

## AGENDA # 3

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

**PRESENTED:** 3/1/21

TITLE: 115 N Spooner St - Exterior Alteration in  
the University Heights Hist. Dist. -  
Replacement of windows; 5th Ald.  
Dist.

**REFERRED:**

**REREFERRED:**

**REPORTED BACK:**

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

**ADOPTED:**

**POF:**

DATED: 3/3/21

**ID NUMBER:** 63197

---

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, and David McLean. Excused were: Betty Banks, Arvina Martin, and Maurice Taylor.

### **SUMMARY:**

*Erica Fox Gehrig, registering in opposition and wishing to speak*

*Dustin West, registering in support and available to answer questions*

Bailey discussed the proposed work to replace seven windows on the second story, as well as one window on the stair landing with safety glass. She said that some windows are on the street façade and others are on the back of the house where they are not visible from the street. She discussed the applicable standards regarding frustrating the public interest and referenced the City Attorney's Office memo on window replacements, as well as University Heights standards related to repairs, alterations visible from the street, and alterations not visible from the street. She discussed the third party assessment of the existing window conditions, which found that the windows were in very good condition in need of minor repairs such as removing paint buildup, adjustment of stops, and installation of weather stripping. She said that staff recommends repair of the eight windows proposed for replacement and the installation of safety film on the window needing to meet tempered glass standards.

Erica Fox Gehrig said that when she served on the Landmarks Commission, they saw many requests like this, but typically not on houses that are so well-maintained. She said that she opposes this window replacement. She said that the third party assessment requirement is helpful because it takes the onus off the commission to make these specific judgments not having seen the windows themselves or having the necessary expertise on windows. She said that she understands it might be difficult for the property owners to have the work done because the window repair industry isn't as visible as the window replacement industry. She said that the more environmental choice is to repair windows rather than replace, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards always recommend repair. She said that she hopes the steward of this home in the University Heights National Register and local historic district will see the benefits of keeping the historic fabric of their house intact by repairing, not replacing, the windows.

Andrzejewski reminded the commission of staff's recommendation to approve repair of the windows. Arnesen said that the applicants followed the protocol the commission has established with a third party assessment, but it would be helpful to see bids for the new windows to compare the cost. He said this is a pretty easy call to make when there is no evidence of unrepairable wood deterioration. McLean agreed and pointed out that the property owners will end up having better windows and saving money by keeping the existing windows, which will last longer than any replacement. He said that he supports repair instead of replacement. Andrzejewski

said the commission reviews a lot of window requests, and condition is a major factor they consider. She said the third party assessment contains the information they need to make a decision, but asked if the applicant should file a new application if new information comes to light. Bailey said that if substantially different information becomes available, a new application would be accepted for review.

**ACTION:**

**A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by McLean, to approve the request for the Certificate of Appropriateness for the repair of the eight windows proposed for replacement and installation of safety film on the window needing to meet tempered glass standards. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**