



PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 11, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 1630 Adams Street (13th Aldermanic District, Ald. Arntsen)
Application Type: Demolition and Conditional Use
Legistar File ID #: [54016](#)
Prepared By: Sydney Prusak, Planning Division
Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted
Reviewed By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant & Contact: Melissa Destree; Destree Design Architects; 222 West Washington Avenue Suite 310; Madison, WI 5370

Property Owner: Tom Zimmer; 1630 Adams Street; Madison, WI 53711

Requested Action: Approval of a demolition permit and conditional use in order to demolish a single-family residence and construct a new single-family residence, as well as construction of an accessory building exceeding ten percent of the lot area at 1630 Adams Street.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to demolish a one-story, single-family residence and construct a two-story, 3,314-square-foot single-family residence with a finished basement. As part of this request, the applicant proposes to construct an alley-served, 576-square-foot, two-stall, two-story garage at the rear (northwest) of the subject property.

In a previous land use application, the applicant indicated that the existing house was undergoing renovations to include a second story with other exterior and interior remodeling. During this process, more than 50% of the exterior walls were removed, classifying the construction work as a technical demolition. City Building Inspection notified the property owner of this violation, and the applicant has since submitted an updated land use application to include a demolition request. While most of the demolition has occurred without the necessary approval, the Planning Division requests that the Plan Commission review this request in keeping with the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [MGO §28.185(7)] and Conditional Uses [MGO §28.183]. MGO §28.131(1)(a) requires the total area of accessory buildings measured at ground floor be no greater than ten percent (10%) of the lot area unless allowed by conditional use approval in a TR zoning district.

Review Required By: Plan Commission (PC)

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the demolition and conditional use standards are met and **approve** the requests to demolish a one-story residence and construct a new two-story residence and construction of an accessory building exceeding ten percent of the lot area at 1630 Adams Street. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the Planning Division and other reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The 4,800-square-foot property is located on the northwest side of Adams Street near the intersection with Garfield Street. It is located within Aldermanic District 13 (Ald. Arntsen) as well as the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: According to City Assessor records, the property is currently developed with a one-story, two-bedroom, two-bathroom, 1,069-square-foot single-family residence, which was originally constructed in 1920. There is an existing, alley facing, side loaded, 292-square-foot detached garage. The primary structure has technically demolished without a proper raze permit. Photos of the existing house (both before and after the technical demolition) and garage are available here:

<https://madison.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3769317&GUID=F9ABD4D1-E37F-459D-B5D0-6BEEB769CE2&Options=ID|Text|&Search=1630+A>

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

- Northeast: Single-family and two-family residences, zoned Traditional Residential – Consistent 4 (TR-C4);
- Southeast: Single-family residences, zoned TR-C4;
- Southwest: Single-family residences, zoned TR-C4; and
- Northwest: Single-family and two-family residences, zoned TR-C4.

Adopted Land Use Plan: The [Comprehensive Plan \(2018\)](#) recommends low-medium density residential (LMR) uses for the subject parcel, defined as seven to 30 dwelling units per acre (du/ac). While the [Brittingham-Vilas Neighborhood Plan \(1989\)](#) makes no specific land use recommendations for the subject site, a primary goal of the Plan is: “To improve and maintain the residential housing stock of the neighborhood, to encourage more owner-occupancy and non-transient housing, and to promote the neighborhood as a good place to live.” Furthermore, the subject site is included in the [A Revitalization Strategy \(Supplement to the Greenbush and Vilas Neighborhood Plans\)](#) (2010) planning area, with a goal to maintain, protect, and preserve the established housing stock.

