

EQUITABLE HIRING TOOL 2.0



Racial Equity
& Social Justice Initiative



Equitable Hiring Tool

When should this tool be used?

Early! Use this tool early in the hiring process so your team has plenty of time to make changes - to the position description, minimum qualifications, exam, recruitment tools, etc. Suggestions:

- **Annually** - to update positions.
- When a retirement or other separation is announced - **before** they leave, so you can get their input
- To review a vacant position **prior** to posting
- **Any time you plan to fill a position** and it hasn't been reviewed with the Equitable Hiring Tool, or if it's been **more than 1 year since** you've used this tool to review the specific position.

The job position does not need to be red-flagged in order for you to use this tool!

Process Steps:

- 1) **DECIDE** to review a position with the Equitable Hiring Tool, using the suggestions above.
It's never a bad idea to review a job position with this tool.
- 2) **RECRUIT** a diverse team to help you apply the tool. This could include: your agency's Civil Rights Coordinator, HR Analyst, the hiring manager for the position, and one or more people from **outside your agency** – an employee of another City agency, or, with appropriate permission, someone from another unit of government, the private sector, a member of a City board, committee or commission, or a community member/resident.

Make sure your team is diverse in these ways:

- Gender diversity
- Racial diversity
- Departmental diversity (one or more people from outside your agency)
- Organizational diversity (people with different work experience or authority)

For help and ideas, consult with a variety of people and groups such as DCR, the Multicultural Affairs Committee (MAC), Women's Initiatives Committee (WIC), Latinx Community Engagement Team (LCET), Neighborhood Resource Teams (NRT) and other community partners.

- 3) **SCHEDULE** meetings for the team to apply the tool and **PROVIDE THIS INFORMATION**:
 - A copy of the department's Equitable Workforce Plan (AA plan)
 - Industry-wide demographics
 - Department and unit demographics
 - NEOGOV data from a prior recruitment
 - Agency/unit strategic plan for hiring
 - A blank copy of the Equitable Hiring Tool

*(See page 2 of the tool for where to find this data.)

Team members should NOT look at the position description prior to completing Part B of the Hiring tool so they are not unduly influenced by what was in the PD in the past.

- 4) **SCHEDULE OTHER MEETINGS** if needed. You might use a separate team to develop questions and benchmarks or an exam. **Make sure those teams are diverse too.**
- 5) **IMPLEMENT** the improvements. For example, update job description, make sure job is posted all the places you decided to advertise, etc. **Work with your HR analyst and CRC for help.**
- 6) **FOLLOW UP.** Consider a follow up meeting with appropriate staff to discuss lessons learned. This could positively influence how others make changes to their positions & hiring process.



Racial Equity and Social Justice Initiative Equitable Hiring Tool

INTRODUCTION

Hiring Managers and the City of Madison understand that hiring typically involves many steps, with prep work that includes:

- Updated position descriptions
- Relationship building
- Understanding department and society dynamics
- Benchmarking

The Equitable Hire Tool is a checklist and guide to ensure each hiring decision for the City of Madison is as equitable as possible. This can be achieved through relationships between the hiring department, Human Resources, Civil Rights, and community members within the specific field that are built and sustained over time.

It is imperative this tool be used with a group of people from diverse backgrounds. This may include a combination of people of different genders, persons of color, differently abled people, people from within and external to the agency, and numerous other groupings. In addition, departments should continually be building relationships with community members from diverse backgrounds for ongoing recruitment efforts. Some examples are Neighborhood Resource Teams, Urban League, the job center, technical colleges, various outreach events (through non-profits and community organizations) and advertising in a variety of professional and community publications both online and in print.

The Hiring Manager/Department initiates and serves as the hiring authority for the position. The HR Analyst can provide expertise and information about the hiring process and prior recruitments. The department supervisor or manager in charge of the hire makes decisions related to the hire in consultation with others in the department, gathers an appropriate group to work on the hire, decides on a balanced interview panel and puts together interview questions and benchmarks. Assistance with these tasks is available from Human Resources, the Department of Civil Rights, and the department's Civil Rights Coordinator. The Equitable Hiring Tool asks questions to help ensure racial equity and social justice principles have been incorporated into the hiring process and potential barriers have been removed.

It is essential to understand why you have involved the people helping you to use this tool and how they further your equitable hiring goals. The notes and completed Equitable Hiring Tool from this process should be kept by the Department's Civil Rights Coordinator for reporting purposes.

