

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

January 12, 2021



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS ORDINANCE REVIEW COMMITTEE

Legistar File ID # [56918](#), Draft Historic Preservation Ordinance:
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
 William Fruhling, Principal Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: January 5, 2021
Subject: Standards for New Structures Alternative Approaches

This document explores several options for how to address the New Structures section in the draft Historic Preservation Ordinance. It was prepared primarily to facilitate a discussion to assist the LORC in determining a path forward. Since Option 1 is the only alternative that has been thoroughly discussed by the LORC, if the Committee chooses to explore other options, they will need to be more closely analyzed. Staff continue to recommend Option 1, and the inclusion of other options should not be interpreted as staff endorsement of them.

The current organization of the Current Draft Ordinance is as follows:

- 41.xx Standards for Maintenance
- 41.xx Standards for Repairs
- 41.xx Standards for Alterations
- 41.xx Standards for Additions
- 41.xx Standards for New Structures

All of the options assume that the Standards for Maintenance, Repairs, Alterations, and Additions would remain as shown in the Current Draft Ordinance. The table below summarizes the options.

Option 1	Option 2	Option 3
Current Draft Ordinance	Existing District Standards	Madison Alliance for Historic Preservation Proposal (Matson version)
<ul style="list-style-type: none">•Consistent format to rest of draft ordinance•Consistent standards across all districts	<ul style="list-style-type: none">•Maintains current standards unique to each district•Includes only those standards related to new construction	<ul style="list-style-type: none">•Uses Preservation Principals as the requirements for all districts•Standards unique to each district are shown as guidelines•Includes only those standards related to new construction•Note that this is a staff adaptation of the proposal

Note that the proposed ordinance section numbering in the options is illustrative. It attempts to show a consistent protocol for reference and comparison purposes and does not reflect the numbering of existing ordinance or other proposals. The order of the standards may also have changed for consistency.

Option 1: Current Draft Ordinance

This option reflects the “staff draft” dated October 26, 2020. This is an updated version that reflects the discussion and direction of LORC through that date.

41.XX STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES

(1) General

(a) Primary Structures

1. Requirements. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:
 - a. Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.
 - b. Street Setback. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.
 - c. Visual Size. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade
 - d. Building Form. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.
 - e. Architectural Expression. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission shall consider factors such as the building’s modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
2. Guidelines

(b) Accessory Structures

1. Requirements
 - a. Comply with requirements for new primary structures
 - b. Minimally visible from the street, or for corner lots be minimally visible from the front of the property
 - c. Clearly be secondary to the primary structure
2. Guidelines
 - a. New accessory structures should be of a similar architecture style as the primary structure while clearly being a new building so as not to create a false sense of history.

(2) Building Site

(a) General

1. Requirements
 - a. New parking areas, access ramps, trash or mechanical equipment enclosures shall be designed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible, retain the historic relationship between the buildings and the building and the landscape, and are visually compatible with other historic resources in the district.
 - b. Chain link, metal mesh, and composite fences are permitted on elevations not visible from the street.
 - c. Bamboo, reed, vinyl, and rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split-rails, are prohibited.
 - d. Fences in the front yard shall not exceed three (3) feet in height.
2. Guidelines

(3) Exterior Walls

(a) General

1. Requirements

- a. Materials used for new structures shall be similar in design, scale and architectural appearance to materials that date to the period of significance on historic resources within 200 feet, but differentiated enough so that it is not confused as a historic building.

2. Guidelines

(4) Roofs

(a) Form

1. Requirements

- a. Roof form and pitch shall be similar to the form and pitch of the roofs on historic resources within two hundred (200) feet.

1. Guidelines

- a. In a district with a mix of building types, the proposed new structure would need a similar roof form to some of the historic resources within 200 feet.

(b) Materials

1. Requirements

- a. The following roof treatments are prohibited: thick wood shakes; corrugated or ribbed metal roofing panels; metal shingles; architectural asphalt shingles that have heavy faux shadowing; and any shingles with scalloped or staggered bottom edges.
- b. Any roofing material shall be permitted on flat or slightly pitched roofs not visible from the street.

2. Guidelines

(c) Skylights

1. Requirements

- a. If visible from the street, skylight shall be located at least twelve (12) feet back from the front edge of the main roof.
- b. Skylights shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and framing painted to match the roof material.
- c. Tubular, arched, domed, or pyramidal shaped skylights are prohibited on elevations visible from the street.

2. Guidelines

(d) Chimneys

1. Requirements

- a. A chimney's form and materials shall be similar to other chimneys on historic resources within the district.

2. Guidelines

(e) Rooftop Features

1. Requirements

- a. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the street.

2. Guidelines

(5) Windows and Doors

(a) General

1. Requirements

- a. Door and window styles should both match the style of the new structure and be compatible with those on historic resources within 200 feet.
- b. The following materials are prohibited: vinyl; aluminum; glass block, reflective glass; dark glass; plexiglass; doors with a fake wood grain, mill finish or clear anodized aluminum, and other metallic finishes; and faux (decorative/non-functional) hardware.