Zoning Summary: The property is in the Traditional Residential – Consistent 4 (TR-C4) District

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	4,000 sq. ft.	4,800 sq. ft.
Lot Width	40'	40'
Front Yard Setback	20'	Adequate
Max. Front Yard Setback	30' or up to 20% greater than block average	Adequate
Side Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3'	3'
Rear Yard Setback: Accessory Building	3'	3'
Usable Open Space	750 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	65%	Less than 65%
Maximum Building Height: Accessory Building	15'	14' 8"
Number Parking Stalls	Single-family detached dwelling: 1 (location only)	Detached garage

Building Forms	Not required	Accessory building
Other Critical Zoning Items:	Utility Easements	

Table Prepared by Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking demolition and conditional use approvals to allow the demolition of a one-story, 1,069-square-foot single-family residence in order to construct a new two-story 3,314-square-foot single-family residence, which includes 981 square-feet of basement space. As part of this request, the applicant proposes to construct a new 576-square-foot garage in the northernmost corner of the lot, which will exceed 10% of the lot area.

Analysis and Conclusion

This proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [MGO §28.185(7)] and Conditional Uses [MGO §28.183]. MGO §28.131(1)(a) requires the total area of accessory buildings measured at ground floor be no greater than ten percent (10%) of the lot area unless allowed by conditional use approval in a TR zoning district. The analysis begins with a summary of adopted plan recommendations.

Conformance with Adopted Plans

The [Comprehensive Plan \(2018\)](#) recommends low-medium density residential (LMR), defined as seven to 30 dwelling units per acre (du/ac) for the subject property. Single-family homes are among the recommended housing types within this designation.

Two neighborhood-specific documents have also been adopted including the [Brittingham-Vilas Neighborhood Plan \(1989\)](#) which recommends, in part, to maintain the residential housing stock of the neighborhood. The subject site is also covered by [A Revitalization Strategy \(Supplement to the Greenbush and Vilas Neighborhood Plans\) \(2010\)](#). That document, adopted in 2010, includes several broad goals that relate to: 1) Increasing the affordability and desirability of the neighborhood, 2) Introducing a range of housing options, 3) Enhancing unique neighborhood qualities and established homes, and 4) Implementing the strategies through the work of community based strategies. To support the broad goals, several specific strategies are included. Recommendations for the subject area include “maintain, protect, and preserve the established housing stock” and “accommodate potential strategic redevelopment opportunities.” The plan also discusses encouraging “small scale” investments to incrementally improve the neighborhood housing stock and to provide affordable ownership opportunities. The subject property is itself identified as a possible rental property to could transition to home ownership through small-scale investments.

Finally, the Strategy recommends, “Reinforce the character of the area with a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District. Accommodate potential strategic redevelopment opportunities.” Designation of the area as a Neighborhood Conservation District could create additional neighborhood specific development standards, but has not been further pursued or adopted by the City.

Demolition Details and Standards

In order to approve a demolition request, MGO §28.185(7) states that the Plan Commission must find that the requested demolition and proposed use are compatible with the purpose of the demolition section and the intent and purpose of the TR-C4 (Traditional Residential - Consistent 4) Zoning District. The demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider and may give decisive weight to any relevant facts including impacts on the normal and orderly development of surrounding properties and the reasonableness of efforts to relocate the building. Furthermore, the proposal should be compatible with adopted plans. Finally, the demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's Historic Preservation Planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

As proposed, the new single-family residence will be two-stories, with a partially finished basement and a 160-square-foot raised front porch. In terms of building materials, the residence will have a mix of blue vinyl siding, composite wood trim, and a shingled roof.

On balance, despite having concerns that this request is coming to the Commission after the building has been demolished, the Planning Division believes that the Commission can find that the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits are met.

In regards to plan compatibility, maintaining a single-family use is consistent with the adopted land use recommendations. As discussed above, the adopted neighborhood plan and subsequent housing strategy generally recommend preserving the existing housing stock and encouraging smaller-scale investments to improve neighborhood character while promoting affordable home ownership opportunities. While these adopted plans recommend a preference for preservation, staff notes that the Plan Commission has approved other demolitions within the study area. Additionally, staff notes that the resulting home would be consistent with improvements and renovations that had already been permitted as modifications to the former structure. The use is a permitted use and complies with TR-C4 Zoning. Plan Commission review would not have been required if there was not a demolition. Further, while strategies such as conservation districts are recommended for the area, no such requirements have yet been pursued or adopted.

