

# EVALUATION PANEL REPORT

**Project:** Monona Terrace Tunnel Lighting Design  
**Location:** Monona Terrace Tunnel over John Nolen Dr (USH 151)  
**Aldermanic District:** 04  
**RFP:** 8974-0-2020-BG  
**Date:** 03/23/21

This Evaluation has been reviewed and approved by a Principal Architect 2, Principal Engineer 2, Deputy City Engineer, Deputy Division Manager, or the City Engineer.  Yes  No

## A. Project Details

---

### 1. Background Information

This project was approved as part of the 2020 Capital Budget and will consist of preparing plan documents for reconstruction of existing tunnel lighting facilities at the Monona Terrace over John Nolen Dr. (USH 151) and the Wisconsin Southern Railroad (WSOR). The ultimate goal of the project is to replace the lighting facilities that have revealed significant corrosion and damage due to age and water infiltration. A design study will precede plan preparation and will be used to evaluate lighting system products and configuration within the tunnel. Design is scheduled for late 2021, with an intended construction start in 2022.

<b>Project</b>	<b>Monona Terrace/John Nolen Drive Lighting Study</b>				<b>Project #</b>	<b>12730</b>
<b>Citywide Element</b>	<b>Healthy and Safe</b>				<b>Project Type</b>	<b>Project</b>
<i>Project Description</i>						
This project is to conduct a feasibility study analyzing the costs and design to improve lighting under Monona Terrace on John Nolen Drive. The design will be focused on lighting upgrades but will also highlight other issues associated with a potential project including partnership with the State of Wisconsin, who owns the Monona Terrace parking structure, and anticipated stormwater mitigation efforts that may need to be considered. The goal of the project is to improve safety along the existing roadway. Funding for this project was added by Finance Committee amendment #14.						
<i>Project Budget by Funding Source</i>						
	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025
GF GO Borrowing	75,000	-	-	-	-	-
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>\$ 75,000</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>	<b>\$ -</b>

### 2. Role of Architecture and Engineering Services (A/E)

This contract's scope includes the previously mentioned design study that will evaluate LED lighting products/mounting methods/controls, development of plans and specifications to include project construction estimate, identifying permits required for construction, work zone traffic control analysis, and assistance with preparation of information for public meetings.

"If Authorized" scope of work includes a code review to include a Computation Fluid Dynamic (CFD) model for purposes of determining whether four (4) existing tunnel ventilation fans continue to be required, or if they may be decommissioned.

## B. Purchasing Details

---

### 3. Purchasing guidelines for RFP evaluation

The City of Madison solicited proposals from qualified vendors through a Request for Proposals (RFP) process. The RFP, addenda, tabulations, awards and related announcements were posted on two distribution networks – VendorNet and DemandStar – on Monday November 02, 2020. RFP respondents submitted questions about the RFP and Addendum 1 was issued on Friday November 27, 2020. RFP respondents submitted other questions about the RFP and Addendum 2 was issued on Monday December 07, 2020. RFP responses were due to Purchasing on Friday December 18, 2020.

#### 4. RFP Respondents

Firm A Matrix Consulting Engineers, Inc.

Firm B KL Engineering, Inc.

Section B7. Evaluation Structure and Scoring (below) describes the process used to select a team.

#### 5. Disqualifications

No firms were disqualified.

#### 6. Evaluation Panel

The evaluation panel was comprised of five (5) City Staff from three (3) Divisions: Engineering, Traffic Engineering and Traffic Engineering & Parking Field Operations.

#### 7. Evaluation Structure and scoring

Evaluation for this RFP was conducted in one round. Upon completion of a collective review, a single Respondent was selected as the Panel's recommendation. Evaluations were documented through a quantifiable scoring mechanism (see Section C of this document). The evaluation was conducted in a structured manner and administered by City Purchasing. See below for additional phasing details.

Per instruction within the Request for Proposal, Respondents were asked to provide proposals, which were evaluated by the Panel. Qualification factors evaluated include: Company Capability (10%), Project Team (20%), Similar Projects by Project Engineer (20%), Design Approach (15%), Cost (30%), and Local Preference (5%).

Section C2 (below) shows the Round 1 scoring.

#### 8. Evaluation Timeline

Nov 02 – RFP is issued.  
Nov 20 – Questions are due.  
Nov 27 – Addendum 1 posted.  
Dec 06 – Follow-up questions to Addendum 1 allowed.  
Dec 07 – Addendum 2 posted.  
Dec 18 – Response submissions are due.  
Dec 22 – Distribute submissions to evaluation panel.  
Jan 08 – Proposal scoring is due to City Purchasing.  
Jan 11 – Evaluation discussion meeting.  
Jan 15 – City Purchasing communicates Intent to Award to the selected team and requests "Best & Final Offer".  
Feb 26 – Cost negotiation completed with selected team. Ventilation Study "If Authorized"  
Mar 16 – Resolution to Common Council for introduction.

### C. Summary of Evaluation

---

#### 1. Recommendation

Firm B KL Engineering, Inc.

Based on the scoring of the evaluation, the selection team recommends that KL Engineering, Inc. be approved as the consultant for the professional services required for the Monona Terrace Tunnel Lighting Design project.

2. Proposal Scoring

8974-0-2020-BG	KL Engineering	Matrix Consulting Engineers
Company Capability (10%)	9	4
Project Team (20%)	18.8	7.6
Similar Projects by Project Engineer (20%)	18.4	6.8
Design Approach (15%)	13.2	5.7
<b>TECHNICAL SCORE (65 Points)</b>	<b>59.4</b>	<b>24.1</b>
Local Vendor (5%)	5	0
Cost Proposal (30%)	7.09	30
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>71.5</b>	<b>54.1</b>

Note: Cost Proposal score indicated for KL Engineering reflects costs prior to “Best & Final Offer” request.

3. Fee Breakdown

Cost Evaluation	Matrix Consulting Engineers	KL Engineering Original	KL Engineering Best & Final
Prelim Design	\$ 25,000.00	\$ 157,503.00	\$ 117,341.00
Final Design	\$ 45,000.00	\$ 98,043.00	\$ 98,043.00
Structural Design Mods (If Authorized)	TBD	\$ 27,965.00	Removed
Additional If Authorized	TBD	\$ 12,500.00	\$ 26,914.00
<b>Not-to-Exceed Cost</b>	<b>\$ 70,000.00</b>	<b>\$ 296,011.00</b>	<b>\$ 242,298.00</b>

4. Local Preference

The City of Madison has adopted a local preference purchasing policy granting a scoring preference to local suppliers. Only suppliers who meet the criteria and are registered as of the bid’s due date will receive preference.

[www.cityofmadison.com/business/localPurchasing](http://www.cityofmadison.com/business/localPurchasing)

Was the outcome of this bid changed by the local purchasing ordinance?  Yes  No

END