2. Guidelines

(b) Windows and Storm Windows

1. Requirements

- a. Multi-light windows shall have true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior the same color as the window sash.

2. Guidelines

(c) Entrance Doors and Storm Doors

1. Requirements

- a. Sliding glass doors shall not be installed on the ground floor elevation along any street frontage.

2. Guidelines

(d) Shutters

1. Requirements

- a. Shutters shall only be allowed if they are found on historic resources in the district
b. Shutters shall be of a size that they appear operable for the associated window.

2. Guidelines

(e) Awnings.

1. Requirements

- a. Awnings will be of a configuration and form consistent with the awnings in the district
b. Awning materials shall have the appearance of the materials found on historic resources with awnings

2. Guidelines

(f) Garage Doors

1. Requirements

- a. Overhead doors shall not have false hinges or hardware applied.

2. Guidelines

- a. More contemporary door styles may be considered if they are simple in style and design

(6) Porches, Balconies and Decks

(a) Porch Elements

1. Requirements

- a. Entrances and porches shall be of a size and configuration consistent with the historic resources in the district.
b. The primary entrance for the structure shall be located on the front elevation, or, structures on a corner lot may have a corner entrance.
c. Uncovered porches over fifty (50) square feet are considered decks and shall be placed so that they are not visible from the street to which the building is oriented.
d. Composite, vinyl, and decorative metal balusters and railings are prohibited, unless not visible from the street.
e. Second exit stairways shall be provided on the interior of the structure.

2. Guidelines

(b) Balconies and Decks

1. Requirements

- a. Projecting, partially projecting/inset, and inset balconies are prohibited on elevations visible from the street, unless there is precedent on the historic resources in the district.

2. Guidelines

(7) Building Systems

(a) Mechanical Systems

1. Requirements

- a. Mechanical equipment shall be screened if it is visible from the street.
b. Static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the street are prohibited.

- c. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials.
- 2. Guidelines
 - a. Split system mechanical units and other mechanical equipment should be installed on elevations, roofs, and at grade so they are not visible from the street.
 - b. Grilles (mechanical air intake, exhaust, etc.), vents (plumbing stack, mechanical air intake or exhaust, etc.), electrical and communications equipment (transformers, cabinets, mobile service boosters, security cameras, etc.), and utility meters (water, gas, electric, etc.) should not be placed in the front yard or on the front elevation.
- (b) Solar
 - 1. Requirements
 - a. Roof-mounted solar arrays on sloped roofs shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and arranged in a pattern or grid parallel to the roof's ridge and eaves.
 - b. Roof-mounted solar arrays on flat roofs shall be installed so as to be minimally visible from the street.
 - 2. Guidelines
- (c) Lighting and Electrical Systems
 - 1. Requirements
 - a. Decorative light fixtures shall be compatible in style and location with the overall design of the building.
 - b. Security light fixtures or security cameras shall be installed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible.
 - c. Exterior mounted conduit on elevations visible from the street is prohibited.
 - d. Roof appurtenances such as antennas, satellite dishes, or communications equipment should be installed so that they are minimally visible from the street and do not damage or obscure historic features.
 - 2. Guideline
 - a. More contemporary lighting styles may be considered if they are simple in style and design.

Option 2: Existing District Standards

This option attempts to extract the specific standards related to new construction from the existing ordinance for each of the five local historic districts. This would maintain the unique set of standards for each district as it applies to new construction. The order and numbering of individual standards has been changed from the current ordinance for consistency.

Note that some districts currently have standards for new construction of accessory structures, fences, and/or retaining walls and those remain in this draft. Since LORC discussed standards for accessory structures separately, the Committee may wish to establish unified standards for those and keep this section focused on primary structures.

41.XX STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES

(1) General

- (a) In the case of new construction, the standards for review for each historic district are provided below.

(2) Mansion Hill Historic District

- (a) Any new structure located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. Height.
 2. Gross Volume.
 3. In the street elevation(s) of a structure, the proportion of width to height in the facade(s).
 4. The proportions and relationships of width to height of the doors and windows in streetfacade(s).
 5. The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
- (b) All street facades shall blend with other structures via directional expression. When adjacent structures have a dominant vertical or horizontal expression, this expression should be carried over and reflected.
- (c) Reference to Plan. The requirements in this section derive from a plan entitled "The Mansion Hill Historic Preservation Plan and Development Handbook," City Planning Department, 1975.

(3) Third Lake Ridge Historic District

- (a) Parcels Zoned for Employment Use. Any new structure on parcels zoned for employment use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. Gross volume.
 2. Height.
- (b) Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. Gross Volume.
 2. Height.
 3. The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facade(s).
 4. The materials used in the street facade(s).
 5. The design of the roof.
 6. The rhythm of buildings masses and spaces.

