



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

Wednesday, December 7, 2011

4:30 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room LL-110 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 5 -

Dawn O. O'Kroley; Todd R. Barnett; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington and R. Richard Wagner

Excused: 3 -

Marsha A. Rummel; Melissa R. Huggins and Henry S. Lufler, Jr.

Rummel arrived at 4:37 p.m. during the "Secretary's Report" and after consent item recommendations and vote.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by O'Kroley, to Approve the Minutes of November 14 and 23, 2011. The motion passed by the following vote:

Excused: 2 -

Huggins and Lufler, Jr.

Ayes: 5 -

Rummel; O'Kroley; Barnett; Slayton and Wagner

Abstentions: 1 -

Harrington

PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

SECRETARY'S REPORT/AGENDA OVERVIEW

- Agenda overview with consent item recommendations.
- A Discussion on the Office of the City Attorney's advice to eliminate posted times for individual items on the agenda was deferred to "Business by Members."

ROLL CALL

- Present:** 6 -
Marsha A. Rummel; Dawn O. O'Kroley; Todd R. Barnett; Richard L. Slayton; John A. Harrington and R. Richard Wagner
- Excused:** 2 -
Melissa R. Huggins and Henry S. Lufler, Jr.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

- 1. [24240](#) 5515 Medical Circle - Comprehensive Design Review and Exceptions for Signage for the YMCA of Dane County in UDD No. 3. 19th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

The motion to Refer was due to the absence of the applicant's agent and issues with the presentation of the case relative to address of Comprehensive Design Review of Signage Standards and Provisions in addition to provisions for signage in UDD No. 3.

- 2. [24578](#) 2030 Pennsylvania Avenue - Comprehensive Design Review of Signage for "Hooper Corporation" in UDD No. 4. 12th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by O'Kroley, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other. This item was approved as a consent agenda item.

- 3. [24579](#) 4512 & 4522 East Washington Avenue - Comprehensive Design Review of Minor Alteration to an Existing Conditional Use, Signage for "East Washington Plaza" in UDD No. 5. 17th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by the following vote:

- Excused:** 2 -
Huggins and Lufler, Jr.
- Ayes:** 4 -
Barnett; Slayton; Harrington and Rummel
- Noes:** 1 -
O'Kroley

The motion to approve covered the entire package, with the encouragement that the applicant find a complementary color to the building's sign background and have it approved by staff.

- 4. [24586](#) 733 South Gammon Road - Demolition and New Construction of a

Retail/Commercial Building in UDD No. 2. 1st Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by O’Kroley, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION, at the recommendation of staff due to issues with the lack of an acceptable Plan Commission application required to accommodate the project. The motion passed by the following vote:

- Excused:** 2 -
Huggins and Lufler, Jr.
- Recused:** 1 -
Slayton
- Ayes:** 4 -
O’Kroley; Barnett; Harrington and Rummel

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

- 5. [24169](#) 7483 West Towne Way - Modifications to a Previously Approved Comprehensive Design Review, Wall Signage. 9th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by O’Kroley, seconded by Harrington, to Grant Final Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

- 6. [20458](#) 723 State Street - PUD(GDP-SIP), St. Paul's University Catholic Center. 8th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by O’Kroley, seconded by Rummel, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

The motion required the above stated concerns and the following:

- Specifically study lighting patterns showing what is there now and what will be there.
- Address landscaping comments.
- Address architecture comments by Scanlon and the Commission, especially by O’Kroley on history/preservation of existing walls.
- Reexamine appearance of base at parking area along east elevation at Fitch Court.

- 7. [16320](#) 801 South Park Street - New PUD(GDP-SIP), Mixed-Use Development in UDD No. 7. 13th Ald. Dist.

