

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

December 9, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 417 Cantwell Court

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for an addition and new construction in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [58350](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: December 5, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Seth Statz, Seth Statz Construction

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an addition and a new garage structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located at 417 Cantwell Court in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) Gross Volume.
 - (b) Height.
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 - (d) Materials used in the street facades.
 - (e) The design of the roof.
 - (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
 - (g) Directional expression.
 - (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
 - (i) Landscape treatment.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new addition and construction of a new garage structure. The Landmarks Commission previously approved the demolition of the existing garage on December 17, 2018, and approved a new garage that was 18' x 24' with a 6'-wide covered porch along the side. The applicant has decided to submit a different building design for the new garage and would also like to include a rear addition on the house as part of the new proposal.

The new garage design appears to meet the historic district standards and is a style that is more typical of garages in the vicinity. The new garage is proposed as 22' x 22' (there is a discrepancy on the site plan included in the submission showing it as 22' x 24'). The proposed garage doors would be the arched top overlay Ashburn style with no windows, false hardware, or faux wood-grain texture. The siding would be smooth vinyl with a 4" exposure, which is similar to the cladding on the house. The windows are proposed as aluminum clad, one-over-one double hung windows, which is similar to the windows found on the house. There is not a product sheet for the proposed pedestrian door.

Similarly the proposed single-story, gabled addition to the rear (northeast) of the house would have 4" exposure, smooth vinyl siding with a vinyl band board located at under the roof eave and crossing the gable end, and then 3" exposure smooth vinyl siding located in the gable end. The proposed door and single side light would not be a typical configuration for the front of house, but is of a style that would be acceptable on the rear of a house. Door and side light specifications are not provided, but the window would be the same as those proposed for the garage. The addition would be 10' x 11.5'.

In discussions with the application, the proposed shingle style does not meet current Landmarks standards and they will be submitted updated specifications for future approval.

The property is known as the Clarence F. Greene Residence was constructed in 1917 and it is one of several Sears catalog homes on the street. The garages for the houses on the north side of Cantwell Ct. are located behind the principal structure and front onto S Thornton Ave. Most garages are simple gable-front structures.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT

- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
- (a) The proposed garage is in keeping with the size of garages within 200' of the subject property.
 - (b) The proposed garage meets Zoning height standards and is a shallow gabled single story, which is in keeping with the height of the majority of garages facing S. Thornton.
 - (c) The garage does front onto a street and the two doors proposed for the front of the garage are in keeping with the style of the original garage and on the other garages on that street segment.
 - (d) The materials of the other garages are either wood or vinyl with a clapboard appearance, just like the proposed new garage.
 - (e) The roof of the proposed garage will be in keeping with the shallow front gable style of the other garages and the original garage.
 - (f) The garage will replace an existing garage and retain the rhythm of street-facing garages on S. Thornton.
 - (g) The proposed garage will mimic the directional expression of the other garages on the street segment.
 - (h) The garages are all simple, clapboard buildings. The proposed garage door will obviously be new but still in keeping with the character of the buildings in the vicinity. The introduction of the arched overlay will identify this as a new garage, provide a reference to the arched motif on the front porch of the principal structure, but is still simple in its expression. The other materials are in keeping with the style of the other building on the property and of the other properties in the vicinity.
 - (i) The replacement garage will be located in the same place as the current garage.
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height: The height of the rear addition is in line with the additions to other houses in the vicinity. 429 Cantwell Ct. has a single-story gabled side addition and 1511 Williamson has a single-story gabled rear addition.
 - (ii) Landscape treatment: The rear addition is in keeping with the landscape treatment in the vicinity.
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces. By located an addition on the rear, this allows the historic building to retain its rhythm of masses and spaces as seen from the street.
 - (b) No proposed changes to the street façade of the principal structure.
 - (c) No proposed changes to the street façade of the principal structure.
 - (d) The existing building has a side-gabled roof with a gabled dormers. The rear addition is proposed to also have a gable roof.
 - (e) No proposed changes to the street façade of the principal structure.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new garage and an addition to the principal structure are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

- 1) Final garage pedestrian door specifications be approved by staff.
- 2) Final door and side light specifications for the addition be approved by staff.
- 3) Final roofing specifications for the garage and addition be approved by staff.