



# City of Madison

City of Madison  
Madison, WI 53703  
www.cityofmadison.com

## Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

---

Monday, April 11, 2011

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.  
Room LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

---

### CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

**Present:** 6 -  
Stuart Levitan; Christina Slattery; Daniel J. Stephans; Robin M. Taylor;  
Michael J. Rosenblum and Erica Fox Gehrig

**Absent:** 1 -  
Bridget R. Maniaci

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Rosenblum, to APPROVE the March 28, 2011 meeting minutes.  
The motion passed by a voice vote/other.

### PUBLIC COMMENT

There was no public comment.

### DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

There were no disclosures or recusals.

### CONSIDERATION OF ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

- 1. [21964](#)** 943 Williamson Street - Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Exterior alteration involving roof replacement  
Contact: Jennifer Pulley & Charles Palit

Charlie Palit, 933 University Bay Drive, presented the project. Mr. Palit explained that this property is owned by Willie Unique Properties and the Owners believed that the contractor obtained a permit before starting work because he had done other work in the area. He explained that the metal roof was selected due to life expectancy of the material, environmental qualities and aesthetics. He explained that the work is 90% complete and the contractor has been paid to do the work. He noted that he did some research on historic roofing materials and found that when this building was built in 1896, wood shingles and tin roofing would have been available. Three tab shingles were not available at that time.

There was general discussion about the situation. Staff explained that a roof system fabricated on site out of separate pans with crimped and folded seams would be an appropriate roof, but that the Commission had set a precedent for allowing metal roofs if there was historic evidence that this roof type existed on the property in question. Staff also explained that there were numerous neighbor complaints about this roof and that the Commission's decision would set a precedent.

Gary Tipler, 807 Jenifer, registered in neither support nor opposition and wished to speak. Mr.

Tipler explained that he is an acquaintance of an Owner and wondered if the existing material could be painted to make the appearance more favorable. He explained that there were few metal roofs on the main roof in the area historically and that metal was used more on low sloping porch or small addition roofs. Mr. Tipler suggested that this issue go before the neighborhood association to attempt to find a resolution.

Mr. Levitan suggested that the Owners consider a comprehensive maintenance and preservation plan for the three adjoining properties that could be reviewed with the Landmarks Commission before any other projects are planned. Mr. Palit explained that the existing roof was in poor condition and that the building was occupied.

**A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed roof to be completed and following consultation with the neighborhood association, the applicants address the roof color to minimize visual impact by painting or other means and that by May 21, 2014 a new historically appropriate roof is installed as per Landmarks Commission approval as to style and design.**

**The motion was denied by the following vote:**

**Absent: 1 -**

**Bridget Maniaci**

**Ayes: 1 -**

**Stuart Levitan**

**Noes: 3 -**

**Christina Slattery, Robin Taylor, Michael Rosenblum**

**Abstentions: 2 -**

**Erica Fox Gehrig, Daniel Stephans**

**A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Slattery, to APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for a historically appropriate roof material as reviewed and approved by Staff.**

**The motion passed by the following vote:**

**Absent: 1 -**

**Bridget Maniaci**

**Ayes: 1 -**

**Stuart Levitan, Christina Slattery, Robin Taylor, Michael Rosenblum**

**Noes: 0 -**

**Abstentions: 2 -**

**Erica Fox Gehrig, Daniel Stephans**

**2. [21965](#)**

**1716 Hoyt Street - University Heights Historic District - exterior alteration involving addition of bay.**

**Contact: Tom Haver**

Tom Haver, 212 South Baldwin Street, presented the project. Mr. Haver explained that the proposed addition location is most appropriate due to amount of solar exposure. He stated that, in response to the staff report, the existing cornice moulding on the first floor bay would remain in place and that the proposed window size and proportion would match the existing size and proportion below.

Alder Bidar-Sielaff registered in neither support nor opposition. She explained that she had not received any comments from the neighbors.

Sara Patterson 1716 Hoyt Street, registered in support and was available to answer questions.

**A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Taylor, to APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness for the bay window addition with the condition that the window proportion and spacing between the windows is consistent from first to second floors.**

**The motion passed by a voice vote/other.**

3. [21969](#) 149 Waubesa Street - Steinle Turret Machine Co/Kupfer Iron Works/Goodman Center - Designated Landmark - construction of new free-standing structure.

Contact: Becky Steinhoff

Becky Steinhoff briefly presented the project. Ms. Steinhoff stated that the pergola structure would be constructed by a Teen Works crew. She explained that the structure would not touch the landmark building and that the planters shown in the drawings will not be constructed at this time. Staff explained that the project needs a conditional use permit and that the project will be presented at an upcoming neighborhood meeting.

**A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Taylor, to APPROVE the Certificate of Appropriateness for the pergola as submitted subject to neighborhood association comments that will be reviewed and considered by Staff.**

**The motion passed by a voice vote/other.**

#### NEW BUSINESS

4. [21481](#) To approve the Madison Sustainability Plan.

Staff explained that copies of the Sustainability Plan were included in the Commissioners' packets for their review before the next meeting. Staff explained that Jeanne Hoffman would be at the next meeting to give a presentation about the plan.

**A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to REFER the issue to the May 9th Landmarks Commission meeting.**

**The motion passed by a voice vote/other.**

5. [20957](#) Buildings proposed for demolition - 2011

There were no comments about the current demolition notices.

6. [07804](#) Secretary's Report

Staff explained that there was a possibility that Dan Stephans could remain on the Commission even though he would no longer have a local address.

**A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to APPROVE the reappointment of Dan Stephans to the Landmarks Commission with a letter to Mayor-Elect Soglin from Mr. Levitan requesting the reappointment by the Common Council.**

**The motion passed by a voice vote/other.**

#### ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Slattery, to ADJOURN the meeting at 6:15 P.M.

The motion passed by a voice vote/other.