PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

January 13, 2020



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name & Address:	944 Williamson Street
Application Type(s):	Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district
Legistar File ID #	<u>58867</u>
Prepared By:	Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared:	January 7, 2020
Summary	
Project Applicant/Contact:	Timothy Niemiec, LaMacchia Group
Requested Action:	The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for an exterior remodel and installation of drive thru lanes.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located at 944 Williamson Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) <u>Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District Parcels Zoned for</u> <u>Residential Use</u>.
 - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to remodel the existing building by modifying the façade to include interior drive-through access to serve an adaptive reuse of the commercial structure, which is located on a corner lot that fronts onto Williamson St. The existing building was constructed in 1987 and is outside of the period of significance for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District, which is 1850-1929.

The proposal would alter the rear-most storefront on the northeast façade of the building (which faces S Brearly St) to include the two new drive-through bays. The drive access will come out on the southwest side of the building, which is a side elevation, significantly stepped back from Williamson St. To accommodate the new drive access through the building, the applicant is proposing some curbs and landscaping. The proposal will incorporate salvaged masonry from the existing building, with any new masonry to match the existing.

The form of the parapet will remain the same with some replacement of existing materials in-kind. The numerous light fixtures on the street façades are proposed to be removed and the replacement wall signs to be internally illuminated. While the large number of goose-neck light fixtures could be reduced, staff believes that the wall signage should continue to be indirectly illuminated rather than shift to being internally illuminated. The existing metal canopy on the southeast façade will remain, the one on the southwest façade (not street facing) will be removed, and the fabric canopies elsewhere will be replaced in-kind.

Of the window and door openings, on the northeast façade (a street façade), the applicant is proposing to replace remaining existing aluminum-framed new aluminum windows containing vision glass, with the exception of two windows to be modified to include spandrel glass, one with a night deposit box. The current central pedestrian access on the northeast façade will be modified to incorporate an ATM. The southeast façade (a street façade) is proposed to have the windows replaced in-kind. The southwest façade (not street facing) is proposed to have one door filled in with CMU to match the existing.

There will be modifications to the existing utility meters, but all of those are located on façades that do not face the street.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) <u>Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District Parcels Zoned for</u> <u>Residential Use</u>.
 - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height. No changes proposed in the height.
 - (ii) Landscape treatment. The current site is sparsely landscaped the new proposal would introduce more vegetation, which would make the site more in keeping with the character of the other properties in the vicinity.
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces. This commercial property functions very differently from other properties in the vicinity. The proposal largely maintains the exterior mass of the building, but fills the adjacent surface parking area with more landscaping, which would make the site more compatible with other properties in the district.
 - b) The rhythm of solids and voids on the street facades is largely remaining the same, with the exception of the secondary storefront located on the S. Brearly (northeast) side of

the building. This is significantly stepped back from the primary façade and the building is not a historic resource.

- c) The alterations to the street facades is largely retaining the existing materials (brick, glass windows with aluminum frames, fabric and metal awnings).
- d) The roof is not proposed to be altered and the parapets on the street façades will retain their form.
- e) The proposal largely retains the window and door sizes. The new ATM will utilize a former pedestrian entrance in a way where it can be returned to an entrance in the future. The secondary store-front that faces S. Brearly is proposed to have a different configuration. However, this is significantly stepped back from the primary façade and this is not a historic resource.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommend that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following condition:

1. Future sign package to be approved by staff with the stipulation that wall signs continue to have indirect illumination