- (c) Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
1. Gross Volume.
 2. Height.
 3. The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 4. Materials used in the street facades.
 5. The design of the roof.
 6. The rhythm of buildings and masses.
 7. Directional expression.
 8. Materials, patterns and textures.
 9. Landscape treatment.
- (d) Reference to Plan. The public policy guidelines in this subsection derive from a plan entitled "ThirdLake Ridge Historic District," City Planning Department, January, 1978.

(4) University Heights Historic District

- (a) Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts.
1. Principal Structures.
 - a. Height.
 - i. The maximum height in the TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, TR-V1, and TR-V2 Zoning Districts shall be thirty-five (35) feet and shall not exceed two and a half (2½) stories except as provided in the height regulations for the district.
 - ii. The maximum height in the TR-U1, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts shall be forty(40) feet.
 - iii. The maximum height in the TR-U2 Zoning District shall be fifty (50) feet. All new structures in all zoning districts within University Heights shall be no less than fifteen (15) feet high.
 - b. Materials. Materials for the exterior walls shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing structures in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.
 - c. Visual Size. The gross area of the front facade, i.e., all walls facing the street, of a single-family, two-unit or commercial structure shall be no greater than one hundred twenty-five percent (125%) of the average gross area of the front facades of structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. The gross area of the front façade of a multiple family dwelling shall be no more than one hundred twenty-five percent(125%) of the average gross area of the front facades of all structures within two undred (200) feet of the subject property or variations in the setback shall be designed in the front facade of the structure to repeat the rhythm and proportions of structures to space between them within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.
 - d. Roof Shape . The shapes and pitches of roofs shall be similar to the roof shapes and pitches on existing structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.

- e. Roof Materials. Roofing materials shall be similar in appearance to roofing materials used on structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. Modern-style shingles, such as thick wood shakes, Dutch lap, French method and interlock shingles, that are incompatible with the historic character of the district are prohibited. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the ground.
- 2. Parking Lots. No new parking lots will be approved unless they are accessory to and on the same zoning lot as a commercial structure or multiple family dwelling.
- 3. Accessory Structures. Accessory structures, as defined in Section 28.211, MGO, shall be compatible with the design of the existing structures on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory structure shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal structures as set forth in Sec. 41.24(4)(a)2.

(5) Marquette Bungalows Historic District

- (a) Accessory Structures. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the design of the existing structure on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. Accessory structures shall be erected in the rear yard. If the structure on the lot is sided in wood or stucco, the siding on the accessory structure shall match the appearance of the siding on the structure. Imitation siding materials that approximate the look of the siding on the structure, such as vinyl, aluminum or applied stucco-like surfaces, may be approved. If the siding on the structure is brick, the garage may be sided in brick to match, clapboard, stucco, narrow-gauge vinyl or aluminum or applied stucco-like surfaces. Garage doors shall blend with the historic appearance of the neighborhood. Horizontally paneled doors and flat paneled doors are prohibited. Windows shall be either casements or double-hung units of a similar proportion to the windows on the structure. Alteration of existing accessory structures shall comply with this subdivision (e) and with subdivision (d) above. The roof shape may be a hip or gable of any pitch; single slope roofs are prohibited. The roof material shall match as closely as possible the color and appearance of the roof material on the structure.
- (b) New Principal Structures. New principal structures shall match the design of other structures in the district in materials, roof shape, architectural details, the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids, the proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows, the scale, height, setbacks, side yards and other visual features. The intention is to have new structures virtually duplicate the design of other structures in the neighborhood, since all parcels in the district are currently developed and any new construction would be replacing an existing structure.
- (c) Fences. Chain link, metal mesh and other rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split-rails, are prohibited in the front yard. Fences in the front yard shall not exceed three (3) feet in height.

(6) First Settlement Historic District

- (a) New Principal Structures.
 - 1. Structure Height, Scale, Proportion and Rhythm. New principal structures shall be similar in height to the structures directly adjacent to each side. If the structures directly adjacent to each side are different in height, the new structure shall be of a height compatible with the structures within two hundred(200) feet of the proposed structure. New principal structures shall be compatible with the scale, proportion, and rhythm of masses and spaces of structures within two hundred (200) feet of the proposed structure.

