

CITY OF MADISON
INTER-DEPARTMENTAL
CORRESPONDENCE

DATE: June 25, 2019

TO: Landmarks Ordinance Review Committee (LORC)

FROM: Heather Bailey, Planning Division
Amy Scanlon, Engineering Division
Bill Fruhling, Planning Division

**SUBJECT: Discussion of Consultant's Recommendations (Legistar 54447)
Sample Chapter and Discussion Items – Agenda Item 3**

This memo was prepared to support the LORC's discussion of items listed under agenda item 3 for the June 25, 2019 meeting. This memo covers:

- Sample Chapter – Revised Organization
- Discussion Items
 - Definition of Requirements and Guidelines
 - Should buildings outside of the period of significance be treated differently?
 - Should accessory structures be reviewed with the same standards as principal structures?
 - Revisit New Construction General Standards section

After a review of the process to date, staff recommends that the Committee discuss these items and provide direction so that staff can continue to develop a revised draft version of the ordinance.

Sample Chapter – Revised Organization

Staff is proposing a revised organization so that establishes the following new sections (as opposed to aggregating them all into a single section):

- 41.xx Standards for Maintenance
- 41.xx Standards for Repairs
- 41.xx Standards for Alterations
- 41.xx Standards for Additions
- 41.xx Standards for New Structures

Each of these sections will have a consistent organizational structure with the following subsections:

- A. General
- B. Exterior Walls
- C. Roofs
- D. Windows and Doors
- E. Entrances and Porches
- F. Building Systems
- G. Building Site

Each of the subsections above would have requirements and guidelines as defined in the following section of this memo.

An EXAMPLE of how this revised organization could be applied to the new structures section is attached to this document for illustrative format purposes only—not for review of the ordinance language.

Action: Staff requests that the Committee discuss this revised organization and provide direction to staff before proceeding with drafting the ordinance in this format.

Definition of Requirements and Guidelines

At the April 10, 2019 meeting, the Committee directed staff to proceed with developing an ordinance format that would include clear requirements and guidelines. Pursuant to that direction, staff is proposing the following definitions:

Requirements - Any project subject to this ordinance shall meet all requirements.

Guidelines- Any project subject to this ordinance should refer to the guidelines for additional guidance and instruction that may be helpful in meeting the requirements and purpose and intent of this ordinance.

Action: Staff requests that the Committee discuss these definitions to ensure that they are consistent with the Committee's expectations before proceeding with drafting the ordinance in this format.

Should buildings outside of the period of significance be treated differently?

When reviewing projects under the current ordinance, the same standards generally apply to all properties within the district, regardless of date of construction. The Committee has contemplated whether the ordinance should treat buildings outside of the period of significance differently from those within the period of significance. This issue has been on the Committee's workplan as an item for future discussion. The Historic Preservation Ordinance identifies the following periods of significance for each district:

Mansion Hill:	1850-1930
Third Lake Ridge:	1850-1929
University Heights:	1893-1928
Marquette Bungalows:	1924-1930
First Settlement:	1850-1920

Action: Staff requests that the Committee discuss this issue and provide direction to staff to ensure that the Committee's expectations regarding this issue may be incorporated into the ordinance.

Should accessory structures be reviewed with the same standards as principal structures?

Another issue that has come up during the process, is whether accessory structures (such as detached garages or sheds) should be reviewed using the same standards as the principal structures. Some believe that all structures on a site are important and should have the standards applied equally, while others believe that accessory structures are less significant and should be governed by different standards. Under the current ordinance, accessory structures are covered in different ways in different districts.

Action: Staff requests that the Committee discuss this issue and provide direction to staff to ensure that the Committee's expectations regarding this issue may be incorporated into the ordinance.

Revisit New Construction General Standards section

To facilitate the Committee's initial discussion regarding the standards for new construction during the March 14, 2019 meeting, staff proposed a set of five general standards. These standards were intended to identify those aspects of a project that would guide decisions about whether a proposal was visually compatible with surrounding properties. To provide further definition and guidance for each, the proposal listed several items that could be taken into consideration when making a finding on each standard. The intent was to provide the Landmarks Commission and others with more specificity in interpreting those terms while allowing design flexibility in meeting the standards. The standards were meant to be holistic, with no one item overriding the others.

At the meeting, the Committee asked that staff take a look at uncoupling the individual items from each standard so that each project would have to meet each individual item, which would now become standards. Staff did explore that approach, which resulted in 19 individual standards. Staff believe this approach diminishes the review of a project to its component parts, instead of evaluating the relationships among them. The table on the following page compares staff's original (and current) recommendation on the left and the uncoupling of individual items as requested by the Committee on the right.

