



Project Name & Address: 1314 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [55788](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: May 13, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Vaughn Brandt

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to make alterations to a third floor deck

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (2) Criteria for the Creation of the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.
In that the Third Lake Ridge Historic District area reflects a broad pattern of social history of Madison and the State and the Upper Midwest, and in that elements within the District meet other designation criteria in Sec. 41.10(2) of this chapter, namely that many of the structures and sites in the District:
- (a) Are identified with historic personages or with important events in state or local history; and
 - (b) Embody the distinguishing characteristics of an architectural type specimen, inherently valuable for a study of a period, style, method of construction, or of indigenous materials or craftsmanship;
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces

- b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to keep posts in place from the previously noncompliant pergola and to construct additional posts for a sun sail installation on the third floor balcony. In addition, the applicant is asking for approval of triangular brackets (outriggers per the submittal) that the applicant installed to support a roof structure of the second floor balcony. All of these alterations are on the rear of the house.

The Landmarks Commission previously provided a Certificate of Appropriateness for an asymmetrical pergola for the third floor balcony, with the stipulation that it would not extend above the roof. The applicant had already begun construction of a pergola, so some of the structure was in place. The current proposal is to use some of that structure and add additional posts to create a support structure for a sun sail.

The triangular brackets for the second floor balcony project out past the balcony structure. Building Inspection noted them as not having received a COA. They were included in previous plans, but not noted on the hand-drawn plans, but did not appear on any renderings nor were they included in the project narrative.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (2) Criteria for the Creation of the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.
In that the Third Lake Ridge Historic District area reflects a broad pattern of social history of Madison and the State and the Upper Midwest, and in that elements within the District meet other designation criteria in Sec. 41.10(2) of this chapter, namely that many of the structures and sites in the District:
 - (a) Property does not appear to be associated with significant people of the past.
 - (b) This building exemplifies the architectural style and method of construction that is at the heart of why Third Lake Ridge met the City's criteria for being a historic district. The modifications to the rear balcony are proposed in such a fashion that they detract from the architectural character of the building rather than compliment it.
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - a) At the August 2018 meeting, the commission noted that while there were apparently no third-floor pergolas within 200 feet, as this was an alteration on the back of a property, it could be acceptable if it were constructed so that it was not visible from the street. It is unclear if the new sun sail structure will be visible from the street or how the details of the construction will blend with the current structure. The brackets that support the roof structure for the second floor balcony also do not blend with the current structure. Neither of these styles of structures blend with the current architecture of the house.
 - b) Not an alteration to the street façade.
 - c) Not an alteration to the street façade.

- d) Not an alteration to the roof.
- e) Not an alteration to the street façade.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness have not been met and recommend that the Landmarks Commission deny the request.