PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

May 6, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Background

McGrath Property Group is submitting a conceptual proposal to redevelop several properties for a mixed-use development. Some of the properties are located within the First Settlement Historic District and others are located within the East Wilson National Register Historic District. The two parcels in the First Settlement Historic District (134 & 140 S Blair) currently function with one serving as a drive aisle (the smaller) and the other as a large surface parking lot. The four properties in the East Wilson NR District (510-518 E Wilson) contain commercial buildings, one of which is contributing to the NR district.

The project the developer is presenting would create a single building that spans all of the parcels, with underground parking to serve multiple tenant and residential spaces. As currently proposed, this project would require a Certified Survey Map to combine the parcels. As two of those parcels are located within a local historic district, that process would require a Certificate of Appropriateness from the Landmarks Commission.

For the portion of the building located within the First Settlement Historic District, it will require a Certificate of Appropriateness per the standards for new construction in the district. For the portion of the building located outside of the local district, but within the National Register district, the Landmarks Commission is able to provide comments for consideration by the Urban Design Commission and the Plan Commission. The demolition of the buildings along E Wilson are also an opportunity for the Landmarks Commission to provide comments to the Plan Commission.

This informational presentation allows the Landmarks Commission to provide their feedback on how the proposed development could align with the applicable standards that the commission will use to review the project. Below are those standards:

- **41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
 - (4) Land Divisions and Combinations. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for land divisions, combinations, and subdivision plats of landmark sites and properties in historic districts, unless it finds that the proposed lot sizes adversely impact the historic character or significance of a landmark, are incompatible with adjacent lot sizes, or fail to maintain the general lot size pattern of the historic district.

41.26 FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (4) Standards for the Review of New Principal Structures.
 - (a) Structure Height, Scale, Proportion and Rhythm. New principal structures shall be similar in height to the structures directly adjacent to each side. If the structures directly adjacent to each side are different in height, the new structure shall be of a height compatible with the structures within two hundred (200) feet of the proposed structure.

New principal structures shall be compatible with the scale, proportion, and rhythm of masses and spaces of structures within two hundred (200) feet of the proposed structure.

- (b) Siding Materials. Narrow gauge clapboards made of wood, composite wood material, or concrete, and/or brick and stone may be permitted. Stucco and split-faced concrete block may be permitted only as trim, rather than the primary siding material. Stucco panels and pebble dash are prohibited. If the first two floors of a proposed structure are masonry, the Landmarks Commission may permit the use of artificial siding (i.e. vinyl or aluminum) on the upper floor or floors. In such circumstances, the artificial siding must conform to the following requirements:
 - 1. The material shall be of the highest grade offered by the manufacturer.
 - 2. The material shall have a minimum gauge of .042.
 - 3. The color and sheen of the siding shall be consistent with those used in the era in which adjacent structures were constructed.
 - 4. The siding shall not have a false wood grain.
 - 5. The width of each apparent clapboard shall not exceed four (4) inches.
 - 6. The use of visible j-channel trim and other prefabricated elements that differ in appearance from those used on historic structures in the neighborhood is prohibited.
- (c) Roof Materials. Roofing materials shall be asphalt shingles; fiberglass or other composition shingles similar in appearance to multi-layered architectural shingles or 3-in-1 tab; or Dutch lap, French method or interlock shingles. Sawn wood shingles may also be approved. Thick wood shakes are prohibited. Vents shall be located as inconspicuously as possible and shall be similar in color to the color of the roof. Rolled roofing, tar-and-gravel, rubberized membranes and other similar roofing materials are prohibited except that such materials may be used on flat or slightly sloped roofs that are not visible from the ground.
- (d) Roof Shape. If a principal structure does not have a flat roof, the pitch of the new roof shall be no less than 4-in-12.
- (e) Façade Design. Street facades shall be modulated with setbacks incorporated into the design at the first floor level. The entrance shall either be inset or projecting from the plane of the main facade. Porches on main entrances are encouraged. Street facades shall reflect the rhythm and directional expression of pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property.
- (f) Windows and Doors. The proportion of width to height of doors and windows and the proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the front and side facade designs shall be similar to pre-1930 structures within two hundred (200) feet of the subject property. Windows trimmed with bead molds similar in design to other pre-1930 window trim in the district and windows and doors shall be inset at least one (1) inch from the exterior trim. The main entrance to the structure shall be on the front facade. Garage doors shall be located on the side or rear facades whenever feasible. If it is not feasible to locate the garage door on the sides or rear facades, one-car garage doors will be permitted on the front facade.