



Information Technology

Sarah Edgerton, Information Technology Director

City-County Building, Room 500

210 Martin Luther King, Jr. Blvd.

Madison, WI 53703

Phone: (608) 266-4506 | Fax: (608) 261-9289

it@cityofmadison.com

cityofmadison.com/information-technology

June 4, 2021

TO: Common Council President Abbas and Vice-President Martin

FROM: Sarah Edgerton, Information Technology Director

DATE: June 3, 2021

RE: Boards, Commissions and Committees: In-Person, Hybrid and Virtual

Introduction

As all public health orders in Dane County have expired, including mask requirements and gathering limits, the City is moving towards returning to in-person services which includes Boards, Commission and Committees (BCC). The attached report seeks to provide options for the future of BCC's and managing all of the City resources that are involved in hosting and supporting the BCC infrastructure.

Background

The City of Madison has hosted 926 virtual Board, Commission, Committee meetings since March 30, 2020. This equates to over 2200 hours of virtual BCC meetings, averaging three meetings a day. Of those 926 meetings, the IT Media Team has supported 223 of these meetings for 930 hours of coverage.

The IT Media Team, which consists of a Team Leader and 5 Producer/Directors have worked more than 10,000 hours on supporting the BCC virtual infrastructure and meetings. This includes continuous research, software testing, manual development, training, Zoom migration, and running the meetings. On average, each staff person works 25 hours per week on one element of their job description while still trying to balance the priorities of the IT Media Team, including producing podcasts, covering press conferences and public meetings, running Madison City Channel and supporting the City's audio-visual needs.

Considerations and Recommendations

The attached considerations and recommendations report was drafted at the Mayor's direction to analyze the options for the City of Madison to provide hybrid Board, Commission and Committee meetings. In this report, we provide considerations and recommendations when contemplating hybrid meetings. Considerations are broken down into three categories:

1. Legal Considerations
2. Meeting Process Considerations
3. Technical Considerations

Under each category, an analysis was completed from the perspective of in-person, virtual and hybrid meetings. The final section of the document are the "early hybrid recommendations" outlining the best earliest solution of hybrid meetings within the next several months provided IT has additional IT staff to support the "early hybrid model."

In order for the City to move to a full-hybrid model, IT Capital Budget requests presented for the 2022 Capital Budget cycle would need to be funded. IT does not have staffing nor the funding to support a full-hybrid model in 2021 and beyond.



CITY OF MADISON INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY

Hybrid Meeting Considerations & Early Recommendations

Background

The purpose of this document is to provide considerations and recommendations when contemplating hybrid meetings. We are going to assume the intended audience of this document has knowledge and experience with pre-pandemic in-person Board, Commission and Committee's (BCC), and similarly with virtual BCC's, along with an understanding of basic parliamentary procedures. Although there may be some intersection with public information meetings and neighborhood meetings, this document will focus on BCC's.

Definitions

The following definitions apply to this document:

- **In-person meeting:** All members of the body, all staff, and all members of the public that participate do so in person. Unless these meetings are being facilitated by IT Media Team and live broadcast, they cannot be recorded for public replay.
- **Virtual meeting:** All members of the body, all staff, and all members of the public that participate do so virtually.
- **Hybrid meeting:** Any meeting that is not 100% in person and not 100% virtual. For example, if members of the body are physically present but some or all members of the public are allowed to participate virtually, it is a hybrid meeting.

Pre-pandemic there was an exception to in-person which allowed a member of the body to participate via telephone with a speakerphone in the meeting room, provided advance notice was included in the agenda. For purposes of this document, we are still considering this to be an in-person meeting.

Current State of Virtual Meetings

- Type 1 meetings require a committee staff person to handle administrative duties like roll call and taking the minutes. The technical facilitation is managed by two IT staff, one person who operates the control room for managing the views, streaming, presenting the "lower third" of the screen (City logo, item number, item text), and another to manage the Zoom meeting, finding participants, assisting with muting and unmuting, etc. Staffing and streaming constraints place a limit on the number of Type 1 meetings, and the timing of them, that can be held in a week.
- Type 2 meetings carry a recommendation of two City committee staff, but do not have any IT staff assistance. One staff person handles the administrative duties, and the second committee staff person serves as the Zoom meeting technical facilitator, managing the recording, locating participants, muting and unmuting, etc.

