PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

July 8, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: **462-466 North Baldwin Street** (2nd Aldermanic District, Alder Heck)

Application Type: Conditional Use

Legistar File ID #: 56129

Prepared By: Colin Punt, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Reviewed By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant: Brian Anderson; 462 N. Baldwin St.; Madison, WI 53703

Owner: Brian Anderson, 462 N. Baldwin St.; and Amy Squitieri, 466 N. Baldwin St.; Madison, WI 53703

Requested Action: Approval of a Conditional Use to allow construction of a shared accessory building exceeding 10% of the lot area at 462 North Baldwin Street.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to build a shared detached garage on 462 and 466 North Baldwin Street. The portion of the garage on 462 North Baldwin Street exceeds 10% of the area of that lot.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for conditional uses, MGO §28.183(6)), as §28.131(1)(a) requires conditional use approval for accessory buildings totaling more than 10% of lot area. §28.131(1)(f) provides further regulations for shared garages.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the conditional use standards are met and **approve** the requests to allow construction of an accessory building (shared garage) at 462-466 North Baldwin Street exceeding 10% of the lot area of 462 North Baldwin Street. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the Planning Division and other reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The two 4,000-square-foot properties are located on the southwest side of North Baldwin Street between Sherman Avenue to the north and Elizabeth Street to the south. It is located within Aldermanic District 2 (Alder Heck) and the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: According to assessor data, 462 North Baldwin Street is currently developed with a two-story, three-bedroom, two-bathroom, 1,200-square-foot single-family residence, originally constructed in 1942. There is a single-vehicle detached garage at the rear of the lot near the north property line. 466 North Baldwin Street is currently developed with a two-and-one-half-story, four-bedroom, two-bathroom, 2,044-square-foot single-family residence, originally constructed in 1914. There is a single-vehicle detached garage at the rear of the lot near the south property line. Both properties are zoned Traditional Residential – Consistent 3 (TR-C3) District.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

Northeast: Across North Baldwin Street, single-family residences, zoned Traditional Residential – Consistent 3 (TR-C3);

Southeast: Single-family residences, zoned TR-C3;

Southwest: Single-family residences and a two-unit house, zoned TR-C3; and

Northwest: Single-family residences, zoned TR-C3, and a small condominium building zoned Planned Development (PD) district beyond.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The Comprehensive Plan (2018) recommends low residential (LR) uses for the subject parcel, defined as one- and two-story house-like buildings with densities less than 16 dwelling units per acre. The Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan (2008) recommends a low-density residential designation. The neighborhood plan also recommends that detached garages be located behind the front façade of the house.

Zoning Summary: The property is in the Traditional Residential – Consistent 3 (TR-C3) District

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	3,000 sq. ft.	4,000 sq. ft.
Lot Width	30’	40’
Front Yard Setback	15’	Adequate
Side Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3’	0’ shared side 22’4” southeast side
Rear Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3’	3’
Usable Open Space	500 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	75%	Less than 75%
Maximum Building Height: Accessory Building	15’	13’ 6”

Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	Single-family detached dwelling: 1 (location only)	Detached shared garage
Building Forms	Not required	Accessory building

Other Critical Zoning Items:	Utility Easements

Table Prepared by Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description, Analysis, and Conclusion

The applicant requests approval of a conditional use to allow the construction of a shared detached garage at 462-466 North Baldwin Street, in which the portion of accessory building on 462 North Balwdiwn Street exceeds 10% of the lot area. The applicant proposes to remove existing single-stall garages on each lot and replace them with a single shared garage measuring 18’ x 26’ on 462 North Baldwin and 15’ x 22’ on 466 North Baldwin. A

