

## AGENDA # 2

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

**PRESENTED:** 4/5/21

TITLE: 1330 Sherman Ave - Demolition of an existing beach shelter and construction of a new beach shelter on a Designated Madison Landmark site (Tenney Park); 2nd Ald. Dist.

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

DATED: 4/9/21

**ID NUMBER:** 64336

---

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, and Maurice Taylor. Excused were: Richard Arnesen, Betty Banks, and David McLean.

### **SUMMARY:**

*Melissa Destree, registering in support and wishing to speak*

*Laura Amundson, registering in support and available to answer questions*

Bailey described the proposed work to demolish the existing 1979 beach shelter, which is a non-contributing structure on the landmark site, and construct a new beach shelter. She said that Tenney Park is significant for its prairie-style landscape architecture with a period of significance of 1899-1910. She discussed the applicable standards, including 41.18(2) and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards, specifically 9 and 10. She said that the applicant responded to the Landmarks Commission's comments at their last meeting regarding the siting of the new shelter and has provided options for the siting and color of the materials. She said that staff recommends approval, and the commission should specify the siting of the proposed new structure and specify which color they prefer for the smooth siding.

Andrzejewski opened the public hearing.

Melissa Destree provided information on the project. She said that the color match of the 1909 ferry restroom building was Tarrytown Green and showed new renderings with this color. She discussed the various site options the design team worked through and explained that they settled on option 2 because it was more similar to the 1913 boathouse orientation, the pump room and showers were near the beach, and the covered seating allows people to be near the playground and lake. She said they presented this option to the neighborhood and they were comfortable with it. She discussed the proposed materials of Kasota stone, smooth fiber cement board, and a concrete aggregate. She showed renderings with each color option for the fiber cement board, Timber Bark and Tarrytown Green, noting that the design team recommended Timber Bark because it complements the beach and park setting.

Andrzejewski closed the public hearing.

Taylor requested clarification that siting option 2 provided greater visibility to the playground and the lake. Bailey said that option 2 addressed accessibility issues with less challenging grading, allowed the pump house to be closer to the beach, and the seating area had good visibility to the playground. Taylor asked if staff had a

recommendation on the siting options. Bailey said that she did not have strong feelings on the siting. She said that the proposed siting is loosely in line with the historic location of the previous beach house, and while the current structure's orientation doesn't relate to a rectangular form, the new structure will go back to a rectangular form. At the last meeting, Commissioner McLean was concerned about addressing the beach and parking lot, so the applicant has provided their thought process on different ways to make the structure fit within a feasible area. She said that the applicant's arguments are compelling regarding balancing the visibility to the beach, accessibility, and access to the beach and playground. She said that she has no issues supporting the initial proposal, option 2, as the preferred method of siting. Andrzejewski pointed out that the neighborhood did not object to option 2 when it was presented to them. Kaliszewski said she was leaning toward option 2 because the neighborhood approved of it and because of the similarity in siting of the 1913 building. She said that she preferred the Tarrytown Green color, though either color would be appropriate for meeting the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Andrzejewski said she was ambivalent on color. Martin agreed that either color would be fine. Taylor said that he could go either way on color, but he liked the design of the building and siting option 2. Andrzejewski summarized that option 2 was vetted by the neighborhood, better meets accessibility standards, worked with the floodplains, the pump house, and faces the beach and playground. Kaliszewski said the applicants had tested the original color on the historic ferry restroom building in response to a request from the community, so the community should have a final say in the color options. She said that her preferred color option would be whatever color the community prefers. Martin agreed that the community should decide on the color.

### **ACTION:**

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Martin, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing beach shelter. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Kaliszewski, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new beach shelter with the conditions that applicants use site plan option #2 and gather community feedback on the color for the Hardieboard smooth siding. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**