2. Siding Materials. Narrow gauge clapboards made of wood, composite wood material, or concrete, and/or brick and stone may be permitted. Stucco and split-faced concrete block may be permitted only as trim, rather than the primary siding material. Stucco panels and pebble dash are prohibited. If the first two floors of a proposed structure are masonry, the Landmarks Commission may permit the use of artificial siding (i.e. vinyl or aluminum) on the upper floor or floors. In such circumstances, the artificial siding must conform to the following requirements:
 - a. The material shall be of the highest grade offered by the manufacturer.
 - b. The material shall have a minimum gauge of .042.
 - c. The color and sheen of the siding shall be consistent with those used in the era in which adjacent structures were constructed.
 - d. The siding shall not have a false wood grain.
 - e. The width of each apparent clapboard shall not exceed four (4) inches.
 - f. The use of visible j-channel trim and other prefabricated elements that differ in appearance from those used on historic structures in the neighborhood is prohibited.
3. Roof Materials. Roofing materials shall be asphalt shingles; fiberglass or other composition shingles similar in appearance to multi-layered architectural shingles or 3-in-1 tab; or Dutchlap, French method or interlock shingles. Sawn wood shingles may also be approved. Thick wood shakes are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs that are not visible from the ground.
4. Roof Shape. If a principal structure does not have a flat roof, the pitch of the new roof shall be no less than 4-in-12.
5. Facade Design. Street facades shall be modulated with setbacks incorporated into the design at the first floor level. The entrance shall either be inset or projecting from the plane of the main facade. Porches on main entrances are encouraged. Street facades shall reflect the rhythm and directional expression of pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.
6. Windows and Doors. The proportion of width to height of doors and windows and the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the front and side facade designs shall be similar to pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. Windows trimmed with bead molds similar in design to other pre-1930 window trim in the district and windows and doors shall be inset at least one (1) inch from the exterior trim. The main entrance to the structure shall be on the front facade. Garage doors shall be located on the side or rear facades whenever feasible. If it is not feasible to locate the garage door on the sides or rear facades, one-car garage doors will be permitted on the front facade.
- (b) Accessory Structures. Accessory structures shall be compatible with the design of the existing structure on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. Garage doors shall either be entirely flat or shall have approximately square panels. Horizontally paneled doors are prohibited. Windows shall be either double or single-hung units of a similar proportion to the windows on the structure or shall be six-paned (three panes across and two panes high) units similar to those seen on 1920s era garages. Siding may either match the siding on the structure or be narrow-gauge clapboard, vertical board-and-batten, or a smooth stucco or stucco-like applied material. The roof shape shall have a pitch and style similar to the roof shape on the structure. The roof material shall match as closely as possible the material on the structure. Alteration of existing accessory structures shall comply with this subdivision and with subdivision (d).

- (c) Fences. Chain link and rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split rails, are prohibited in the front yard.
- (d) Retaining Walls in Front Yards. For retaining walls in front yards, railroad ties, landscape timbers, boulders, and concrete blocks are prohibited. Poured concrete walls with a smooth rubbed finish and under twenty-four (24) inches in height, flagstone and stone ashlar are permitted. Proposals to construct front yard retaining walls of other materials must be submitted to Landmarks Commission for approval prior to installation.
- (e) Reference to Plan. The history of the First Settlement Historic District is derived from the Downtown Historic Preservation Plan, City of Madison Department of Planning and Community and Economic Development, 1998."

Option 3: Madison Alliance for Historic Preservation Proposal (Matson version)

This option reflects the Jim Matson proposal re-submitted after the December 15, 2020 LORC meeting and includes the Preservation Principles as submitted through Dave Mollenhoff (most recently on December 14, 2020). Note that only portions of the Alliance’s proposal directly related to new construction are included. This is a staff interpretation of the intent and has been modified to provide a more direct comparison with other options, including removing duplicative standards- notably the Preservation Principals without associated guidelines- from each of the districts and putting that at the beginning of the Standards for New Structures section.

The definition of “Guidelines” used in this section is assumed to be that of the Current Draft Ordinance, which is: “Any project subject to this ordinance should refer to the guidelines for additional guidance and instruction that may be helpful in meeting the requirements and purpose and intent of this ordinance”.

Note that some districts have standards for new construction of accessory structures, signs, fences, and/or retaining walls and those remain in this draft. Since LORC discussed standards for accessory structures and signs separately, the Committee may wish to establish unified standards for those and keep this section focused on primary structures.

41.XX STANDARDS FOR NEW STRUCTURES

(1) Standards Applicable to All Historic Districts. Requirements in this section shall apply to new structures in all historic districts. Subsequent sections in this Chapter include additional standards unique to that district and shall apply in addition to the standards in the section. If any of the provisions of this section are either more restrictive or less restrictive than those in the district specific sections of this chapter, the regulations which are more restrictive or which impose higher standards or requirements shall prevail, unless an exception to this provision is specifically noted.

Added this section to accommodate common standards among districts.

(a) **New Primary Structures.** A new primary structure shall be visually compatible with the historic district, and with each historic resource located within 200 feet of the new structure, with respect to the following factors:

Changed “should” to “shall”.

1. **Size.** Its size as indicated by its height, number of stories above grade, gross volume, bulk, and street facade area.
2. **Lot Relationship.** Its relationship to the lot on which it is located, as indicated by its lot coverage and setbacks, and the size of its front, side and rear yards.
3. **Building Form.** Its overall form as indicated by its shape, massing, ratio of width to height, symmetry or asymmetry, and roof shape.
4. **Façade Articulation.** The articulation of its street façade and other visible facades, including visual patterns created by building planes, wall recesses, wall protrusions, window and door openings, and architectural features.
5. **Roof.** The character of its roof, including roof shape, style, pitch and surface materials, as well as roof features such as dormers, skylights, chimneys, rooftop decks, green roofs, and attached appurtenances.
6. **Exterior Walls.** Its exterior wall and foundation surfaces, including surface materials, textures, detailing and trim.
7. **Openings.** The character of its doors, windows, and related features such as storm doors, storm windows, trim and shutters. Relevant considerations may include size, shape, style, proportion, materials and placement, as well as the patterns created by door and window openings on visible facades.