A. INFORMATION ABOUT THIS EQUITABLE HIRING TOOL USAGE

Hiring Manager: Police Civilian Oversight Board _____ Date: __

HR Analyst: Julie Trimbell

Was your Civil Rights Coordinator involved? ☐ Yes ☒ No

Name: N/A

Job Title Being Reviewed: Independent Police Monitor

People involved in analyzing this position with the Equitable Hiring Tool:

NAME	JOB TITLE OR GROUP BEING REPRESENTED
Ankita Bharadwaj	Police Civilian Oversight Board
Ananda Deacon	Police Civilian Oversight Board
Anthony Cooper	Police Civilian Oversight Board
Yesenia Villalpando-Torres	Police Civilian Oversight Board
Tariq Saqqaf	Department of Civil Rights Equity Coordinator
Julie Trimbell	HR Analyst
Karen Kapusta-Pofahl	Common Council Legislative Analyst/PCOB staff

Department and HR Knowledge

This information can be found in your department's equitable workforce plan. If you need further assistance understanding this data, first contact your agency's [Civil Rights Coordinator](#), then your assigned HR Analyst and/or the Affirmative Action Specialist.

Information to Review before Using this Tool

- Review Department's [Equitable Workforce Plan](#)
- Review industry-wide demographics. Check with professional industry organizations or peer organizations
- Review [department demographics](#)
- Review [unit or division demographics](#)
- NEOGOV Data from prior recruitment (Obtain from HR Analyst)
- Strategic Planning for future hiring needs in the agency (Review strategic plan)

Record information you considered from above here:

N/A new position in new agency.

Building Relationships: Relationships are a key to recruitment and retention.

How have you or how do you plan to build relationships with Civil Rights, Human Resources, Leaders/ Members from diverse communities?

DCR and HR are part of the process

☐ ☐

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?
If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

Yes

No

B. POSITION DESCRIPTION UPDATING

You should work on updating the position description as soon as you get notice that the incumbent is leaving or on a regular basis to update. Before looking at the current position description, complete this portion of the tool so that you aren't overly influenced by what has been in the PD in the past.

Basic Skills

The basic skills needed for this position include:

- **Adaptability**
- **Creativity**
- **Diplomacy**
- **Ability to build rapport with community members**
- **Integrity and ability to ask the difficult questions and stand up to pressure**
- **Problem-solving ability**
- **Investigation/Research skills**
- **Organizational skills**

Transferrable Skills

Often when we want to fill a position, we look for someone who had that position or a very similar position with another employer. However, candidates could have gained the skills we are looking for from different positions and, in addition, bring new perspectives to our agencies. For example, if you are hiring a call center supervisor, someone who supervised employees providing front line customer service in a retail environment, but not in a call center, might also be a potential fit for the position.

What are some transferrable skills that would qualify a candidate for this job even if they haven't worked in this field or position before?

Transferrable skills include:

- **Community organizing/direct community outreach/rapport-building**
- **Organizational skills**
- **Managerial skills**
- **Research skills**
- **Navigating multiple institutional and community systems and networks**
- **Persuasive communication skills**
- **Report writing skills**
- **Basic computer skills (Microsoft Office)**

Minimum Qualifications

Based on the listed skills, are there any minimum qualifications?
If so, what are they?

☒ xYes ☐ No

Minimum qualifications are:

- **Ability to do relationship-building with residents and MPD, backed by track record of experience**
- **Community outreach**
- **Critical thinking skills**
- **Ability to think on one's feet**
- **Some kind of investigative training for a baseline**
- **Demonstrable research skills**

- **Not being afraid to ask difficult questions, being comfortable not agreeing with something everyone else is agreeing with**
- **Ability to generate reports**
- **Some level of leadership or supervision responsibility experience**

Could any of these be learned on the job?
Please list.

Yes

- **Issuing subpoenas**
- **Supervision, as long as they have leadership experience**
- **Certification for use of databases could be achieved on the job as and when required.**
- **If applicant has a basic facility with computers, specific skills related to relevant computer programs can likely be learned on the job.**
- **Facilitation Skills**

Educational Requirements

Based on the listed skills, are there any minimum education requirements?
If so, what are they?

☐ X Yes ☐ No

Associates degree and 6 years of experience; Bachelors or higher and 4 years; language about extensive experience-different paths to meet education qualification. There was not consensus on this item among Taskforce members.

Focus on experience in skills we are looking for rather than degree.

