



City of Madison

City of Madison
Madison, WI 53703
www.cityofmadison.com

Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Monday, July 13, 2009

4:45 PM

215 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.
Room LL-130 (Madison Municipal Building)

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

Present: 7 -

Bridget R. Maniaci; Daniel J. Stephans; Stuart Levitan; Robin M. Taylor;
Michael J. Rosenblum; Christina Slattery and Erica Fox Gehrig

APPROVAL OF June 1, 2009 MINUTES

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to Approve the Minutes of the June 1, 2009 meeting. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

CONSIDERATION OF ISSUANCE OF CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

1. [15333](#) 2137 Chadbourne Avenue - University Heights Historic District
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new dormer, roof skylights and enlarged leaded glass window.
Contact: Larry Taff, TZ of Madison, Inc.

Larry Taff, 6 Fuller Dr, Madison, gave a brief overview of the project.
Philip Hollander, 2137 Chadbourne Ave, Madison, registered in support.

Mr. Rosenblum asked if the storm windows that were mentioned by Mr. Taff during his presentation are a part of this project, or a future project that will need Landmarks Commission approval. Mr. Taff replied that the homeowner would seek the appropriate approvals later, as storm windows are not a part of this project.

Ms Gehrig asked if the larger size egress window was needed for a building code issue, and if the code could be met by using the other larger existing window. Mr. Taff replied that the existing larger window will be in a bathroom, and the code does not allow it to be the only egress access.

Ms Taylor asked Mr. Stephans if he thought that the dormer was appropriate. Mr. Stephans said that while this type of dormer is not usually street facing, this house is on a corner lot, and the side/rear location of the dormer ends up facing the street. He said that it is a small dormer and will not have a large impact on the design of the house.

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Maniaci, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for project as submitted with the following conditions:

1. The materials of the new dormer to match the existing house.
2. The replacement leaded glass attic window on the front facade shall match the design of the existing attic window (or rear attic window), and be a true divided light window.
3. The skylights are to be low profile and parallel to the roofline.

The motion passed by the following vote:

Ayes: 6 -

Bridget R. Maniaci; Daniel J. Stephans; Stuart Levitan; Robin M. Taylor;
Michael J. Rosenblum and Christina Slattery

Noes: 1 -

Erica Fox Gehrig

2. [15334](#)

2011 Chadbourne Avenue - University Heights Historic District
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration to the side yard facade.

Contact: Douglas Ranney, Custom Carpentry, Madison

Mr. Ranney, Custom carpentry, gave a brief description of the project.

A motion was made by Gehrig, seconded by Maniaci, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration as submitted. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

3. [15335](#)

YWCA Madison, 101 East Mifflin Street - Designated Local Landmark
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for rehabilitation of existing landmark building.

Contact: Peter Rott, Isthmus Architecture

Peter Rott, 613 Williamson St, gave a brief presentation on the scope of the project.

Ms Maniaci asked if the project would include the refurbishment all of the floors, or just select floors. Mr. Rott replied that the entire building is being refurbished.

Ms Taylor asked if the restoration of the canopy would come before the Commission again. Mr. Rott replied that the this submission was meant to cover the canopy restoration, and that the only thing that they may need to come back for would be if there are any significant changes necessitated by HVAC/mechanical issues that have not yet been resolved.

Ms Maniaci asked if the glass block windows would be staying the same. Mr. Rott replied that the glass block might have to remain, as it provides a fire separation necessary for the stairwell. If they are able to find a better solution than the glass block that meets the building code, they will consider it.

A motion was made by Rosenblum, seconded by Slattery, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

4. [14895](#)

2122 Van Hise Avenue - University Heights Historic District
Consideration of Issuance of Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacements on a street-facing facade.

Contact: Matthew Speer, Associated Housewrights

Richard Porst, 3972 Plymouth Circle gave a brief presentation about the project, and why they are returning to the Commission with a new proposal for the leaded glass windows. He thanked the Commission for agreeing to look at a new version of the simulated leaded glass that was created by the Light Haus in Madison. Mr. Stephans noted that he looked this solution much better than the previous one presented.

Ledell Zellers, 510 N Carroll Street, registered and wished to speak. Ms Zellers said that she is worried about the loss of the historic fabric when leaded glass windows are removed and wondered why the homeowners couldn't replace the windows with true divided lights like the homeowner that was earlier on the agenda.

Ms Gehrig noted that the two cases are different as the previous owners had double hung windows, and this applicant is referring to casement windows that have several design and condition issues.

Mr. Stephans also noted that this was a proposal for a thermal protection window, and that it will be removing the original historic fabric.

A motion was made by Slattery, seconded by Maniaci, to Approve the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project as submitted. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

ORDINANCES REFERRED FROM COMMON COUNCIL

5. [15225](#) Creating Section 10.31(3)(g) of the Madison General Ordinances to add an exemption from the annual fee for some architectural features on Madison Landmark Buildings.
- Mr. Levitan asked that staff send Commissioners the list that real estate staff put together about which properties will be impacted by this ordinance change. He also noted that he is concerned about the word "existing" in front of "architectural features". He wants to make sure that if a landmark building that is restored to an original condition with a feature that had been previously removed, or altered, such as the Capitol Theater marquee, would not be required to pay encroachment fees on the restored architectural feature.
- A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Rosenblum, to Return to Lead with the Following Recommendation(s) to the BOARD OF PUBLIC WORKS that the ordinance language be approved, with the note that "existing architectural features" should include both current architectural features, as well as original architectural features that may have been removed/altered that could be a part of a future restoration project. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**
6. [15184](#) Amending Sections 33.19(2) and 33.19(16) of the Madison General Ordinances to increase penalties for violations of the Landmarks Ordinance and to add a definition of 'person.'
- A motion was made by Maniaci, seconded by Rosenblum, to RECOMMEND TO COUNCIL TO ADOPT - REPORT OF OFFICER. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

OTHER BUSINESS

7. [08717](#) Buildings proposed for demolition
8. [07804](#) Secretary's Report
- Staff noted that Rebecca Cnare will be continuing to cover the duties of the preservation planner until the position is funded. Ms. Maniaci noted that the Mayor had issued a request for a 6% cut to the 2010 operating budget, and would like staff to forward the e-mail to the Landmarks Commissioners. Ms. Maniaci also would like staff to forward the letter from Capitol Neighborhoods Inc to the Mayor that requested the authorization to fill the preservation planner position.
- Mr. Stephans asked the Commission to discuss the potential demolition of the Wisconsin Memorial Hospital, and to consider writing a letter to Governor Doyle supporting the restoration of the building.
- A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Gehrig, to authorize the Landmarks Commission Chair, Mr. Daniel Stephans, to send a letter to Governor Doyle on behalf of the City of Madison Landmarks Commission in support of the restoration of the**

Wisconsin Memorial Hospital. The motion was approved by a voice vote/other.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Levitan, seconded by Taylor, to Adjourn at 6:15 p.m.
The motion passed by voice vote/other.