



Project Name & Address: 1141 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

Legistar File ID # [67389](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: September 28, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Chris Lentini and Melissa Ruhl

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition to the principal structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
- (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition to the principal structure. The existing structure was constructed in 1884 and it is a simple vernacular cottage. The single-story, gable-front structure currently has shed-roofed dormers in the center of the porch. The proposal would add a two story addition, stepped 24-feet back from the front façade and located behind the dormers.

The proposal would introduce wood trim to delineate where the addition starts and where the original structure remains. The addition will feature a gable front roof, wood double-hung windows that follow the placement pattern on the existing structure and are of a similar dimension to the historic windows. The rear of the addition will replicate the gabled stoop that currently exists and include construction of a rear deck, which will include wood railings and composite decking.

While the rear addition is taller than the existing structure, it is significantly stepped back from the front façade, which maintains the street presence of the historic structure. The addition is of a height and proportion similar to most historic resources within 200 feet.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. The height of the addition is visually compatible with the height of historic resources within 200 feet, including the adjacent structures.
 - 2. N/A.
 - 3. The addition is located on the rear of the structure and maintains a substantial backyard area, which is in keeping with the rhythm of mass and spaces for historic properties in the vicinity.
 - (b) The addition is significantly stepped back from the street façade ,allowing it to not be altered. No changes to proportion and rhythm of solids to voids on the street façade.
 - (c) No alterations to the street façade.

- (d) The appearance of the roof on the historic structure will be maintained by introducing the addition behind the existing roof dormers. The roof of the addition will also be a gable front roof.
- (e) No changes to the street façade.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project as proposed.