



Meeting Minutes - Approved LANDMARKS COMMISSION

*Consider: Who benefits? Who is burdened?
Who does not have a voice at the table?
How can policymakers mitigate unintended consequences?*

Monday, March 6, 2023

5:00 PM

Virtual Meeting

CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

McLean arrived at 5:03 pm

Present: 6 - William Tishler; David W.J. McLean; Molly S. Harris; Maurice D. Taylor;
Edna Ely-Ledesma and Katherine N. Kaliszewski

Excused: 1 - Richard B. Arnesen

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A motion was made by Harris, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to Approve the February 6, 2023 Minutes. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. [60576](#) Landmarks Commission Public Comment Period
None

DISCLOSURES AND RECUSALS

None

PUBLIC HEARING - REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

2. [70738](#) 654 Williamson St - Demolition of an existing commercial structure and construction of a new mixed-use structure in the Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist.; 6th Ald. Dist.
Matthew Tills, registering in support and wishing to speak
Kevin Burow, registering in support and wishing to speak
Brandon Cook, registering in support and available to answer questions
Jacob Morrison, registering in support and not wishing to speak
A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Ely-Ledesma, to Approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that final lighting and building designs showing mechanicals be provided to staff for administrative approval and final window, door, and masonry specifications be provided to staff for administrative approval. The motion passed by voice vote/other.
3. [76203](#) 1130 Jenifer St - Construction of a two-story rear addition in the Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist.; 6th Ald. Dist.

E. Edward Linville, registering in support and wishing to speak
Brien Lilja, registering in support and available to answer questions

A motion was made by Ely-Ledesma, seconded by Harris, to Approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that final siding, window, door, porch, and roofing materials specifications be approved administratively by staff. Siding will need to replicate the appearance of the historic wood siding, not the current nonhistoric vinyl siding. Windows shall have either simulated or true divided lights, and all components will replicate the appearance of wood windows, with no wrapping of the window opening. Any exterior lighting or mechanicals proposed as part of this project scope will need a Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

REQUEST FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

4. [76445](#) 946 Spaight St - Exterior Alteration to a Designated Madison Landmark in the Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist. - Replacement of patio wall; 6th Ald. Dist.

Henry Doane, registering in support and wishing to speak

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Harris, to Refer the item to a future Landmarks Commission meeting with a request that the property owner submit updated plans that meet the standards. The motion passed by voice vote/other. Taylor voted in opposition.

5. [76446](#) 1121 Rutledge St - Addition and Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Hist. Dist. - Lower height of existing rear addition to create rooftop deck, replace one window, and create new window and door openings; 6th Ald. Dist.

James McFadden, registering in support and wishing to speak
Jessica Wartenweiler, registering in support and available to answer questions
Eric Welch, registering in support and available to answer questions
Jennifer Grether, registering in support and available to answer questions
Joan Grosse, registering in support and not wishing to speak
Julia Steege-Reimann, registering in support and not wishing to speak

This item was approved as a consent item with the finding that all applicable standards are adequately addressed and with all the staff recommendations contained in the report.

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Harris, to Approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness with the conditions that final window, door, siding, and roofing specifications be approved by staff. Any lighting or exterior mechanicals proposed as part of this remodel will also need a Certificate of Appropriateness. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

ADVISORY RECOMMENDATION

6. [76447](#) 1617 Sherman Ave - Development Adjacent to a Designated Madison Landmark (Yahara River Parkway); 12th Ald. Dist.

Thomas Reys, registering in opposition and wishing to speak
Darrin Jolas, registering in support and wishing to speak
Daniel Wiltrout, registering in opposition and wishing to speak
Larry Nesper, registering neither in support nor in opposition and wishing to speak
Alex Saloutos, registering neither in support nor in opposition and wishing to speak
Robert Johnson, registering in opposition and wishing to speak
Matthew Havey, registering in support and available to answer questions

Doug Hursh, registering in support and available to answer questions
Melissa Huggins, registering in support and available to answer questions
Kirk Biodrowski, registering in support and available to answer questions
Andrew Peabody, registering in support and not wishing to speak
Ed Jordan, registering in opposition and not wishing to speak

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Harris, to recommend to the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the proposed new structure is so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character or integrity of the adjacent landmarks. With the findings that the structure is not compatible with being adjacent to a historic park, due to its massing, placement, and fenestration that is more appropriate for a suburban setting. Sherman is a key route into downtown, and this building looks heavy and out of character with its park-adjacent setting. The motion failed by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - William Tishler; David W.J. McLean and Molly S. Harris

Noes: 3 - Maurice D. Taylor; Edna Ely-Ledesma and Katherine N. Kaliszewski

Excused: 1 - Richard B. Arnesen

A motion was made by Ely-Ledesma, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the proposed new structure is not so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character or integrity of the adjacent landmarks. With the findings that the buffer along the property line screens the architectural character of the building from the landmark. The courtyard style of the building along Sherman respects the urban edge of its context, and the timeline for the wooded buffer transitions in a way that has integrity. The motion failed by the following vote:

Ayes: 3 - Maurice D. Taylor; Edna Ely-Ledesma and Katherine N. Kaliszewski

Noes: 3 - William Tishler; David W.J. McLean and Molly S. Harris

Excused: 1 - Richard B. Arnesen

NEW BUSINESS

7. [62133](#) Amendment to Landmarks Commission Policy Manual

Bailey described proposed changes to the policy manual.

No action was taken.

REGULAR BUSINESS

8. [75030](#) Secretary's Report - 2023

Bailey provided an update on the Filene House landmark nomination.

9. [75031](#) Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2023

A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Harris, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 654 Williamson Street, 302 S Paterson Street,

and 826 Williamson Street have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Ely-Ledesma, seconded by McLean, to Adjourn at 7:51 pm. The motion passed by voice vote/other.