Added the descriptor at the beginning of each 1-10.

- 8. Features and Systems. The nature, size, appearance and placement of exterior architectural features and appurtenances such as entryways, porches, decks, balconies, railings, stairways, rescue platforms, fire escapes, accessibility features, signs, awnings, lighting fixtures, HVAC equipment, electrical equipment, elevator equipment, solar equipment, telecommunications equipment and building mechanicals.
- 9. Site Features. Its sensitivity to the site and surrounding landscape. Relevant considerations may include the nature, size, appearance and location of its parking accommodations, refuse storage facilities, landscape features and drainage systems, as well as its sensitivity to distinctive natural features, archaeological features, historically representative landscape features, and open spaces that materially contribute to the character of the historic district.
- 10. Block Face. Its relationship to each block face of which it is part, including its effect on the collective visual pattern formed by the sizes of, shapes of, directional expression of, and distances between existing structures represented in the block face.

- (b) New Accessory Structures. A new accessory structure shall be visually compatible with the primary structure to which it pertains, with the historic district, and with each historic resource located within 200 feet of the accessory structure. New accessory structures should be as inconspicuous as reasonably possible, when viewed from a developed public right-of-way.
- (c) New Signs. A sign constructed on a lot in a historic district shall be visually compatible with the structures on that lot, with the historic district, and with historic resources located within 200 feet of the sign.

Changed "should" to "shall".

Changed "should" to "shall".

(2) Mansion Hill Historic District

- (a) New Primary Structures. A new primary structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(a) of this Chapter.
- (b) New Accessory Structures. A new accessory structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(b) of this Chapter.
- (c) New Signs. A sign constructed on a lot in a historic district shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(c) of this Chapter.

Note: No additional guidelines specific to Mansion Hill so the standards just refer back to the Standards Applicable to All Districts.

(3) Third Lake Ridge Historic District

- (a) New Primary Structures. A new primary structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(a) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.
 - 1. Size Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
 - a. Zone I Building Height: Buildings should not exceed 2-1/2 stories; except that, on the north side of the 800 and 900 block of Williamson Street, a flat-roofed building of up to 3 stories may be allowed subject to visual compatibility requirements and zoning limits.
 - b. Zone 1A Building Height: Buildings should not exceed 4 stories, except that:
 - i. On the easterly 165 feet of the north side of the 600 block of Williamson Street, buildings should not exceed 3 stories.
 - ii. On the south side of the 700 block of Williamson Street, up to 5 stories may be allowed, subject to visual compatibility requirements and zoning limits.
 - c. Zone II Building Height: Buildings should not exceed 3 stories, except that 4 stories may be allowed subject to visual compatibility requirements and zoning limits. The fourth story, if allowed, should be stepped back so that it cannot be seen at sidewalk level from the opposite side of the street. In the 800 and 900 blocks of Williamson Street, the fourth story should also be set back at least 45 feet from the property line for residential structures and at least 30 feet for commercial or mixed use structures.

Note: Only those Standards in the Applicable to All Districts section are repeated here if they have associated guidelines.

Note: A map of the zones from the Williamson St. BUILD Plan will need to be included in the ordinance.