Who might be negatively impacted by these education requirements? What will you do to mitigate the impact?

- **Don't list preferred qualifications here if not required**
- **Add language about proven skills being able to offset some of the education requirements.**
- **Provide several paths to meet minimum education requirements to help mitigate the impact.**

Are there any potential unintended effects caused by these education requirements? What will you do to mitigate them?

Some people who have the experience we're looking for might be scared off if they don't have that education. Language about multiple paths will help.

An unintended effect of lowering the education requirement is that it could be unfair to open the door to applicants who may not be considered on the same level as applicants with advanced degrees and extensive job experience. Another effect could be that members of the public and other institutions may prejudge the individual as not having the "right credentials" or professional credibility.

Experience Requirements

Based on the listed skills, are there any minimum experience requirements?
If so, what are they?

☐ X Yes ☐ No

- **Experience in criminal justice reform, criminology, public administration, public policy, sociology, or a closely related field**
- **Experience in research and/or investigation**
- **Experience in community relationship-building**
- **Leadership and/or supervisory experience**

Who might be negatively impacted by these experience requirements and what you will do to mitigate the impact?

- **People younger than 30 may be negatively impacted due to the length of experience required.**
- **People who may have relevant experience, but not the required amount, may be negatively impacted.**
- **Negative impact is not possible to be mitigated beyond what has been provided.**

Are there any potential unintended effects caused by these experience requirements and what you will do to mitigate them?

- **Taskforce reduced number of years of education required, can mitigate some of the negative effect.**
- **Taking into account what skills can be transferrable from other experiences can mitigate some of the negative effect.**

Physical Requirements

List the physical requirements, including examples of the work performed that justify these requirements.

- **Ability to use a computer**

Can these requirements be accommodated? Does everyone working in the position need to meet these requirements?

- **Yes, they can be accommodated. Yes, everyone working in the position needs to meet this requirement.**

Who might be negatively impacted by these physical requirements and what you will do to mitigate the impact?

- **Accommodations will mitigate negative impact**

--

Are there any potential unintended effects caused by these physical requirements and what you will do to mitigate them?

- **Accommodations should be able to mitigate any unintended effects.**

Travel Requirements

Does this position require a person to travel? If so, does the person need to have a driver's license to do this or do they have the ability to arrange their travel through other means? Remember that requiring a driver's license has been shown to have an increased negative impact on people of color.

- **May require travel within city**
- **Does not require a drivers license**

Who might be negatively impacted by this requirement and what you will do to mitigate the impact?

- **People without means of transportation**
- **City provides free Metro bus passes to all employees, as well as pool vehicles (cars and bicycles) to use**

Are there any potential unintended effects caused by this requirement and what you will do to mitigate them?

Updating the Position Description

On what date was this position description last updated?

N/A new position

Has it ever been updated using this Equitable Hiring Tool?

If yes, on what date? _____

☐ Yes ☐ **No**

Update the existing position description using the information you have listed in Section B. Include language about working with multicultural communities. Find samples in [Appendix A.](#)

To consider when drafting knowledge, skills and abilities in the position description:

- The term "knowledge" indicates basic familiarity with a concept
- The term "working knowledge" indicates 2 years' experience in applying this concept on the job
- The term "thorough knowledge" indicates 4 years' experience in applying the concept on the job such that a person could teach it to others

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

E. RECRUITMENT AND ADVERTISING

Posting Internal/External

Should this position be posted internal to city employees only, or should it be open and competitive? What is the rationale behind this decision and does it minimize negative impacts and unintended consequences for marginalized and underrepresented groups?

If posting the job in this way leads to unintended outcomes for a group that is already [underrepresented](#) in your department, discuss why you want to post it this way and consider your decision.

Advertising the Position

How do you plan to target outreach to underrepresented groups with this job posting?

Where do you plan to post the advertisement of this position? (list all sites below)

Please consult with your HR Analyst or the Affirmative Action Specialist for sources to advertise to underrepresented demographics. Remember that authentic relationships are the best form of advertising.

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

C. TESTING

If you are not testing:

Check box and skip to Section D.

☐ NOT Using Testing

Exams

What competencies or skills does this position need to have to be successful? Include a copy of the exam for reference.

When was the exam last reviewed for relevancy? Date: _____

List examples of competencies you are testing with this exam.

Do the questions match with what is expected in the job and are they up to date with current practices in the industry?
If no, explain how/why below.

