

AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION	PRESENTED: 3/15/21	
TITLE: 1330 Sherman Ave - Demolition of an existing beach shelter and construction of a new beach shelter on a Designated Madison Landmark site (Tenney Park); 2nd Ald. Dist.	REFERRED:	
	REREFERRED:	
	REPORTED BACK:	
AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner	ADOPTED:	POF:
DATED: 3/26/21	ID NUMBER: 64336	

Members present were: Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor. Excused were Anna Andrzejewski and Betty Banks.

SUMMARY:

Melissa Destree, registering in support and wishing to speak
Kathleen Kane, registering in support and available to answer questions
Laura Amundson, registering in support and available to answer questions

Bailey said that Tenney Park is significant for its prairie-style landscape architecture; most of the contributing structures are bridges, along with one building, and there are examples from all over the spectrum for how the various buildings on the site blend into the landscape. She said that the applicants are looking for feedback on the current proposal to ensure it will meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Destree discussed the proposal to replace the existing triangular park shelter building from 1979. She explained that a beach enclosure will be constructed in the lake in order to clean the water around the beach, and the shelter will house the pump room. She showed images of the original 1913 bathhouse that was replaced by the current shelter, as well as the limestone bridges and the 1909 ferry restroom building. She said that the historic ferry restroom building was Prairie-inspired with the Craftsman element of having the structure exposed under the roof, and it was curious that it was built in concrete. She said that they took paint samples from underneath the roof and the window frames to potentially guide them in picking colors for the new shelter. She showed images of other non-historic structures in the park, including the Tenney Lock building and the more recent pavilion used as a warming house and community space. She explained that they are not doing work on the parking lot area, playground, or seawall. The beach enclosure is a non-permanent structure made of webbing, and the water is pumped through PVC pipes to the pump room where it is cleaned and then pumped back to the lake. She described the park shelter prototype that was developed in 2014 and has been used at numerous City parks with slight modifications depending on the needs for each area. She showed a site plan with the proposed placement of the new shelter as well as renderings showing the various amenities. She said that in conversations with staff, they discussed how the structure responds to its site. She said that the beach shelter is supporting the same use as previous structures but with modern amenities. She pointed out that the proposed shelter is located in a similar location and its linear nature supports the horizontal form of the original 1913 bathhouse. She said that the size and scale are sensitive to the historic site, and components of the proposed building are similar to the 1909 restroom building. She discussed the proposed materials, including concrete, stone, and fiber cement siding.

McLean said that each park currently has its own unique shelter design and asked why there wasn't a more unique design for the park. He also asked why it was rotated differently on the site, with the new shelter pointing toward Maple Bluff. He requested more information on the PVC pipes for the beach enclosure and whether they were exposed or buried. Destree said the PVC pipes will be buried two feet under the sand. She said they changed the orientation of the shelter in order to locate the pump room closer to the beach so there is less distance for the water to travel, which helps the equipment run more efficiently. McLean asked how much less efficient it would be if they squared the building up to the seawall as the current building is. Amundson said that it was related to the floodplains as well, which limited where they could position the building. Regarding the buried PVC pipe, she said they need to make sure there are no tight angles in the pipes bringing the water into the pump room, and they were advised to keep the piping distance as short as possible due to expense. McLean said that the proposed orientation forces everyone in the picnic area to look at Maple Bluff and the shoreline near Fuller's Woods as opposed to the outward lake view. He said that the concrete seawall is a strong element on the shoreline and with both the seawall and shelter being rectilinear now, it seems like a natural progression from one to the other. He asked if the neighborhood had any feedback on the proposal. Destree said that they had a neighborhood meeting three weeks ago and the design was well received. She said the neighborhood was interested in having them test the paint colors on the 1909 building to help them decide which colors to use on the new shelter. McLean asked if it would be for the burnished block or just the siding. Destree said that it could be for the burnished block too, which will have an anti-graffiti seal coat on it that deepens the color. McLean asked how effective the seal was and how long it lasts. Destree said that they haven't had any issues since they began using it in 2014. Kane said that Parks staff finds the anti-graffiti coating to be helpful.

Arnesen asked McLean what type of shelter design he would rather see in the park and for thoughts on the textured or smooth HardiePlank options. McLean said that typically, they want to avoid faux textured wood, so he would like a smooth surface. Regarding the design, he said that he thinks they are too far along in the process if this shelter design is being used throughout the city. He said that while the new warming house is a nice amenity for the community, removing the old shelter was a loss. He said that it was similar to the existing beach shelter in its low-slung profile and vocabulary to the landscaping, which are important to the natural prairie design of the park. He said that he understands the larger scope of the park shelter replacements across the city and related efficiencies in using one design, so it's too late, but Madison parks were unique in that you knew which park you were in based on the shelter. He said that as they discuss losing historic resources, it is unfortunate that they are also losing things that identify each park in a unique way. He said that he understands that as the park is evolving over time, the structures are being replaced but wanted to make note of these losses.

Kaliszewski said that overall, she agreed with McLean's comments, and it looks like they are already far along on the design of the project. She said that she wouldn't want to disagree with what the neighborhood wants, but between the two options for materials presented by the applicants, she preferred option 2. Arnesen asked if she'd prefer smooth siding, and she said she would; the group agreed on smooth siding.

ACTION:

No action was taken.