- d. Zone III Building Height: Buildings should not exceed 54 feet or 5 stories, whichever is less.
 - e. Zone IV Building Height: Buildings should not exceed 54 feet or 5 stories, whichever is less; except that buildings up to the lesser of 85 feet or 7 stories may be allowed subject to visual compatibility requirements and zoning limits.
 - f. Street Façade Width: A building's total street façade width should not exceed 60 feet.
 - g. Corner Features: Corner features on corner buildings may extend a reasonable distance above the allowed height of the building if the corner feature is appropriate to the building style and is comparable in scale to historically representative corner features.
2. Lot Relationship Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
- a. Street Setbacks.
 - i. The street façade of a residential structure, other than a mixed-use structure, should be set back at least 15 feet from the public right-of-way. A shorter setback of not less than 6 feet may be allowed if the setback is not less than the average setback of other residential structures on the block face. A one-story unenclosed porch, including stairs, may encroach up to 6 feet into the setback but may not be located less than 6 feet from the public right-of-way.
 - ii. The street façade of a commercial or mixed-use structure should be set back 2 feet from the public right-of-way, except that a setback of up to 8 feet may be allowed to accommodate an outdoor retail space.
 - b. Side Yard Setbacks.
 - i. Lots no more than 44 feet wide should have side yard setbacks of at least 4 feet per side, totaling at least 10 feet for both sides.
 - ii. Lots over 44 feet wide should have side yard setbacks of at least 6 feet per side, totaling at least 16 feet for both sides.
 - iii. Corner residential lots should have a side lot setback of at least 8 feet on the street-facing side. The combined total setback requirement for both sides is thus increased by 4 feet.
 - iv. Corner commercial and mixed-use lots should have a side lot setback of at least 2 feet on the street-facing side. The combined total setback requirement for both sides is thus decreased by 2 feet.
 - c. Rear Yard Setbacks.
 - i. Rear yard setbacks should be at least 35 feet, or 16 feet if the building has underground or structured parking.
 - ii. A rear yard setback of 10 feet may be allowed in the 700 block of Williamson Street, and in the back half of the 600 block of Williamson Street
3. Façade Articulation Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
- a. Street Façade Articulation
 - i. Street façades more than 25 feet wide should be divided into visually distinct masses that are no more than 25 feet wide. The visually distinct masses should be separated from each other by at least 5 feet.
 - ii. Street facades should be articulated with dormers, bays, porches, recesses, or other architectural features to make the façade visually compatible with the block face. Porches are encouraged on single-family residences.
 - iii. A building's main entrance should be located on its street façade, and should be large enough to serve as a focal point of that façade.
 - iv. First floor storefronts should be broken into bays, similar in width to those on historically representative storefronts. Large storefront windows, low kick panels, transom windows, side pilasters and cornices are encouraged.
 - v. Recessed entrances are encouraged on the street facades of commercial and mixed-use buildings. Angled corner entrances are encouraged on corner buildings.

- vi. Parapet caps or cornices are encouraged on commercial or mixed-use buildings, at the top of the street façade.
 - vii. Street facades should be articulated to create a distinction between ground and upper stories.
 - b. Street Façade Elevation
 - i. On residential structures, other than mixed-use structures, the finished first floor elevation of the street façade should be at least 18 and not more than 48 inches above grade.
 - ii. On commercial or mixed-use structures, the finished first floor elevation should be as close to grade as possible, and should meet ADA requirements for entrances.
 - c. Street Façade Architectural Features
 - i. Historically representative architectural features, or contemporary interpretations of historically representative architectural features, are encouraged on street facades. However, a street façade should not convey a false impression of age.
4. Roof Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
- a. Roof Shape, Style and Pitch
 - i. Commercial and mixed-use buildings should have flat roofs.
 - ii. Residential buildings, other than mixed-use buildings, should have moderate to steeply pitched roofs. Pitched roofs may be gabled or hipped.
 - b. Roofing Materials
 - i. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes and like materials are inappropriate on pitched roofs, but may be used on flat roofs.
 - ii. Appropriate roofing materials for pitched roofs include asphalt shingles, sawn wood shingles, or fiberglass or other composition shingles that are similar in appearance to asphalt shingles. Shingles may include multilayered architectural shingles, 3-in-1 tab shingles, Dutch lap shingles, and French method or interlock shingles. Thick wood shakes are inappropriate.
 - iii. Roof vents should be as inconspicuous as possible and should be similar in color to the roof.
5. Exterior Walls Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
- a. Siding Materials
 - i. Exterior walls of commercial and mixed-use buildings should be surfaced with stone, masonry, stucco, or other historically representative materials. Other visually compatible materials may be allowed in combination with these materials.
 - ii. Residential buildings, other than mixed-use buildings, should be sided with stone, masonry, stucco or clapboards. Other visually compatible materials may be allowed in combination with these materials. Clapboards should be made of wood or high quality synthetic materials that resemble wood, and should have a visible width of no more than 5 inches. Upper stories may be sided with wood shingles or high quality synthetic shingles that resemble wood.
6. Openings Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
- a. Visual compatibility may depend on factors such as size, shape, style, proportion, materials and placement, as well as the patterns created by door and window openings on visible facades.
 - b. On commercial and mixed-use buildings:
 - i. Upper floor window openings should be vertically oriented and regularly spaced.
 - ii. First floor window patterns should reflect historically representative patterns.
 - iii. Window glass should be transparent.
 - iv. Kick panels under first floor windows should feature design details and high quality stone, masonry or other historically representative materials.
 - v. First floor windowsills should be at least 18 inches and not more than 36 inches above grade.
7. Site Features Guidelines. The following guidelines apply to the Lower Williamson Street Corridor:
- a. Vehicle parking for commercial, mixed-use, and multi-unit residential buildings should meet the following guidelines:
 - i. Parking spaces should be located underground or within enclosed parking structures if possible.