☐ Yes ☐ No

Appropriateness of Exam

Does this job require the applicant to sit at a desk or perform reading/writing as part of their duties? If not, an essay or computerized exam is not recommended. Talk to your HR Analyst for other options. Perhaps a multiple choice exam or comparative evaluation (click for definition) is more appropriate.

☐ Yes ☐ No

Number of Questions?

Are you able to reduce the number of questions and still get the information you need?

Language

If a candidate demonstrates their ability to speak English outside of the exam process (such as through the interview) and meet safety standards in English, can you offer the exam in another language? [Talk to the Language Access Coordinator for assistance, including which languages we will offer.](#)

Computerized Testing

Will the employee use Microsoft Office (Word, Excel, Powerpoint, Outlook) products or computers in general on the job on a regular basis?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If yes, list which software(s) should be tested prior to interview.

List other related software required to perform the duties of this position (Tyler/MUNIS, Accela, Legistar, etc).

Is it possible for candidates to learn some of these programs on the job instead of having it tested beforehand?

☐ Yes ☐ No

Or can experience be fleshed out at the time of interview?
Please explain.

☐ Yes ☐ No

Consequences and Impacts of Testing Requirements

Who might be negatively impacted by these testing requirements and what you will do to mitigate the impact?

Can tests be offered at multiple times including during the day and evening?

Comparative Evaluation and Random Selection

Comparative Evaluation is a tool where candidates who meet the minimum qualifications are then compared to each other to determine the “most qualified” candidates to move forward in the process. Normally, the hiring agency sets out criteria in advance to assist the HR analyst in identifying the criteria to evaluate and the associated weights.

If you plan to use comparative evaluation, explore how that might negatively impact some candidates and list what you would do to mitigate those impacts.

Random Selection may be used either in place of an exam or to determine who moves forward to the next step of the process. By definition, the use of random selection should preserve the diversity of the initial pool because all candidates have the same chance of moving forward.

If you expect a large applicant pool for the position, you might want to explore using Comparative Evaluation or Random Selection if you don't use testing or in order to narrow the pool of people invited to test.

Can you assess candidates at the time of interview with a short exercise or assessment? (Check with HR Analyst to determine appropriateness of assessment)

Who might be negatively impacted by these testing requirements or preferences and what you will do to mitigate them?

Are there any potential unintended effects caused by these testing requirements?
If so, what will you do to mitigate them?

☐ Yes ☐ No

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?
If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

☐ Yes ☐ No

D. SUPPLEMENTAL ESSAY QUESTIONS

If you are not using supplemental essay questions:
Check box and skip to Section E.

☐ NOT Using Supplemental Questions

Appropriateness of Supplemental Essay Questions

Does this job require the applicant to write well as a part of their job duties? If not, supplemental essay questions may not be recommended, (unless grammar and other writing skills will not be considered.)

Have you included a supplemental question about racial equity and social justice that is meaningful to the work of the position? Make sure to include this in supplemental questions and/or interview questions and give it equal weight to other considerations. See [Appendix B](#) for examples. If you need additional help, please consult your Civil Rights Coordinator or RESJI Team member.

Who might be negatively impacted by a supplemental essay question requirement and what you will do to mitigate the impact?

Are there any potential unintended effects cause by a supplemental essay question requirement and what you will do to mitigate them?

Have you worked with your HR Analyst to set up benchmarks for supplemental essay questions?
If you've answered No, make sure to do so.

☐ Yes ☐ No

Review of Supplemental Essay Questions

Diverse involvement throughout the hiring process is essential. Organizing a panel of diverse members to review supplemental essay questions will create a more equitable hiring process.

Who will be on the panel to review supplemental questions? Does it include a diverse panel? List ideas for panel members (a member may check more than one box). *Does your panel include: Gender diversity? Racial diversity? Departmental diversity (someone outside of your department)? Organizational diversity (people with different work experience)?*

- Resources to help get a balanced supplemental essay questions review team:
 - Your HR Analyst
 - DCR Affirmative Action Specialist
 - Multicultural Affairs Committee (MAC)
 - Women’s Initiatives Committee (WIC)
 - Latinx Community Engagement Team (LCET)
 - DCR Interview Panel Referrals [when available]
 - Neighborhood Resources Teams
 - Community Partners
 - Boards and other Committee Members

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?

