

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

September 16, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 303 South Paterson Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [57367](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: September 12, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Kris Warren – Donde LLC

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new window openings

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
- (a) Height
- (b) Alterations of street façade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids
- (c) Alterations of street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of roof shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to insert two new window openings on the front of the building and one on the back, all on the second story of the building. As a former tobacco warehouse, this building originally fronted to the railroad spur, which is no longer present. As a result the side of the building faces the street and the front of the building is oriented to the current parking lot. This building has had significant alterations over time. The most intensive interventions were the installation of the current metal siding, which was approved by the Landmarks Commission in the 1990s. The commission also approved installation of many new window openings at the time, but only some of those were installed.

The building's form and the style of porch on the front still allow it to convey its historic associations. The cladding of the building introduced challenges for the historic character of the building, and the introduction of these new window openings would not significantly increase that circumstance. The new window openings proposed would allow for the ongoing and adaptive use of the building, which featured irregular and infrequent window locations. The proposal places the windows in a manner that is in keeping with the alignment of the other windows on the second story. All of the windows have been previously replaced (also approved by the Landmarks Commission) and the style of the new windows would be in keeping with the dimensions of those existing windows.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance sections follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
- (a) N/A
- (b) N/A
- (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
- (d) Due to the extensive changes that have already occurred to the exterior of this building, the introduction of three new windows would seem to have a minimal impact to the current conservation of the building. However, the introduction of those three new windows would allow for the ongoing use of what has been a successful commercial space for the past three decades. As such, the proposed alteration would further the intent of this standard of "using" a historic resource.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) No proposed changes to the height of the building.
 - (b) The alteration would change the existing and the historical rhythm of solids and voids on the primary façade. However, the standard specifies street façade and the building is oriented so that its side faces the street. Even if we interpret the intent of this standard as primary façade, the building has had such significant changes over time, that the rhythm of solids and voids is not greatly altered by the introduction of the new windows. The proposal locates the new windows in a way that respects the rhythm of the openings on the second story.
 - (c) No changes to historic materials.
 - (d) No proposed changes to the roof.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the proposal as submitted.