- ii. Parking structures should comply with relevant standards for other structures, and should not detract from the character of the historic district.
 - iii. Parking should be screened from street view and accessed from side streets or alleys to the maximum extent feasible.
 - iv. If a parking entrance is incorporated into a street façade, it should be as inconspicuous as possible and should be visually compatible with the street façade and block face.
 - v. Surface parking, if any, should be located behind the building and should share access with adjoining buildings if possible.
 - vi. Subject to traffic engineering requirements, access drives to open parking areas should not be wider than 10 feet for parking areas with 12 or fewer parking stalls, or 18 feet for parking areas with more than 12 stalls.
- (b) **New Accessory Structures.** A new accessory structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(b) of this Chapter. and the following Guidelines. The following Guidelines also apply.
- 1. An accessory structure should not exceed 15 feet in height, and should be located in the rear yard if possible.
 - 2. Siding on an accessory structure should be visually compatible with that on the primary structure.
 - 3. The roof of an accessory structure should have a roof pitch and shape similar to the roof pitch and shape of the primary structure. Roofing material should be visually compatible with that on the primary structure.
- (c) **New Signs.** A sign constructed on a lot in a historic district shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(c) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.
- 1. Commercial and mixed-use buildings.
 - a. Sign bands should be included, as appropriate.
 - b. Externally illuminated signs are preferred over internally illuminated signs. Exterior illumination should originate from gooseneck or other unobtrusive, downward-facing fixtures.
 - c. Internal sign illumination, if any, should be appropriately subdued and should illuminate only characters or letters – not background.
 - d. Sign colors should complement building and awning colors.

(4) University Heights Historic District

- (a) **New Primary Structures.** A new primary structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(a) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.
- 1. **Size Guidelines.**
 - a. New primary structures located in a TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, TR-V1, or TR-V2 zoning district should not exceed 35 feet in height and should not exceed 2.5 stories.
 - b. New primary structures located in a TR-U1, NMX, TSS, or LMX zoning district should not exceed 40 feet in height.
 - c. New primary structures located in a TR-U2 zoning district should not exceed 50 feet in height.
 - d. New primary structures should be at least 15 feet in height.
 - e. The street facade area of a new primary structure should be no greater than 125 percent of the average street façade area of historic resources located within 200 feet of the new primary structure. This does not apply to a multi-unit residential structure whose street facade includes adequate setback variations, such that the street façade appears to repeat the proportions and rhythm of the block face and of historic resources located within 200 feet of the structure.
 - 2. **Roof Guidelines.**
 - a. Appropriate roofing materials include tile, slate, sawn wood shingles, and asphalt shingles.
 - b. Inappropriate roofing materials include thick wood shakes, Dutch lap shingles, French method shingles and interlock shingles.
 - c. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel, and like roofing materials are inappropriate except on flat roofs.

3. Exterior Walls Guidelines.

- a. Appropriate siding materials include brick, horizontal wood clapboards whose exposed width is no more than 4 inches, stone, stucco and smooth shingles.
- b. High quality synthetic clapboard siding, such as aluminum or vinyl siding, may be used if its exposed width is no more than 4 inches.
- c. Inappropriate siding materials include concrete block, clapboards with an exposed width of more than 4 inches, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, and shakes.
- d. Siding combinations should be reasonably consistent with combinations prevalent on historic resources in the historic district (e.g., brick on the first floor and clapboard on second floor of single-family residences).

4. Openings Guidelines.

- a. Visual compatibility of windows, doors and related features may depend on factors such as size, shape, style, proportion, materials and placement, as well as the patterns created by door and window openings on visible facades.

5. Features and Systems Guidelines.

- a. Rescue platforms and fire escapes:
 - i. Should not be located on street facades.
 - ii. Should not be located on visible facades if city codes allow the use of automatic combustion products detection and alarm systems in place of rescue platforms and fire escapes.
 - iii. Should be as unobtrusive as possible.

6. Site Features Guidelines.

- a. New Parking Areas. Parking areas for more than 2 vehicles are prohibited unless they are accessory to a commercial or multi-unit residential structure on the same lot. Parking areas should be as inconspicuous as possible, and should be appropriately placed and screened to make them visually compatible with the historic district.

Changed "shalls" to "shoulds".

- (b) New Accessory Structures. A new accessory structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(b) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.

- 1. New accessory structures should be confined to rear yards, and should not exceed 15 feet in height.
- 2. An accessory structure should be visually compatible with the primary structure with respect to relevant factors identified under par. (a).
- 3. Roofing and siding materials for secondary structures should conform to guidelines for primary structures under pars. (a)5. and 6.

Note: These section references would need to be updated to ensure they refer back to the correct citation.

- (c) New Signs. A sign constructed on a lot in a historic district shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(c) of this Chapter.

(5) Marquette Bungalows Historic District

- (a) New Primary Structures. A new primary structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(a) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.

- 1. A new primary structure should be visually compatible with the prevailing bungalow style of the historic district, and shall match that style to the maximum extent feasible.

Changed "shalls" to "shoulds".

2. Site Features Guidelines.

a. Fences.

- i. Front yard fences should be visually compatible with the primary structure and with the bungalow style of the historic district. Front yard fences should be no more than 3 feet tall.

