

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

April 5, 2021

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1330 Sherman Avenue, Tenney Park

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for Demolition and New Construction on a Designated Madison Landmark site

Legistar File ID # [64336](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: March 30, 2021

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Melissa Destree, Destree Design Architects

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing beach shelter and construction of a new beach shelter

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is a Designated Madison Landmark

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

- (2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:
- (a) Whether the structure is of such architectural or historic significance that its demolition or removal would be detrimental to the public interest and contrary to the general welfare of the people of the City and the State.
 - (b) Whether a landmark's designation has been rescinded.
 - (c) Whether the structure, although not itself a landmark structure, contributes to the distinctive architectural or historic character of the historic district as a whole and therefore should be preserved for the benefit of the people of the City and the State.
 - (d) Whether demolition or removal of the subject property would be contrary to the policy and purpose of this ordinance and/or to the objectives of the historic preservation plan for the applicable historic district as duly adopted by the Common Council.
 - (e) Whether the structure is of such old and unusual or uncommon design, method of construction, or material that it could not be reproduced or be reproduced only with great difficulty and/or expense.
 - (f) Whether retention of the structure would promote the general welfare of the people of the City and the State by encouraging study of American history, architecture and design or by developing an understanding of American culture and heritage.
 - (g) The condition of the property, provided that any deterioration of the property which is self-created or which is the result of a failure to maintain the property as required by this chapter cannot qualify as a basis for the issuance of a certificate of appropriateness for demolition or removal.
 - (h) Whether any new structure proposed to be constructed or change in use proposed to be made is compatible with the historic resources of the historic district in which the subject property is located, or if outside a historic district, compatible with the mass and scale of buildings within two hundred (200) feet of the boundary of the landmark site.

Prior to approving a certificate of appropriateness for demolition, the Landmarks Commission may require the applicant to provide documentation of the structure. Documentation shall be in the form required by the Commission.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an existing beach shelter and construction of a new beach shelter. The Landmarks Commission will need to review if the proposed demolition of the existing shelter meets the standards for demolition and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and if the proposed new construction meets the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Tenney Park is a designated landmark site due to its significant Prairie style landscape architecture as designed by O.C. Simonds. There is only one historic building within the period of significance, otherwise the historic structures are largely bridges. The park shelter proposed for demolition was constructed in 1979 and the landmark nomination discusses it as noncontributing to the historic significance of the site. It does not appear to be significant in its own right, with no architect noted in the preservation files.

The proposed new shelter is a prototype design that Madison Parks is using in all park properties. The simple design follows the form of the flat-roofed building at the Tenney locks. The proposal is to incorporate stone that replicates the style of stone found in the bridges on the landmark site. During the informational presentation at the last Landmarks Commission meeting, the applicant advised they were investigating a historic paint analysis to determine the original color of the trim at the historic restroom building. The green color of that trim is not found elsewhere in the park, and the applicant is providing both the historic color and a brown color that is currently found on structures within the park. There are also several siting options in the current set of plans in response to the request from the commission to investigate siting alternatives to better address the beach.

The proposed materials appear to be in keeping with the appearance of the historic materials found on structures within the park. The design will blend with the other noncontributing structures within the park, and be complimentary without being mistaken as a historic resource.

A discussion of the relevant standards for the demolition follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) The proposed new construction and demolition must comply with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) N/A

(d) The proposed work appears to be in the public interest of creating a safe and accessible park shelter on this landmark property.

(2) Demolition or Removal. In determining whether to approve a certificate of appropriateness for any demolition or removal of any landmark or structure within a historic district, the Landmarks Commission shall consider all of the following, and may give decisive weight to any or all of the following:

- (a) The existing structure is not historically or architecturally significant.
- (b) The landmark designation is not being rescinded.
- (c) N/A
- (d) The existing structure is not a historic resource and is therefore aligned with the historic preservation ordinance.
- (e) The existing structure is not unusual or distinctive.
- (f) Retention of the existing structure would not benefit the welfare of the public.
- (g) The structure proposed for removal is to create a structure that better addresses accessibility and is not proposed for removal due to neglect or deterioration.
- (h) The proposed new structure is in scale with the historic resources in the vicinity.

As part of the documentation of the evolution of this landmark site, staff believes that photographic documentation of this structure prior to demolition would be helpful for the preservation file.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

- 1. This part of Tenney Park has always been used as a beach. The existing shelter replaced a previous bathhouse at this location. This new structure will allow for ongoing use of this part of the property as a public beach.
- 2. The new construction will not negatively impact the historic character of Tenney Park. The existing shelter is outside the period of significance and therefore no historic materials are being removed as part of its demolition.
- 3. The new construction will reference the historic materials found on the property, but read as a new structure. It does not introduce conjectural elements to the historic landscape.
- 4. The existing park shelter has not achieved significance in its own right.
- 5. While the existing park shelter related to the nonextant 1958 William Kaeser park shelter, both were noncontributing to the landmark site. No distinctive features or craftsmanship will be lost as part of the demolition of this structure.
- 6. No historic features or structures are included in the demolition or new construction.
- 7. N/A
- 8. Madison Parks is working with the Wisconsin Historical Society on securing a Request to Disturb permit. As this site has had two structures located on it, it is highly disturbed and it is unlikely that resources from the prehistoric settlement at this location remain.
- 9. The new construction is differentiated from the historic in that the only historic building within the park is the Prairie-style restroom building. This is a new, but simple building that incorporates the aesthetics of the materials found on the historic structures within Tenney Park.
- 10. If this structure is removed in the future, the significance of the historic landscape will be unimpaired.

Recommendation

Staff believes the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness could be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Specify the siting of the proposed new structure
2. Specify the Tarrytown Green or the Timber Bark Hardieboard smooth siding