

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

September 16, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 409 South Few Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [57313](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: September 12, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Belle Pleva – Paleo Mama Bakery

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a wall sign.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The size or design of the sign(s) would adversely affect the historic fabric of the structure or the district;
 - (b) The sign(s) fails to comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
 - (c) The sign(s) fails to comply with specific standards and guidelines for signs adopted in each historic district under this ordinance.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) Height
 - (b) Alterations of street façade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids
 - (c) Alterations of street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of roof shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new signage at their commercial building. The signage requested is located above the storefront, but below the corbelled parapet of the single-story building. The proposed sign would be constructed of aluminum with cut out aluminum lettering applied to the surface of the panel.

The sign is located in the appropriate location for building signage on this type of building. It is clearly of its time and is not seeking to create a false sense of history or a conjectural architectural feature.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
- (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) See discussion below for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District standards.
 - (d) The proposed alteration is not altering or destroying historic building fabric.
- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The design and placement of the sign clearly sets it apart from the historic building, while also being located in the space where historic signage would have been placed. It does not cover over architectural features and is of a proportion that it fits with where signage is designed to be located on this style of building.

- (b) Initial discussions with zoning staff are that this proposal will likely meet their requirements found in Chapter 31, MGO;
- (c) Third Lake Ridge does not have specific standards for signage, but the proposal appears to meet the other district standards.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (a) No proposed change to the height of the building.
 - (b) No alteration to the rhythm of solids to voids on the street façade.
 - (c) No changes to the historic materials is proposed. The new sign will be attached to the façade in a way that it can be removed in the future.
 - (d) No proposed changes to the roof.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are met and recommends the Landmarks Commission approve the project with the following condition:

1. All fasteners for the sign be installed in the mortar joints of the wall, not in the brick