

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 10/18/21

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2021

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 10/19/21

ID NUMBER: 63346

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, and Maurice Taylor. Members excused were: Richard Arnesen and David McLean.

SUMMARY:

Kurt Stege, registering in opposition and wishing to speak

Brian Munson, registering in support and available to answer questions

Mitch Korte, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey said that staff recommends a finding of no known historic value for the building at 825 W Badger Road, as there is no preservation file or Wisconsin Historical Society site file for the property. She explained that this is only a technical demolition.

Bailey said that the buildings at 504 W Johnson Street, 520 W Johnson Street, 522 W Johnson Street, 524 W Johnson Street, 308 N Bassett Street, 312 N Bassett Street, 505 Conklin Place, and 525 Conklin Place are being demolished as part of a new multi-unit development on the site. She said that there are no preservation files or Wisconsin Historical Society site files for any of the properties. She showed images of the buildings, noting that many have undergone significant changes over time. She said that this site has development all around it, and this is a small outcropping of student housing that remains.

Taylor pointed out that many of these buildings were built in the early 20th c. and later 19th c. and asked why there were no preservation files. Bailey explained that the City has not done a complete inventory on all properties in the city, and the preservation files were created from previous surveys that were done on properties of interest. She said that the recently adopted Historic Preservation Plan included a survey schedule for gathering more information on properties throughout the city because what we have is lacking.

Andrzejewski added that surveys were often done on big, important buildings, so the more ordinary vernacular buildings were left out of early surveys. She said that surveying is also an expensive, time-consuming process. Kaliszewski said that in order to be included in the WHS database, the building has to have a level of integrity, so if buildings are as altered as those in question, they wouldn't have been picked up because they have no integrity.

Taylor asked for Kaliszewski's input on the historic value of these buildings that were built in the late 1800s and early 1900s but have obviously been altered. Kaliszewski said that she would normally advocate for demolition criterion b, but these buildings have been significantly altered and don't retain integrity. Andrzejewski said that they no longer read as historic buildings because they have been so altered. She said that one can see some form in a couple of the buildings on W Johnson Street, but there are better examples of that type of structure in the vicinity. She said that it is sad, and she regrets the loss of any historic fabric in the city because eventually

there will be none left; while there is probably historic information here, it is hard to say without any resources. She said that this is also a loss of affordable housing.

Bailey said that the building at 401 N Segoe Road is contributing to the University Hill Farms National Register historic district.

Kurt Stege reiterated that this is a contributing building in a National Register historic district, and the Landmarks Commission has previously gone on record as saying those buildings are not to be messed with. He said that at one point, this building was modern, and he didn't appreciate it adequately before, but it should be given very serious consideration. He said that he didn't know who founded the Hilldale State Bank or if any historically significant transactions occurred at the bank, but there was likely a great deal of information on the property that is not readily accessible. He said that he didn't see any submittal from the applicant indicating they have done a review of the historic aspects of the building, and he was not convinced this building should be torn down.

Brian Munson, Vandewalle & Associates, said that the building has housed many different businesses over the years, and it is a suburban configuration in an area that is fast redeveloping. He said that while the building is contributing to the National Register historic district, the district's significance is more informed by the residential components of the neighborhood, primarily single-family homes. He said that there were few components of the historic district that included commercial buildings, and this was one. He said that the façades along Vernon and Price are fairly plain as one moves around the building. In terms of adaptive reuse, he said that this is not a functional floor plate for modern uses. He said they are looking at the opportunity to create infill and extend the character of the shopping center and neighborhood. He said that this is a very land-consumptive building that is functionally obsolete. While the building is contributing, they reached the conclusion that it could not be reused or adapted for modern use.

Bailey said that staff recommends a finding of no known historic value for the building at 1902 Bartillon Drive, as there is no preservation file or Wisconsin Historical Society site file for the property. She added that the building has had a fire and there is a hole in the roof, which is caving in. According to City Building Inspection, the building is structurally unsound and should be demolished.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 825 W Badger Road has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 504 W Johnson Street, 520 W Johnson Street, 522 W Johnson Street, 524 W Johnson Street, 308 N Bassett Street, 312 N Bassett Street, 505 Conklin Place, and 525 Conklin Place have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Taylor, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 401 N Segoe Road has historic value based on architectural significance as a contributing structure in The University Hill Farms National Register Historic District. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 1902 Bartillon Drive has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.