☐ Yes ☐ No

If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

F. INTERVIEW QUESTIONS AND BENCHMARK DEVELOPMENT

Interview Questions

In developing your interview questions, consider what skills you are looking for that you didn’t find out about through the application and any testing you might have used. Make sure you are using behavioral interview questions.

See [Appendix C](#) for sample interview questions. Choose at least one of these or customize your current questions to assure that all new employees demonstrate their capacity and willingness toward working with multicultural communities and workplace teams. These questions should be benchmarked and scored at the same level of importance as the other questions being asked. What interview question(s) will you use to accomplish this?

Benchmarks

Diverse involvement throughout the hiring process is essential. Organizing a diverse team to set up benchmarks will create a more equitable hiring process.

Work with your HR Analyst and a diverse team to set up benchmarks for interview questions. List ideas for team members (a member may check more than one box.) *Does your team include: Gender diversity?*

Racial diversity? Departmental diversity (someone outside of your department)? Organizational diversity (people with different work experience)?

- Resources to help get a balanced team:
 - Your HR Analyst
 - DCR Affirmative Action Specialist
 - Multicultural Affairs Committee (MAC)
 - Women's Initiatives Committee (WIC)
 - Latinx Community Engagement Team (LCET)
 - DCR Interview Panel Referrals [when available]
 - Neighborhood Resources Teams
 - Community Partners
 - Boards and other Committee Members

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?
If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

☐ Yes ☐ No

G. CONDUCTING INTERVIEWS AND MAKING A SELECTION

Interview Panels

Diverse involvement throughout the hiring process is essential. Organizing a panel of diverse team to interview candidates will create a more equitable hiring process.

Assure that your interview panel, like the teams you have put together up to this point in reviewing the position description, exam, supplemental questions, interview questions and benchmarks, is diverse.

Does your panel include:

- Gender diversity?
- Racial diversity?
- Departmental diversity (someone outside of your department)?
- Organizational diversity (people with different work experience)?

Who is on your team?

Did you complete all the tasks in this section?
If not, why not and what is your plan to address these?

☐ Yes ☐ No

Appendix A – Position Description Language

Mandatory Language: The City of Madison is dedicated to eliminating racial inequities. Successful candidates will demonstrate the ability to successfully work with multicultural communities.

Other Examples:

- Ability to consider different viewpoints.
- Ability to develop and maintain working relationships with diverse coworkers, community members, customers, etc.

Appendix B – Sample Supplemental Questions

Sample A: The goal of reducing racial disparities that exist in our community is a high priority for the City of Madison. The City of Madison, including [department], will play vital roles in helping to reduce disparities and create equal outcomes for everyone.

In your experience, what concepts are important to consider when approaching work that will impact diverse populations and low income communities? What specific experiences have you had that might prepare you for such work?

Sample B: The [position name] will interact and collaborate with a diverse group of individuals and organizations. Such individuals and organizations may include youth, parents, low-income residents, school personnel, non-profit representatives, City staff and elected officials. Please describe one or more situations which required you to work collaboratively with a diverse group on a community project or issue. Include details of your role in planning, implementing and evaluating the initiative(s). (Maximum 2 Pages)

Sample C: The [position title] will interact with a diverse group of individuals to solve problems. These groups and individuals may include City staff, neighborhood residents, property owners, social service agencies, and other stakeholders. Please describe one or more situations in which you have led and worked with a diverse group to resolve a difficult problem. Describe the approach you used, the principles that guided you, and the ultimate outcome.

Appendix C – Sample Interview Questions

Sample A: Why do you value racial equity and social justice? What work have you done that demonstrates this? Provide an example of how your life and/or professional career has embodied racial equity and social justice.

Sample B: The City of Madison and [department name] is dedicated to the Racial Equity and Social Justice Initiative, in which we examine our day to day operations and impacts with the goal of creating a fair and just community so everyone can have equal outcomes. What educational, volunteer, and life experiences demonstrate your ability to contribute to the City of Madison's goal of achieving racial equity and social justice?

Sample C: Why should [department name] consider racial equity and social justice in its day to day operations? What are some strategies that [department name] could implement to help to reduce race and other disparities seen in our community?

Sample D: Our community is becoming more racially and ethnically diverse, which magnifies the importance of serving communities of color and other historically disenfranchised groups effectively. Provide an example of a successful project you led or contributed to in working with multicultural and diverse communities. Describe the challenges and opportunities that you worked through working on this team.

Were there other items not covered in this tool or things you learned or will change based on discussions you had during this process? Please share. Thanks!

--