



Project Name & Address: 1207 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [56054](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 14, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Rachel S. Warrich

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows and doors.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all of the windows and doors at 1207 Jenifer. The period of significance for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District is 1850-1929 and this building was constructed in 1952. The building is typical of apartments constructed in the area at the time and is a Minimal Traditional style with a blend of Colonial Revival and Modern elements. Character-defining features of the Modern style on the building emphasize horizontal lines as seen in the flat awning, horizontal muntins on the windows, and horizontal panels on the front door. While the preservation standards emphasize preservation of original materials, the wood windows in this building would not likely be constructed of old growth wood, which makes their preservation more of a challenge. However, maintenance is still an option worthy of investigation. While this building is outside of the period of significance for the district, the building is over 50 years old and the style of the windows and doors plays a significant role in maintaining the character of the structure.

There appear to be three types of windows present on the building: Chicago-style windows with narrow double-hung windows featuring two-over-two horizontal muntins on either side of a picture window; double-hung windows with two-over-two horizontal muntins, and three light fixed basement windows with vertical muntins. While the replacements have the same rough window openings and replicate the functionality of the original windows, none of the replacements have muntins. The applicant is proposing to paint on muntins as these replacement windows are already purchased.

Additionally, this application proposes to replace one front door and two rear doors. The front door is decorative and reflects the architecture of the building. The proposed replacement is of a different style. The two rear doors are also proposed for replacement in a style that is different from what is currently installed. Generally, the Landmarks Commission has stressed preservation of original and character-defining front doors. They have sometimes approved the replacement of rear doors with a replacement that is period appropriate to the building or replicates the original. Generally the commission has favored replacement of storm doors and preservation of original doors.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New Construction or Exterior Alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) See discussion of Third Lake Ridge Historic District below.
 - (d) Removing character-defining windows that are repairable will frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. Please see the attached memo from the City Attorney's office.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - a) N/A
 - b) The rough openings for the doors and windows would not change, but the rhythm of those openings would be different due to the change in the styles of windows and doors. The areas of void will have a different proportion and rhythm.
 - c) Some of these window and door replacements involve the street façade. The proposal would be removing historic materials, which contradicts this standard.
 - d) N/A.
 - e) The rough openings of the doors and windows are not being altered on the street façade, but the proportions of the door and window decorative elements will be changing. The look of the entire building, including the street façade will be substantially different with the loss of the configuration of the window panes and of the styles of doors will interfere with the historical proportions of those materials.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness are not met due to the windows and doors potentially being repairable, and the proposed replacements not replicating the original features. As such, staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission deny the proposal.