Legal Considerations

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
Open to the public for viewing/listening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Open for anyone with a phone or an internet-capable device 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Option for in-person attendance in a public space, or access to phone or internet-capable device 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Hosted in a public space so anyone can attend
Determining quorum	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roll call initially, video is used to ensure quorum is maintained 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> May need to notate on agenda who will be in the room and who will not (similar to how members that called in during in-person had this on the agenda and known ahead of time) Roll call initially, video on for members attending virtually and physical presence for in the room to ensure quorum is maintained 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roll call initially, physical presence to ensure quorum is maintained Agenda noticed any member of the body attending by phone
Public speaking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only available online via video conferencing or phone-in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Available at the public space or online via video conferencing or phone-in 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only available at the public space
Public health orders	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Allows for complete compliance with any public health orders mandating social distancing, capacity limits, mask wearing, sanitization protocols, etc. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Protocols will need to be developed to deal with capacity limits (if needed) Need to have a supply of masks for people that don't have them Install Plexiglas barriers (seen in other municipalities) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Protocols will need to be developed to deal with capacity limits (if needed) Need to have a supply of masks for people that don't have them Install Plexiglas barriers (seen in other municipalities)

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Allows for more versatility when choosing who is in person • May require overflow room(s) to abide by capacity limits • Requires staff resources to sanitize in-person spaces 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Would require overflow room(s) to abide by capacity limits • Requires staff resources to sanitize in-person spaces

Meeting Process Considerations

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
<p>Robert’s Rules of Order</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Methods for following Robert’s Rules of Order are already established ▪ Robert’s Rules of Order 12th edition outlines ideas for how to conduct virtual meetings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Need to identify nuances and establish methods for maintaining Robert’s Rules of Order in a hybrid environment ▪ Potential issue managing two different “queues” for people wishing to raise a point of order or wishing to speak ▪ How to notice and maintain quorum will need to be determined ▪ Potential side conversations between those attending in-person and the inability of those attending virtually to see that 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Methods for following Robert’s Rules of Order are already established

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
Meeting Classification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Type 1 (hosted by IT Media Team) ▪ Type 2 (hosted by BCC City staff) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Recommend carrying over virtual meeting classifications 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ No official classification ▪ There were standing meetings covered by IT for playback and streaming on Madison City Channel.
Public registration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Available online as soon as agenda is available and during meeting 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Suggest online registration with computer available in meeting room/space • Determine order of speaking (i.e., is there preference on people attending in-person, is it based chronologically, etc.) • If preference will be given to those attending in-person, then a method to “check in” registrants needs to be developed, and staff trained on how to use it. • Be aware someone could show up in-person and decide to leave and rejoin the meeting virtually, and vice versa. • Requires development of a “hybrid” approach that orders in-person and virtual attendees correctly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Pre-pandemic paper registration forms were only available when the room was open and during the meeting. If the desire is to keep the current electronic registration process, programming changes will need to be made to accommodate in-person registration. A laptop will be required at each meeting for public to use to register. City staff will need to monitor the laptop.
Committee Staffing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Type 1: Have a person taking minutes ▪ Type 2: Recommended two staff persons that 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Technical facilitators will need to be in-person to deal with the in-room technology 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Pre-pandemic: No major technical responsibilities

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
	<p>facilitate the technical aspects of the meeting including tracking registration, hosting the meeting, and take minutes</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Committee staff will need to be in-person to deal with registration ▪ Will require at least two committee staff members facilitating, for some meetings there may be more than two needed. 	
Voting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Voice vote unavailable ▪ Chair requests approval by unanimous consent ▪ Members can request a roll call 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Voice vote unavailable ▪ Chair requests approval by unanimous consent ▪ Members can request a roll call 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Voice voting ▪ Roll call if requested
Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Available to anyone with a reliable internet connection and device capable of running zoom, or anyone who has a phone ▪ No need to be in Downtown to attend a meeting ▪ Less likely to require child care considerations ▪ No unintended costs for parking ▪ Easier to obtain interpreters given no travel requirements which also eliminates travel costs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Capacity limits may restrict how many people can attend in-person ▪ For interpretive services, DCR would need to know if the requestor is attending in-person or virtually, whether they need to leave early, etc. ▪ Requires PPE during the pandemic <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Masks muffle sound ▪ Masks can eliminate the ability to lip read 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires commuting and/or parking Downtown to attend meetings ▪ Likely requires child care considerations and costs to attend ▪ Most meetings are Downtown ▪ Requires PPE during the pandemic <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Masks can muffle sound ▪ Masks can eliminate the ability to lip read
Meeting Room Etiquette	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Don't talk over others. ▪ Only connect via one device 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Anyone attending in-person must have any and all devices, including laptops and smartphones, muted and have their 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Follow normal procedures and etiquette pre-pandemic

