Commissioners about the Invitation to tour Urban Land Interest's relocated Lanon Hill Home.

Staff provided a LORC meeting schedule update.

11. <u>36427</u> Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2015

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Fowler, to convey to the Plan Commission that the Landmarks Commission regrets the loss of 2117 Sherman Avenue as a good representation of a 1950s commercial building and finds no known historic value for the buildings at 3520 E Washington, 2237 and 2241 Sherman Avenue. The motion passed by voice vote.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Rummel, seconded by McLean, to Adjourn at 8:00 p.m. The motion passed by voice vote.