

## PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 1, 2021

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



**Project Name & Address:** 1012 Jenifer Street

**Application Type(s):** Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction, an addition, and exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district

**Legistar File ID #** [64128](#)

**Prepared By:** Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** February 23, 2021

### Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** Christi Weber, TDS Custom Construction

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new garage structure, an addition to the principal structure, and alterations to the front porch.

### Background Information

**Parcel Location/Information:** The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

#### Relevant State Statute Section:

**Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m.** In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

#### Relevant Ordinance Sections:

**41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
  - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
  - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
  - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

#### **41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) Gross Volume.
  - (b) Height.
  - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
  - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
  - (e) The design of the roof.
  - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
  - (g) Directional expression.
  - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
  - (i) Landscape treatment.
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
    - 1. Height.
    - 2. Landscape treatment.
    - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
  - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
  - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
  - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
  - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

## **Analysis and Conclusion**

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new detached garage structure, an addition of an enclosed porch to the rear of the principal structure, and alterations to the front porch. There had previously been a garage on this property. Building Inspection issued a work order in 2010 due to the deteriorated condition of the garage, with the requirement to repair the hole in the roof. Aerial images from 2018 show the garage had multiple holes in the roof and it is gone by the time of the 2020 aerals. It is likely that the garage was too deteriorated to repair, but there was no raze permit or documentation of what existed prior to the current owners acquiring the property in 2020.

The principal structure dates to 1895 and is a wood-clad Queen Anne structure. The character-defining features are the numerous decorative details, which include fish-scale shingles in the front gable with the Palladian window, and the box motifs on the first floor.

The front porch need maintenance and the proposal is to introduce new footings and structural support within the box columns, replace framing, repair or replicate wood features, and install gutters. The existing balcony on the rear of the building will have a new screened porch nested below it. The proposal is for Trex decking, skirting, treads and railings on the lower porch, aluminum wrapping of the columns. The proposal includes the option of

wood railings instead of Trex. The Landmarks Commission has not previously approved Trex railings as they do not adequately replicate the wood appearance. However, this railing will be on a new addition that is not visible from the street.

The garage is mostly of a simple design that is in keeping with the types of garages the commission has previously approved in the district. This new structure would echo some of the decorative elements from the principal structure, including a compass-head window in the gable end. While this is not typical, there is precedent within 200 feet for a minimally decorative garage that replicates decorative elements from the house. The garage at 1030 Jenifer St. replicates the decorative truss in the gable end, thereby linking the two structures together. These are both Queen Anne-style buildings, albeit with very different detailing, but nearby example provides a precedent for a garage with decorative elements. The gabled roof will also include solar panels, installed parallel to the roof plane.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

**41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) Gross Volume.  
The size of the new garage is in keeping with the size of other garages in the vicinity.
  - (b) Height.  
The height is comparable to historic resources in the vicinity.
  - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.  
The garage door is centrally located on the front of the garage, which is in keeping with the pattern on other garages. Where this structure differs is with the inclusion of a compass-head window in the gable end. While not necessarily typical for historic resources in the vicinity, it does link this façade to the arched central window of the Palladian window on the front of the principal structure.
  - (d) Materials used in the street facades.  
The proposal for the garage primarily uses wood for the cladding. The drawings for the doors appear to replicate the appearance of vehicle and pedestrian doors on historic garages within 200 feet.
  - (e) The design of the roof.  
The gable front garage is common for other historic resources.
  - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.  
The previous garage was located at the rear of the property. The new garage is located in the further forward on the parcel, but is in keeping with the location of accessory structures on other properties in the vicinity.
  - (g) Directional expression.  
The new garage utilizes the decorative themes of the principal structure with a narrow street façade and the length of the building extending to the back.
  - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.  
The new garage replicates the patterns of the principal structure at a smaller scale so as to be subordinate to the principal structure.
  - 1. Landscape treatment.  
The siting for the garage follows traditional patterns and the proposed reworked landscaping of the rear yard does likewise.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
1. Height.  
There will be no changes to the height and the new screened porch will be nested below the existing balcony. The work on the front porch will not change the existing height.
  2. Landscape treatment.  
The siting of the screened porch is located to the rear of the structure, which fits the pattern of siting of new additions.
  3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.  
The new addition will not be visible from the street, but the new screened porch will still read as a largely open space, and not introduce a significant change to the rhythm of masses and spaces.
- (b) No changes to the rhythm of solids to voids as part of the repair of the front porch.
- (c) The proposal is to retain elements where possible and replicate the appearance of the historic materials where they are too deteriorated to repair on the street façade.
- (d) No proposed changes to the roof forms. The new gutters will not modify the overall appearance of the roof.
- (e) No changes to window or door sizes on the street façade.

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following conditions:

1. Staff approval of final window, door, and roof shingle specifications
2. The commission should specify if wood or Trex railings are to be used on the rear screened porch and balcony.