Action: Staff requests that the Committee discuss these approaches and provide direction to staff before proceeding with drafting this section of the ordinance.

Staff Proposal	LORC Potential Alternative
<p>A. General</p> <p>1. <u>Primary Structures</u>. Primary Structures. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:</p> <p>a. <u>Requirements</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. <u>Building Placement</u>. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site. ii. <u>Street Setback</u>. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures. iii. <u>Visual Size</u>. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade iv. <u>Building Form</u>. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression. v. <u>Architectural Expression</u>. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as the building’s modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade. <p>b. <u>Guideline</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. New primary structures should be of a similar architecture style as the primary structures in the historic district while clearly being a new building so as not to create a false sense of history. 	<p>A. General</p> <p>1. <u>Primary Structures</u>.</p> <p>a. <u>Requirements</u>. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. Lot coverage ii. Setbacks iii. Building orientation iv. Historic relationships between the building and site. v. Street Setback vi. Massing vii. Building height in feet and stories viii. Gross area of the front elevation ix. Street presence x. Dominant proportion of width to height in the façade xi. Building type and use xii. Roof shape xiii. Symmetry or asymmetry xiv. Dominant vertical or horizontal expression. xv. Building modulation xvi. Articulation xvii. Building planes xviii. Proportion of building elements xix. Rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade <p>b. <u>Guideline</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. New primary structures should be of a similar architecture style as the primary structures in the historic district while clearly being a new building so as not to create a false sense of history.

**THIS SECTION IS TO ILLUSTRATE A POTENTIAL ORDINANCE STRUCTURE AND NOT
PROPOSED ORDINANCE LANGUAGE.**

41.XX STANDARDS FOR THE REVIEW OF NEW STRUCTURES

A. General

1. Primary Structures. The design for a new structure in a historic district shall be visually compatible with other historic resources within two hundred (200) feet in the following ways:
 - a. Requirements
 - i. Building Placement. When determining visual compatibility for building placement, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as lot coverage, setbacks, building orientation, and historic relationships between the building and site.
 - ii. Street Setback. When determining visual compatibility for street setbacks, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as the average setback of historic resources on the same block face within two hundred (200) feet, and the setback of adjacent structures.
 - iii. Visual Size. When determining visual compatibility for visual size, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as massing, building height in feet and stories, the gross area of the front elevation (i.e., all walls facing the street), street presence, and the dominant proportion of width to height in the façade
 - iv. Building Form. When determining visual compatibility for building form, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as building type and use, roof shape, symmetry or asymmetry, and its dominant vertical or horizontal expression.
 - v. Architectural Expression. When determining visual compatibility for architectural expression, the Landmarks Commission may consider factors such as the building's modulation, articulation, building planes, proportion of building elements, and rhythm of solids to voids created by openings in the façade.
 - b. Guidelines.
 - i. New primary structures should be of a similar architecture style as the primary structures in the historic district while clearly being a new building so as not to create a false sense of history.
2. Accessory Structures.
 - a. Requirements
 - i. Comply with requirements for new primary structures
 - ii. Minimally visible from the street
 - iii. Clearly be secondary to the primary structure
 - b. Guidelines.
 - i. New accessory structures should be of a similar architecture style as the primary structure while clearly being a new building so as not to create a false sense of history.

B. Exterior Walls

1. Exterior Wall Material
 - a. Requirements
 - i. The following building materials are prohibited: pebble dash, wide clapboards over six (6) inches in exposure, composite clapboards and vertical panels with faux wood grain texture, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes, and metal and vinyl siding.
 - b. Guidelines

C. Roofs

1. Roof pitch and roof materials

a. Requirements

- i. The following building materials are prohibited: Thick wood shakes; Dutch lap, French method, or interlocking shingles; architectural (also known as dimensional or laminate) asphalt shingles with a scalloped or staggered bottom edges that simulate wood shake, slate, or tile and have heavy faux shadowing; corrugated or ribbed metal roofing panels; and metal roof shingles.
- ii. Any roofing material shall be permitted on flat or slightly pitched roofs not visible from the street.
- iii. Roof pitch shall replicate pitch of the roofs on historic resources in the district.

b. Guidelines

2. Skylights.

a. Requirements

- i. If visible from the street, skylight shall be located at least twenty (20) feet back from the front edge of the main roof.
- ii. Skylights shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and framing painted to match the roof material.
- iii. Tubular, arched, domed, or pyramidal shaped skylights are prohibited on elevations visible from the street.

b. Guidelines

3. Rooftop Features.

a. Requirements

- i. Rooftop decks or terraces and green roofs or other roof landscaping, railings, or furnishings shall be installed so that they are inconspicuous and minimally visible on the site and from the street.

b. Guidelines

4. Chimneys.

a. Requirement

- i. A chimney's form and materials shall be compatible with chimneys on historic resources within the district.

