

## AGENDA # 11

City of Madison, Wisconsin

---

REPORT OF: LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PRESENTED: 5/4/20

TITLE: Buildings Proposed for Demolition - 2020

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: 5/12/20

ID NUMBER: 58738

---

Members present were: Anna Andrzejewski, Katie Kaliszewski, Arvina Martin, David McLean, and Maurice Taylor. Excused were: Richard Arnesen and Betty Banks.

### **SUMMARY:**

*Rowan Davidson, registering in support and wishing to speak*

*Angie Black, registering in support and wishing to speak*

*J. Randy Bruce, registering in support and available to answer questions*

*Sofia Brichford, registering in opposition and available to answer questions*

*Amelia Brichford, registering in opposition and not wishing to speak*

*Ann Waidelich, registering in opposition and not wishing to speak*

Bailey explained that on March 9, she filed a report with a finding of no known historic value for the project at 36 West Towne Mall so the project could move forward with the Plan Commission.

Bailey provided a list of properties that staff assessed to have no known historic value, including 4201 N Sherman Avenue, 160 Westgate Mall, 1837 Aberg Avenue, 1825 Aberg Avenue, 1818 Packers Avenue, 1814 Packers Avenue, 1802 Packers Avenue, 133 E Lakeside Street, 2812 E Johnson Street, 2902 E Washington Avenue, and 401 North Lawn Avenue.

**A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 4201 N Sherman Avenue, 160 Westgate Mall, 1837 Aberg Avenue, 1825 Aberg Avenue, 1818 Packers Avenue, 1814 Packers Avenue, 1802 Packers Avenue, 133 E Lakeside Street, 2812 E Johnson Street, 2902 E Washington Avenue, and 401 North Lawn Avenue have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

Bailey began discussion on the properties at 9 N Hancock Street, 408 E Washington Avenue, 410 E Washington Avenue, 414 E Washington Avenue, 8 N Franklin Street, and 12 N Franklin Street. She referenced a report by Gary Tipler as well as a historical assessment of the properties provided by the applicant and their consultants, Legacy Architecture. Rowan Davidson, Legacy Architecture, explained that they worked with Knothe and Bruce to complete research on the properties proposed for demolition and found additional information. He explained that August Pfund was associated with the house at 9 N Hancock, but any significant resource associated with his life would be more appropriately located in Baltimore, which is where he spent his adult life. He said that 408 E Washington Avenue was originally Scheibel Florist, but the rear greenhouse no longer exists and the remaining house is obscured by additions. Regarding 410 E Washington Avenue, the Fruitschi house, he said that there are two places of business in Madison that may better represent the history

of this notable family in Madison. Regarding the question of whether this property could be a Claude and Starck design, he said that it does not seem likely based on his research. He said that the architecture of the seven buildings, most of which are currently apartments, is generally in poor condition with significant alterations and replacement materials on the exterior.

Angie Black introduced herself as part of the development team and spoke about the site's zoning designation and the Downtown Plan. She said that all of the parcels proposed for demolition are zoned UMX, which was intended to provide the opportunity for high-density residential and office uses. She said that the Downtown Plan also places the site in the downtown core, which is recommended for the highest intensity of development within the city. One of the Downtown Plan's key recommendations is to accommodate future growth within the downtown. The process of creating the Downtown Plan included an analysis of downtown parcels, and she pointed out that none of the parcels in question were considered historic or deemed a landmark. She said that the resulting parcel analysis map in the Downtown Plan specifically identifies this site as an underutilized site and/or obsolete building, and it is one of the few available sites identified in the Downtown Plan for potential redevelopment to accommodate the city's growth. With those considerations, she said that the Downtown Plan designates the entire site for infill redevelopment; demolishing the current low-density rental buildings to develop a multi-story mixed-use residential and commercial building is compatible with the intended use of the property within the city's UMX zoning district and Downtown Plan. She said that adding density on this site eases the need for the demolition of houses in adjacent neighborhoods and adds additional residential units downtown. She said that the demolition and redevelopment of the site will continue the orderly development and improvement of the E Washington Avenue corridor, which contains similar multi-level mixed-use buildings, as well as complement the continued office and commercial uses on the Capitol Square and support the multiple Metro Transit routes and future Bus Rapid Transit lines that will run along the corridor directly in front of this project.

