

AGENDA # 5

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 9/14/20

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2020

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 9/17/20

ID NUMBER: 58738

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Richard Arnesen, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor. Excused was Betty Banks.

SUMMARY:

Bailey said that staff recommends a finding of no known historic value for 5201 Old Middleton Road, 4606 Hammersley Road, and 5098 Voges Road.

Bailey said that the buildings owned by UW-Madison at 6101 Mineral Point Road and 5707 Mineral Point Road have great historic integrity, but neither are at a level of significance to become landmarks. She explained that both properties have agricultural history, as well as scientific history related to the Wisconsin Veterinary Diagnostic Laboratory.

Martin said that as a longtime west side resident, she has a personal affinity toward 5707 Mineral Point Road, but understands the proposed demolition. Kaliszewski said the building has incredibly good integrity, including original windows, and she was shocked the applicants were allowed to demolish it.

Bailey said that there will be a technical demolition of the building at 7601 Mineral Point Road where the recent additions will be removed and the older portion of the building will be kept and reincorporated into the new development. She said that the building is part of the vernacular context, but because the applicants are salvaging and reusing the historic resources, she doesn't think its history is in danger.

Kaliszewski said that she hopes the applicants end up retaining and moving the farmhouse at 7601 Mineral Point Road as they have proposed.

Bailey began discussion of the properties at 803 South Shore Drive and 2012 Waunona Way, which have archaeological resources associated with them. She said that traditionally, the location of archaeology on a property is not disclosed to the public in order to help protect the resources; however, not discussing it at all contributes to the erasure of Native history associated with those properties. She said there are a lot of known sites in the Madison area, but we are largely not talking about them publicly; if we know about histories related to these properties, perhaps we should say something about it as the commission tasked with preserving, identifying, and telling stories related to cultural resources. She said that the property at 803 South Shore Drive is located within the boundary of the Lakeside Street Camps, a prehistoric Ho-Chunk village or campsite, and she recommended that the applicants reach out to the State Historic Preservation Office to find out if they will need a Request to Disturb. She said that the property at 2012 Waunona Way is within the boundary of the Icaria mound site, which is significant to the Ho-Chunk people, and will require a Request to Disturb. She

recommended the commission discuss the cultural significance of the mounds and note that the sites warrant careful consideration during redevelopment in their finding.

Martin thanked Bailey for the care she has taken in this situation to balance keeping the sites anonymous in order to protect them while also realizing there is a potential erasure of history. She said that she was concerned about the sites and asked if they could emphasize more that the buildings may not have historic value, but the overall site has extremely significant historic value. She suggested that in these situations with archaeological resources, they should consider how to move forward in the future and potentially speak to tribes about it.

Andrzejewski suggested they recommend consultation with the Tribal Historic Preservation Office. Martin said that she'd like to use the strongest language they can because the mound sites warrant the utmost caution. She said that this situation has shown there is a gap in what one is allowed to do in terms of building on a site that is within the boundaries of a significant heritage site. She said that for the future, she'd like to work on an ordinance solution that will protect these sites, but the Landmarks Commission needs to do as much as they can in their advisory role to make sure whoever is demolishing or putting up new buildings is acutely aware of what resides on their land and there might be issues. She said that these are significant places to the original inhabitants of this land, and their descendants are still here and feel a responsibility to protect the mound sites, which are the burial sites of their ancestors. Andrzejewski agreed with Martin and pledged to help research and work on ordinance language. McLean said that he understands Martin's concerns and agreed about using stronger language in their recommendation. He asked if they could include directional information, and Bailey said she tried to include something that identified what the property is known as without getting into too many details that might endanger the resources.

Martin thanked Bailey for the work she has done in bringing up considerations the commission is now thinking about and discussing, which brought up the blind spot that City policy has around historic preservation. She said it is a really important issue, which has been made apparent with their discussions regarding both tribal consultation and demolition reviews tonight. She said that she is happy they are having these discussions and as a member of the Ho-Chunk Nation, she appreciated the care staff has given to this.

ACTION:

A motion was made by Arnesen, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 5201 Old Middleton Road, 4606 Hammersley Road, and 5098 Voges Road have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Martin, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 6101 Mineral Point Road and 5707 Mineral Point Road have historic value related to the Madison's agricultural history and scientific history, and the building at 7601 Mineral Point Road has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.

A motion was made by Martin, seconded by Arnesen, to recommend to the Plan Commission that although the buildings at 803 South Shore Drive and 2012 Waunona Way have no known historic value, the sites are culturally significant and warrant careful consideration during redevelopment. The Landmarks Commission strongly recommends consultation with the Ho-Chunk Nation Tribal Preservation Office. The motion passed by voice vote/other.