D. Windows and Doors

1. Window and Door Style

a. Requirements

- i. Windows and door shall have a similar style as the historic resources in the district.
- ii. Multi-light windows shall have true divided lights or simulated divided lights with muntin grids on the exterior and interior the same color as the window sash.
- iii. Storm doors shall be full-light or full-view and in the same color as the entrance door or trim. Mid-view or high-view storm doors are prohibited.
- iv. The following materials are prohibited: vinyl; aluminum; glass block, reflective glass; dark glass; plexiglass; doors with a fake wood grain, mill finish or clear anodized aluminum, and other metallic finishes; and faux (decorative/non-functional) hardware.

b. Guidelines

2. Shutters.

a. Requirements

- i. Shutters shall only be allowed if they are found on historic resources in the district
- ii. Shutters shall be of a size that they appear operable for the associated window.

- b. Guidelines
 - 3. Awnings.
 - a. Requirements
 - i. Awnings will be of a configuration and form consistent with the awnings in the district
 - ii. Awning materials shall have the appearance of the materials found on historic resources with awnings
 - b. Guidelines

E. Entrances and Porches

- 1. General
 - a. Requirements
 - i. Entrances and porches shall be of a configuration and style consistent with the historic resources in the district.
 - ii. The primary entrance for the structure shall be located on the front elevation, or, structures on a corner lot may have a corner entrance.
 - iii. Uncovered porches over fifty (50) square feet are considered decks and shall be placed so that they are not visible from the street.
 - iv. The following materials are prohibited on porches visible from the street: decorative wrought iron, aluminum or other metal, composite, vinyl, carpeting, dimensional lumber or board decking, and composites with faux wood grain.
 - v. Second exit stairways shall be provided on the interior of the structure.
 - vi. Projecting, partially projecting/inset, and inset balconies are prohibited on elevations visible from the street, unless there is precedent on the historic resources in the district.

F. Building Systems

- 1. Solar.
 - a. Requirement
 - i. Roof-mounted solar arrays on sloped roofs shall be flat, parallel to the slope of the roof, and arranged in a pattern or grid parallel to the roof's ridge and eaves.
 - b. Guidelines
- 2. Mechanical and Electrical Systems
 - a. Requirements
 - i. Mechanical equipment shall be screened if it is visible from the street.
 - ii. Static vents, electric vents, wind turbines, and attic fans visible from the street are prohibited.
 - iii. Grilles, vents, equipment, and meters shall be finished or painted to match adjacent building materials.
 - b. Guideline
 - i. Split system mechanical units and other mechanical equipment should be installed on elevations, roofs, and at grade so they are not visible from the street.
 - ii. Grilles (mechanical air intake, exhaust, etc.), vents (plumbing stack, mechanical air intake or exhaust, etc.), electrical and communications equipment (transformers, cabinets, mobile service boosters, security cameras, etc.), and utility meters (water, gas, electric, etc.) should not be placed in the front yard or on the front elevation.
- 3. Lighting and Electrical Systems.
 - a. Requirement
 - i. Lighting shall be of a compatible style with the historic resources
 - b. Guideline

4. Signage

a. Requirement

- i. New signage shall be of a style that is compatible with signage at historic resources in the district.

b. Guideline

G. Building Site

1. General

a. Requirements

- i. New parking areas, access ramps, trash or mechanical equipment enclosures shall be designed so that they are as unobtrusive as possible, retain the historic relationship between the buildings and the building and the landscape, and are visually compatible with other historic resources in the district.
- ii. Railroad tie, landscape timbers, boulders, and concrete block retaining walls are prohibited.
- iii. Chain link, metal mesh, and composite fences are permitted on elevations not visible from the street.
- iv. Bamboo, reed, vinyl, and rustic style fences, such as rough sawn wood or split-rails, are prohibited.
- v. Fences in the front yard shall not exceed three (3) feet in height.

b. Guideline