

EVALUATION PANEL REPORT

RFP 8967-0-2020-AH
Imagination Center at Reindahl Park
2/5/2021

Introduction

The City of Madison solicited proposals from qualified vendors. The following proposed:

1. JLA Architects
2. OPN Architects
3. Sketchworks Architecture
4. MSR Design
5. Krueck Sexton Partners
6. Engberg Anderson
7. Dimension IV

Please reference the RFP for additional information.

Summary of Evaluation Panel Activity

1. Panel members first conducted evaluations of proposals independently based on the pre-established criteria determined by the panel. Then, the panel met to discuss all qualitative and quantitative aspects of the proposals and overall ratings as a group. Purchasing staff rated the cost section of the proposals.

Below is a summary of the scoring:

Phase I Score	JLA Architects	OPN Architects	Sketchworks Architecture	MSR Design	Krueck Sexton	Engberg Anderson	Dimension IV
Technical Score	47.10	40.30	36.40	49.30	43.60	42.10	33.60
Cost Consideration	13.24	19.32	0.00	16.33	22.00	30.00	26.46
Local Vendor	5.00	0.00	5.00	0.00	0.00	0.00	5.00
Total	65.34	59.62	41.40	65.63	65.60	72.10	65.06

Then the evaluation panel invited the top four scorers to give a 1.5 hours of presentation including question and answer session. Based on the meeting and presentation given to the evaluation panel, they met as a group and provided the following score:

Phase II Score	JLA ARCHITECTS	MSR Design	Krueck Sexton	Engberg Anderson
Firm Qualifications (16.25)	12.59	12.78	11.24	9.94
Process and Project Approach (32.50)	24.86	23.73	22.05	16.47
Design Principles & Overall (16.25)	12.16	11.62	11.54	9.51
Technical Score (65):	49.62	48.13	44.82	35.91
Cost Consideration (30)	14.96	16.33	22.00	30.00
Local Vendor Preference (5)	5.00			
Finance Score (35):	19.96	16.33	22.00	30.00
Final Score (100):	69.58	64.46	66.82	65.91

Phase II Fee Breakdown	JLA ARCHITECTS	MSR Design	Krueck Sexton	Engberg Anderson
Cost				
Step 1 Cost Subtotal	\$295,770.0	\$220,995.0	\$162,962.0	\$71,400.0
Step 2 Cost Subtotal	\$1,458,230.00	\$1,385,529.00	\$1,029,816.00	\$839,300.00
Total Cost	\$1,754,000.00	\$1,606,524.00	\$1,192,778.00	\$910,700.00
Hours				
Step 1 Hours Subtotal	2,195	1,832	1,006	599
Step 2 Hours Subtotal	12,254	13,109	6,355	7,262
Total Hours	14,449	14,941	7,361	7,861

Please note that JLA Architects' grand total includes a professional theatre consultant as an extra service. No other RFP finalist proposed a theatre consultant as an extra service.

Based on the scoring of Phase II evaluation, the panel felt comfortable selecting the top scoring vendor, as the awarded vendor.

2. Final Selection of the Panel: **JLA ARCHITECTS.**

3. Local Preference

Was the outcome of this bid changed by the local purchasing ordinance? Yes ___ No

4. Evaluation Panel Meetings and Timeline:

9/28/2020	Due date for proposals.
10/2/2020	Distribution of proposals.
10/5/2020	First panel meeting.
10/19/2020	Phase I evaluation score is due.
10/23/2020	Second panel meeting to discuss score.
10/27/2020	Panel met and decided to invite the top four scorers.
10/30/2020	Notification was sent indicating that Phase I evaluation was concluded.
11/19/2020	Panel met in preparation for Phase II evaluation.
11/24/2020	Meeting link and agenda for Phase II presentation was distribution to top four scorers.
12/10/2020	Phase II Presentations began.
1/4/2021	First meeting and discussion of presentations from Phase II evaluation.
1/12/2021	Second meeting and discussion of presentations from Phase II evaluation.
1/19/2021	Panel met to arrive at a selection, and a vote to select a winning vendor was made.
1/29/2021	Review by Purchasing Department.
2/5/2021	Result posted.