

City of Madison, Wisconsin

REPORT OF: URBAN DESIGN COMMISSION

PRESENTED: October 2, 2019

TITLE: 2340 S. Winnebago Street – New Development of a 4-Story Mixed-Use Building Containing 38 Residential Units and 21,000 Square Feet of Commercial Space for Red Caboose Day Care. 6th Ald. Dist. (56728)

REFERRED:

REREFERRED:

REPORTED BACK:

AUTHOR: Janine Glaeser, Secretary

ADOPTED:

POF:

DATED: October 2, 2019

ID NUMBER:

Members present were: Cliff Goodhart, Chair; Christian Harper, Rafeeq Asad, Lois Braun-Oddo, Jessica Klehr, Shane Bernau and Craig Weisensel.

SUMMARY:

At its meeting of October 2, 2019, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL** of a new development located at 2340 S. Winnebago Street. Appearing on behalf of the project were Kevin Burow, representing Knothe & Bruce Architects, LLC; Katherine Beaton, representing Saiki Design; Dave Porterfield and Megan Schuetz, both representing Movin’ Out, Inc.

Burow reviewed the site location, context and orientation, with vehicular access off of E. Washington Avenue and main entries on Winnebago Street. The overall landscape plan shows foundation plantings around the perimeter, additional plantings around the parking area, and the addition of deciduous and ornamental trees. Perspective views looking down E. Washington Avenue show the existing single-family home to remain adjacent to the site. The four-story building steps back at the fourth floor by 10-feet and by 5-feet on the Winnebago side. Two townhomes have direct entries (WHEDA requires 6 direct entries), there is an exit stair tower from the apartments above and 6 units have direct entry on 6th Street. The red accent color and banding will be used to identify Red Caboose, with a brown tone canopy above the residential entries. To create a more residential scale and feel they provided half walls on the porches instead of an aluminum railing. The red accent color that was originally on the inside of the alcoves has been replaced with a brown accent color, and kept the red band at the masonry element all the way around the building.

The Commission discussed the following:

- It’s improved from last time. I still think some façades are cohesive and others random. Highlighting the entrances with the red, I don’t know if painting above the canopy is necessary. I don’t know if having it recessed is powerful enough. On the other side of the building you bring the brown to break up the brick, but on the other side you introduced a new material instead of bringing the brown around. You don’t need both, either highlight those areas in the gold or continue to have the brown connect the top and bottom of the building.

- That upper façade is stepped back.
- I really like the improvement you made. I like how the red kind of weaves around the building and how you bring it together at the play area. Is there a possibility for more trees on the easement side of the lot or is that City responsibility?
 - We're waiting for feedback from staff, we made our land use submittal and go to Plan Commission in two weeks.
- I see stone mulch listed.
 - That's the lining play area.
- Looking at the northwest and northeast, with the color combinations, the gold is more of a setback or accent in the brick. The brick and red go really well together, but the gold is different patterning, why isn't that brick?
 - The main reason is because of the structure and loading of the brick on what isn't the foundation, because the second floor is stepped back to create a larger outdoor patio space. We needed a lighter weight material and didn't want a look alike material.
- The way you handled the red around the daycare portion of the building is really nice. I like this horizontal canopy. I still think the red band up above is a little weird, the rest of the material palette on the building is timeless and works really well together. Something about the red and the fact that it's almost perfectly centered around the building still strikes me as odd. The one plant comment I have is the Barberry, it's not the best pick and could easily be swapped for some other small scale shrub.
- You took out too much of the red. The banding is really strong and a nice unifying element, but it gets lost at the southeast elevation at the stair tower. It strikes me as all of the sudden different window sizes and proportions. Looking at the southeast the southwest, I appreciate you receded a bit to the daycare entry and made it red all the way to the top, but I don't understand the other entry receding and using red.
 - We wanted it more playful because it is lining that playground area.
- I think it's just right myself.
- You mentioned two story balconies, is that just facing E. Washington?
 - They're two-story units with the balcony on the lower level. If the bedrooms had balconies they would have three of them.
- I concur about the Barberry. If you want something of that color, the switch grass there, tall sedums or bigger dwarf Ninebarks are burgundy-leaved. The Dervilla, Bush Honeysuckle and Hydrangeas, there are improved variety of those that are quite a bit better in a lot of different ways. I would encourage your landscape architect to look at those. It's a minimal cost to upgrade and probably worth it for a small planting area like this. I worry about the stuff on 6th Street getting enough sun.
- Private stairs might still be considered public-looking. On the 6th Street side, that's for two units, they go up to what looks like commercial windows adjacent. They look public still to me.
 - We could look at doing more of a stained wood door at the head of the stairs to create more of a residential character and feel.
- Maybe shift the door so it's not so centered.
- I do think the stair tower is a big deal with the blank wall.

ACTION:

On a motion by Braun-Oddo, seconded by Weisensel, the Urban Design Commission **GRANTED FINAL APPROVAL**. The motion was passed on a vote of (6-0). The motion provided for the following:

- Swap out Barberry for another small scale shrub.

- Look at using switch grass, tall sedums or bigger dwarf Ninebarks, as well as improved varieties of Honeysuckle and Hydrangea.
- Change the residential entry door color to look more like stained wood.
- Replace stone mulch with wood mulch.
- Consider changing the secondary daycare entrance to something other than red; keep the main recessed daycare entrance as red.