Revised Application for Mixed-Use, Two-Story Building with Drive-Up Window.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by O’Kroley, to Refer to the URBAN

DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by the following vote:

- Excused:** 2 -
Huggins and Lufler, Jr.
- Recused:** 1 -
Slayton
- Ayes:** 4 -
Barnett; Harrington; Rummel and O'Kroley

8. [08441](#) 1601-1739 Thierer Road - Development of a New Outpad Site in an Existing Planned Commercial Site. 17th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation**NEW BUSINESS**

9. [24671](#) 402 South Point Road - Public Building. 9th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Slayton, to Refer to the URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

The Urban Design Commission **REFERRED** consideration of this item to address the above stated concerns with the need to reexamine the master plan for what projected programming is actually planned to be on the site. Look at an overall design that minimizes pavement and provides for shared parking, especially with the driver training area. In addition, provide more information on what's happening to the east and relate to the fire station and stormwater facility and make main drive like an urban streetscape.

10. [24693](#) 701 & 737 Lorillard Court and 159-171 Proudfit Street - PUD (GDP-SIP) Apartment Building with 115 Apartments. 4th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation

11. [24690](#) 1323 West Dayton Street - PUD-SIP Eight-Story Apartment Building with 73 Units . 8th Ald. Dist.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation

12. [24691](#) 507 West Johnson, 202, 210 North Bassett, and 512, 520 West Dayton Streets - PUD-GDP for Two Apartment Buildings; a Twelve-Story with 155 Units and a Three-Story with 42 Units. 4th Ald. Dist.

Due to ordinance requirements for informational presentations for PUDs in Downtown Design Zones this item was presented for "Informational" purposes only.

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation

13. [24692](#) 3210 Maple Grove Drive - PUD (GDP-SIP) for Four Apartment Buildings with 106 Total Units. 7th Ald. Dist.

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Rummel, to Grant Initial Approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

The motion required the following:

- No vinyl materials.
- The dormers should be lowered from the ridge line slightly.
- Determine final materials on the roof.
- Look at balconies.
- Provide for differentiation between the buildings beyond the dormer treatment, and a connection between the three buildings.

14. [24689](#) 857 Jupiter Drive - Amended PUD-GDP for Grandview Commons Town Center. 3rd Ald. Dist

The Urban Design Commission Received an Informational Presentation**BUSINESS BY MEMBERS**

15. [24580](#) 1719 Monroe Street - Report of the Facade Grant Staff Team, "Eyeopia." 13th Ald. Dist.

On Monroe Street Reconsideration; staff noted that the timing for funding of the façade grant for this project ran out for this year anyway, so any further consideration has to be moved to next year. A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to reconsider the UDC's approval. Harrington was absent and asked for an explanation; maintenance versus façade grant. There was reluctance on the initial approval motion and then a few people changed their minds. It was a combination of discussion of whether or not this was simply repair versus improvement on the façade, a transformation. Harrington wondered what had changed since that initial motion which was explained by staff. Staff further noted that the project would probably come back as a re-application for a façade grant since it will be a new fiscal year.

A motion was made by Barnett, seconded by Rummel, to Approve. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

- A discussion on the Office of the City Attorney's advice to eliminate posted times for individual items on the agenda.

Staff noted that the times were to help people gauge when to be here but people took it more as the exact time. The City Attorney's Office felt the notes were adequate enough on the agenda but at the same time did not justify the practice of using individual item times. It is an unnecessary customer accommodation that creates confusion. It is the decision of the UDC because they made a decision to do so. But no other City bodies do this. How would this be handled when someone isn't here to present their item? The implication is these people have to sit around for four hours as opposed to coming for a small window; otherwise the Commission ends up sitting around waiting. If we take it off will we have some language that says "if you're not here your item will be referred?" The City Attorney said that is not necessary. There are APM's that rule how agendas are done. Barnett seconded the motion to take the times off. He further stated his unhappiness with having to deal with this as a problem. It should be stated that the Commission would take a break after a certain number of items. We don't want the public getting upset for taking a break. Rummel stated she first objected to this policy.

An email from Roger Allen to Al Martin and Michael May, dated December 1, 2011 stated the following:

"While customer service is always a laudable goal, I recommend that the practice of assigning specific times to agenda items be discontinued. There is nothing that prevents you from giving a best estimate to applicants but placing times on an agenda, even with the explanatory note, is a bad practice under the open meetings law."

A motion was made by Slayton, seconded by Barnett to approve elimination of posted times on agendas for individual times, along with the creation of a note on future agendas relative to scheduled/non-scheduled breaks required for multiple item agendas.

ADJOURNMENT