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
		microphones turned off to avoid audio feedback <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ In-person attendees should NOT join the meeting via Zoom ▪ Competing video is a concern if an in-person member joins and speaks via Zoom 	

Technical Considerations

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
Recording	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Type 1 and Type 2 can record (pre-approved) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Only what the Media Team covers is recorded (i.e., Type 1 hybrid meetings) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Only what the Media Team covers is recorded
Technical limitations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires Zoom licenses and capable devices to facilitate ▪ Requires adequate internet connection ▪ Back-and-forth debates are not as viable in Zoom since the software picks up the loudest voice in the meeting 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires hardware and software to run hybrid meetings ▪ Requires adequate internet connection ▪ Type 2 meetings would need extra equipment to facilitate a hybrid meeting without IT-intervention ▪ Requires an extra computer to allow in-person attendees to register for items ▪ Zoom won't highlight who's speaking if they are in-person 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ So long as the AV systems are functioning, the rooms are relatively absent of technical limitations ▪ Requires an extra computer to allow in-person attendees to register for items

Consideration	Virtual	Hybrid	In-Person
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Raise Hand will be challenging to manage 	
Technical staffing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Type 1: Managed by Media Team (requires 3 permanent staff per meeting) ▪ Type 2: IT provides support before or after the meeting when requested, facilitation is the responsibility of City staff 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires 3 permanent Media Team staff and 2 to 3 hourly staff (at least 1 permanent will need to be in-person) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires 1 permanent Media Team staff and 2 to 3 hourly staff per meeting
Suitable rooms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ All Zoom licenses for Type 1 and Type 2 are paid for through 2021 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires rooms set up specifically for hybrid meetings ▪ Rooms that allow for adequate social distancing in cases where a large amount of attendees participate or watch in-person 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires space large enough to hold a public meeting ▪ Rooms that allow for adequate social distancing
Member speaker queue	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Utilizes the “Raise Hand” feature in Zoom as a speaker queue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Requires development of a method to determine the order of members wishing to speak since in-person members should not be using Zoom. This includes meetings in CCB 201 since there is not currently an integration between Zoom “Raise Hand” and the in-room queue system¹ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CCB 201 has a Crestron system to manage the speaker queue; no other rooms are set up with this system

¹ The Zoom Raise Hand feature is used for virtual meetings to handle who is next up to speak. With a hybrid approach, there would need to be an in-person queue and a virtual queue. There would then need to be a process of combining both queues so that people are recognized in a reasonable manner.

Early Hybrid Recommendations

The following outlines the best earliest solution if the goal is to do some form of “hybrid” meetings:

- All Type 1’s can be hybrid, but all Type 2’s will remain either all virtual or all in-person for the time being.
 - That means only Type 1’s and Type 2’s that remain virtual will be able to record their meetings.
 - Note that resuming in-person meetings is contingent on a policy direction from the Mayor and Common Council Leadership.
 - **We will need one additional IT Media Team member to support the hybrid model. We are unable to support any hybrid model without additional staffing.**
- For Type 1 hybrid meetings:
 - All members of the body should be in attendance in-person.
 - City staff should still appear virtually
 - Public registrants should still appear virtually
 - Council Chambers (CCB 201) construction won’t be started until at least June (this is a Dane County project).
 - Those that request interpretive services should attend virtually to better accommodate getting an interpreter in time and provide an ability for the requestor to visibly see and/or hear the interpreter.
- For Type 2 meetings:
 - If policy allows, Type 2’s could begin meeting entirely in-person.
 - This means members of the body, staff, and public registrants are all in-person. No one is remote.
 - Type 2 in-person meetings will not be recorded.
 - Interpretive services will need to be in-person.
 - Type 2 meetings can remain 100% virtual as they do today.
 - Type 2 meetings are not eligible to meet in a hybrid mode at this time due to lack of hybrid-capable rooms, and limited staff and financial resources.