Changed "shall" and "may" to "shoulds".

ii. Chain link fences, metal mesh fences, and rustic style fences such as rough sawn wood or split-rail fences are not appropriate in front yards.

(b) New Accessory Structures. A new accessory structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(b) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.

1. It shall be visually compatible with the primary structure to which it pertains, and with the prevailing bungalow style of the historic district.
2. It shall be located in the rear yard, and shall be as inconspicuous as reasonably possible, when viewed from a developed public right-of-way.
3. It shall not exceed 15 feet in height.
4. Siding on garages and other accessory structures should match the appearance of siding on the primary structure, to the maximum extent feasible.
5. Garage door designs should be consistent with the bungalow style of the historic district. Horizontally paneled and flat paneled garage doors are inappropriate.
6. Windows and pedestrian doors on garages and other accessory structures should be similar in style and proportion to historically representative windows and doors on the primary structure.
7. The roof of a garage or other accessory structure should be visually compatible in shape, style and appearance with that of the primary structure. Single slope roofs are inappropriate. Roofing materials should match the appearance of roofing materials on the primary structure, to the maximum extent feasible.

Changed "shalls" to "shoulds" in 1-3.

(c) New Signs. A sign constructed on a lot in a historic district shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(c) of this Chapter.

(6) First Settlement Historic District

(a) New Primary Structures. A new primary structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(a) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.

1. Façade Articulation Guidelines.

- a. Street facades should be modulated with porches or setbacks on the first floor level.
- b. Street facades should reflect the proportions, rhythm and directional expression of historic resource facades on the block face.
- c. The main entrance to a structure should be on the street facade, and it should be inset or projected from the plane of the street facade.
- d. On street facade entrances to single-family residential structures, covered porches are encouraged.

2. Roof Guidelines.

- a. Flat roofs are allowed if they meet the visual compatibility standard under par. (a)5.
- b. Pitched roofs should have a pitch of not less than 4-in-12.
- c. Pitched roofs may be shingled with asphalt shingles, or with fiberglass or other composition shingles that resemble asphalt shingles. Sawn wood shingles and other materials are not recommended, but are allowed if they meet the visual compatibility standard under par. (a)5. Thick wood shakes are inappropriate.
- d. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes and like materials are inappropriate, except on flat roofs.
- e. Roof vents should be as inconspicuous as possible, and should match the roof color.

Note: These section references would need to be updated to ensure they refer back to the correct citation.

3. Exterior Walls Guidelines.

- a. Stucco panel, concrete block and pebbledash siding materials are inappropriate.
- b. High quality synthetic clapboard siding may be used if all of the following apply:
 - i. The siding and related elements such as j-channel trim are visually compatible in color, sheen, and other respects with the historic district and with each historic resource located within 200 feet of the primary structure.

- ii. The siding is the highest grade offered by the manufacturer.
- iii. The gauge of the siding is at least .042.
- iv. The siding does not have a false wood grain.
- v. The visible width of the clapboard does not exceed 4 inches.

4. Openings Guidelines.

- a. Window styles and trim on residential structures should be similar in appearance to historically representative styles and trim found other residential structures in the district.
- b. Windows and doors on residential structures should be inset at least one inch from the exterior trim.
- c. Vehicle doors on attached garages should be located on side or rear facades to the maximum extent feasible. A one-car garage door may be located on the street facade if it is not feasible to locate it on another facade.

5. Site Features Guidelines.

a. Fences and Retaining Walls.

- 1. Chain link and rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split rails, may not be installed in front yards.
- 2. Retaining walls in front yards may not be constructed of railroad ties, landscape timbers, boulders, or plain concrete blocks. Retaining walls in front yards may be constructed of flagstone, wall stone, high quality concrete blocks that closely resemble natural stone, or other natural or natural-appearing materials. Poured concrete walls up to 2 feet high, having a smooth rubbed finish, are also allowed.

(b) New Accessory Structures. A new accessory structure shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(b) of this Chapter. The following Guidelines also apply.

- 1. New accessory structures may not exceed 15 feet in height, and should be as unobtrusive as possible.
- 2. Siding on a new accessory structure should be visually compatible with that used on the primary structure.
- 3. The roof of a new accessory structure should have a pitch and style similar to the roof of the primary structure. Roof materials shall match the appearance of roof materials on the primary structure.
- 4. Windows and pedestrian doors on an accessory structure should be similar in style, proportion and appearance to those on the primary structure.
- 5. Vehicle doors on garages should be visually compatible with the primary structure.
- 6. Vehicle doors on garages should have flat surfaces or approximately square panels. Garage doors with horizontal panels are inappropriate.
- 7. Garage door windows should consist of arrays of multiple small panes, such as the 6-pane arrays (3 panes across and 2 panes high) commonly found on garages from the 1920s.

<p><i>Changed "shalls" to "shoulds" in 1-5.</i></p>

(c) New Signs. A sign constructed on a lot in a historic district shall comply with all standards in Section (1)(c) of this Chapter.