Kaliszewski said that she thinks these properties solidly fit demolition criterion "B." She said that it is very disappointing to see the demolition of an entire block. She said that the existing buildings have stood for 100 years and what is being built is likely not going to stand for 100 years; however, the buildings are not significant in their own right and therefore she understands and is okay with the demolition. Andrzejewski added that these buildings certainly contribute to the historic and cultural context of Madison, but due to condition and change, they are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 9 N Hancock Street, 408 E Washington Avenue, 410 E Washington Avenue, 414 E Washington Avenue, 8 N Franklin Street, and 12 N Franklin Street have historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

Bailey provided background information on the properties at 316 Russell Street, 1937 Winnebago Street, 1941 Winnebago Street, 1947 Winnebago Street, and 1949 Winnebago Street. She said that Planning staff recently attended a neighborhood meeting regarding this development, and neighbors had some historic preservation concerns. Kaliszewski said that the properties fit demolition criterion "B" and are important to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, particularly the small commercial part of Madison's history. However, she said that the buildings are not individually architecturally significant and don't rise to the level of suggesting that they shouldn't be demolished. Andrzejewski agreed and said that while they are still clearly readable as a historic streetscape, there have been a lot of changes to the buildings so integrity could be an issue as well.

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Martin, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 316 Russell Street, 1937 Winnebago Street, 1941 Winnebago Street, 1947 Winnebago Street, and 1949 Winnebago Street have historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

Bailey explained that the buildings at 824 E Main Street and 825 E Washington Avenue are proposed for demolition for a new Moxy hotel development on the site. She said that 824 E Main Street is a Trachte building and pointed out that next door, there are multiple Trachte buildings that are currently undergoing rehabilitation and adaptive reuse as an event venue. She said that the neighboring Trachtes retain more of the historic character of early Trachte buildings than the one at 824 E Main Street. She said that the building at 825 E Washington Avenue was the longtime home of the Madison Fireproof Warehouse Company and pointed out the painted "Storage" sign on the front of the building. Andrzejewski said that she loves Trachte buildings, but she is unconvinced of when the commission will start saying that their significance fits demolition criterion "C." McLean said that 824 E Main Street has slight historic value because of its namesake.

**A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 824 E Main Street has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

Kaliszewski asked if the storage building at 825 E Washington Avenue was built for the Madison Fireproof Warehouse Company, and Bailey confirmed that for most of its time up until recently, the building was owned by one owner who operated the Madison Fireproof Warehouse Company. Kaliszewski asked if that business or owner was particularly important in the city of Madison. Bailey said that she had no additional context, but it was an early indoor storage business where one could store things if they were worried it would burn in their wood house, as the storage building was considered fireproof. She said that the storage business expanded in 1951 to include moving vans. Andrzejewski asked about the integrity of the building. Bailey said that it has had some tough interventions; there are elements that can still convey its historic associations, but the street level has had a lot of changes. She said that in particular, as a building used for storage purposes, the large bays that would have opened for trucks to drive in are largely obscured, so some key components that would convey the historic association are missing.

Kaliszewski said that the building fit demolition criterion "B." She explained that it is a nice vernacular building that has had some obvious alterations to its façade but is a nice addition to the vernacular of Madison; however, it does not rise to the level of significance to fit criterion "C," and she does not have concerns about its potential demolition. McLean agreed and said that he liked the interesting history in that when houses used to burn down easily, this is where people kept their stuff, so the building can speak to the history of Madison and the surrounding area in that regard. Andrzejewski asked if McLean thought it had an interesting history, but that the building didn't necessarily need to remain to convey that history, and McLean agreed.

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 825 E Washington Avenue has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

### **ACTION:**

**A motion was made by Taylor, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 4201 N Sherman Avenue, 160 Westgate Mall, 1837 Aberg Avenue, 1825 Aberg Avenue, 1818 Packers Avenue, 1814 Packers Avenue, 1802 Packers Avenue, 133 E Lakeside Street, 2812 E Johnson Street, 2902 E Washington Avenue, and 401 North Lawn Avenue have no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 9 N Hancock Street, 408 E Washington Avenue, 410 E Washington Avenue, 414 E Washington Avenue, 8 N Franklin Street, and 12 N Franklin Street have historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by Martin, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the buildings at 316 Russell Street, 1937 Winnebago Street, 1941 Winnebago Street, 1947 Winnebago Street, and 1949 Winnebago Street have historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the buildings themselves are not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by McLean, seconded by Kaliszewski, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 824 E Main Street has no known historic value. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**

**A motion was made by Kaliszewski, seconded by McLean, to recommend to the Plan Commission that the building at 825 E Washington Avenue has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant. The motion passed by voice vote/other.**