common wall built on the lot line will divide the two segments. The 462 North Baldwin portion features a front gable, while the 466 North Baldwin portion has a side gable and is set back an additional two feet from the front lot line. Each side and the rear façade will have at least one window. Standard overhead garage doors are used on the street-facing façade. According to the applicant, the garage is proposed to be built with similar trim styles to match or complement 466 North Baldwin Street. The garage is planned to have a matching color scheme and similar lap siding and asphalt roofing as 466 North Baldwin Street. According to the applicant, the owners of the house at 462 North Baldwin Street intend to re-side the house in 2020 with siding and trim similar to the proposed garage. Proposed materials for the garage include engineered wood siding and trim and a gray asphalt shingles. The applicant also proposes to replace the existing driveways with new driveways on the lot line, eliminating the one-foot-wide gap between the existing driveways, which has created mud and ice issues in the past, according to the applicant.

This request is subject to the Conditional Use standards. MGO §28.131(1)(a) requires conditional use approval for accessory buildings totaling more than 10% of lot area. The portion of the proposed garage at 462 North Baldwin Street is 11.7% of the lot area. The portion at 466 North Baldwin is less than 10% of its lot area. The Plan Commission shall not approve a Conditional Use without due consideration of the City's adopted plan recommendations, design guidelines, and finding that all of the conditional use standards of MGO §28.183(6) are met.

In considering the adopted plan recommendation, the Planning Division believes that the proposed use is generally consistent with the Comprehensive Plan as well as the Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan. The Comprehensive Plan recommends low residential (LR) uses for the subject parcel, defined as house-like development with densities less than 16 dwelling units per acre. There is no proposed addition of density or change of use. The Tenney-Lapham Neighborhood Plan recommends a similar low-density residential land use as well as a recommendation that detached garages be set back from the house.

In considering the surrounding context, according to assessor data, three of the four lots adjacent to the two in question have two-vehicle detached garages. The fourth lot has a one-stall detached garage. Most of the detached garages on the block are located in the rear corners of their respective lots, often within current setback areas. Because of the general size and placement of detached garages on the block, Staff does not believe a situation in which three stalls shared in one building on two lots will be out of scale with the neighborhood. Further, because the single garage structure is shared between the properties, the proposal eliminates what would be six feet of "dead space" between the two garages, resulting in larger areas of contiguous useable space on each lot. The design of the building, colors, and materials are or will be consistent with the existing houses.

Staff does wish to call attention to condition #6, a major/non-standard condition provided by the Madison Fire Department. Because the proposed building crosses the property line, a fire wall with no openings is required along the property line. The building's structural framing is required to be independent on each side of the fire wall, which may need to extend through the roof with a parapet.

On balance, due to the design of the garage on the site and its integration with the subject properties and the character of the neighborhood, the Planning Division believes the conditional use standards could be found met.

At the time of report writing, staff is unaware of any comments from the public.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Colin Punt, (608) 243-0455)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the conditional use standards are met and **approve** the requests to allow construction of an accessory building (shared garage) at 462-466 North Baldwin Street exceeding 10% of the lot area of 462 North Baldwin Street. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the Planning Division and other reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Colin Punt, (608) 243-0455)

1. Label materials and colors on plan elevations.

Zoning (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

2. The property owners shall provide a joint access and maintenance agreement for the use of the garage.

City Engineering Division - Main Office (Contact Brenda Stanley, (608) 261-9127)

3. *4.9zz* Runoff from this area (or an equivalent roof area from the existing building) shall be directed to the ROW and away from the interior of the block (onto adjacent private property). This area has a interior block drainage issue and additional impervious area shall not be allowed to be directed toward this area.

City Engineering Division - Mapping (Contact Jeff Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

4. Provide a recorded copy of the party wall agreement allowing for the single garage structure to straddle the property line.

5. Provide a copy of a survey signed and sealed by a professional surveyor locating the property line over which the garage will be placed.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

6. The proposed location crosses a property line. A fire wall with no openings is required along the property line. Structural framing would be required to be independent on each side of the fire wall. The fire wall may need to extend through the roof with a parapet.