



Project Name & Address: 517 South Baldwin Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [55998](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 14, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Aaron Monroe – Architectural Building Arts

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to change siding, add windows, and add a gabled roof to an existing structure.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

This is the same application and staff report that was prepared for the May 24, 2019, meeting. As that meeting was cancelled due to lack of quorum, the applicant requested this item be referred to the June 24, 2019 meeting.

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to insulate the silo addition and cover with stucco, add four windows to the silo, add a gable roof that projects over the silo and intersects with the roof of the main house. The Landmarks Commission approved extensive rehabilitation of the structures on the property in 2010, which included incorporating a relocated silo to serve as an addition to the historic house. The commission approved the introduction of the silo due to it being nested in between the wings of the house, and thereby being minimally visible from the street (see attached minutes).

The new proposal will alter the exterior of the silo by cladding it in stucco and piercing the walls for four new windows. However, the silo does not have a historic association with the property and was strictly repurposed to serve as a wing of the historic house. The introduction of stucco on the exterior will allow the agricultural element to better blend with the principal structure. The current roof over the silo is angled and flat, which is meant to divert water over the addition. The proposal is to add a gable roof over the silo, with that roof intersecting diagonally into the junction of the two wings of the house. The rectangular roof form over the cylindrical mass is not a combination found in the district. Generally cylindrical towers have a conical or domed roof with a cricket installed where it intersects with the principal roof. As this was originally a silo, it would have had some type of domed roof. Aside from the gable form not matching the cylindrical mass beneath it, the gable would project the roof well past the silo addition, making it more visible from the street. That would further emphasize this out-of-character element by making it more visible from the public right-of-way.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height: The proposed gable roof will not project above the existing roof.
 - (ii) Landscape treatment: N/A.
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces: The neighborhood consists mostly of late 19th century Victorian buildings with complex roof forms. The subject property stands out as the only intersecting gable ell in the vicinity, but it predates the other structures. There are several buildings with projecting bays located under gable or hipped roofs, but no towers. The complex roofs do not have diagonal intersections and where the roofs top projecting bays, it was done for decorative effect, often filled with a bracket (as was common for Victorian architecture). There is a building at 1232 Spaight with a tower and a conical roof, but that is 300 feet away from the subject property.
 - b) This alteration is not to the street façade of the house.
 - c) This alteration is not to the street façade of the house.
 - d) The introduction of a diagonally intersecting gable will largely not be visible from the street, with the exception of the end of the gable being visible from the side street. But the overall roof form will not be visible from the street.
 - e) The introduction of windows to the tower will be minimally visible from the street.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. Construct a domed roof over silo addition with a cricket located at the intersection of the dome and the historic gabled roof.
2. Stucco be a color that matches the color of the house.