Lastly, at their January 14, 2019 meeting, the Landmarks Commission found that the building has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, or as the work/product of an architect of note, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

Conditional Use Standards

While the proposed home is a permitted use, a conditional use is required to allow the construction of an accessory building greater than 10% of the lot area (greater than 480 square feet) at 1630 Adams Street. As proposed, the garage will occupy 12% of the lot area and therefore this request is subject to the Conditional Use Standards. The Plan Commission shall not approve a Conditional Use without due consideration of the City's adopted plan recommendations, design guidelines, and finding that all of the conditional use standards of MGO §28.183(6) are met.

The garage will be located in the same general area as the existing 292-square-foot garage, but the building footprint will increase by 284-square-feet. The garage will be accessed via the alleyway between Adams Street and Jefferson Street. The 24-foot by 24-foot two-stall garage is proposed to have a gable roof and dormers, with

a future second floor exercise room. The proposed garage will have blue vinyl siding and a shingled roof to match the new single-family home.

In considering the surrounding context, many of the neighboring residences have alley-loaded garages. The applicant has provided images of neighboring garages of similar size and scale. It is important to note that the conditional use is for the garage exceeding ten percent of the lot area, and not for the garage size itself. The building is currently subject to and satisfies the height requirements for accessory buildings. As proposed, this request does not include approval of an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU). If the applicant or a future owner wishes to convert the space into an ADU in the future, a separate conditional use approval will be required.

Because of the height and mass of both the principal structure and the accessory building, staff has considered the bulk of the development on the subject property in context of its surroundings. In considering the surrounding context, most of the nearby houses on Adams, Jefferson, and Chandler Street are between one and three-stories and on smaller lots, similar to the subject property. Additionally, the two homes across the alley both have alley served two-car garages and two other neighboring homes also have two-car detached garages. As one measure of compatibility, staff analyzed the floor area ratio (FAR), which compares the estimated total building floor area (on all floors) to the lot area. For this report, staff utilized data provided by the applicant and available data from the City's Assessors Office. Staff have included detached garage space in this calculation. Based on information provided by the applicant, the estimated FAR for the subject site is 0.89, which is tied for the second highest of the 12 properties in the study area, and is above the study area median (0.65) and mean (0.67). While the proposed garage is larger than most nearby garages, its location at the back of the lot and its height is believed to be generally appropriate for its surroundings.

Due to the design of the garage on the site and its integration with the surrounding character of the neighborhood, the Planning Division believes the Conditional Use Standards can be found met.

Public Input

At the time of report writing, staff has not received any written comments on this request.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Sydney Prusak, (608) 243-0554)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolition and removal permits and conditional uses are met and **approve** the requests to allow the demolition of a single-family home and the construction of an accessory building greater than ten percent of the lot area at 1630 Adams Street. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the Planning Division and other reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Sydney Prusak, (608) 243-0554)

1. This approval does not include approval of an Accessory Dwelling Unit. Plan Commission approval of a new conditional use would be required in order to convert the upper garage space into an Accessory Dwelling Unit.

City Engineering Division - Main Office (Contact Tim Troester, (608) 267-1995)

2. Prior to approval, the owner or owner's representative shall obtain a permit to plug each existing sanitary sewer lateral that serves a building which is proposed for demolition. For each lateral to be plugged the owner shall complete a sewer lateral plugging application and pay the applicable permit fees. The permit application is available on line at <http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm>. (MGO CH 35.02(14))

Zoning (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608)266-4429)

3. Section 28.185(7)(a)5. requires that if a demolition or removal permit is approved, it shall not be issued until the reuse and recycling plan is approved by the Recycling Coordinator, Bryan Johnson (608-266-4682).
4. Section 28.185(10) Every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185 (7)(a)5. shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition.
5. Show the height of the proposed residence on the elevations. The maximum height is 35'. Height is the average of the height of all building facades. For each facade, height is measured from the midpoint of the existing grade to the highest point on the roof of the building or structure. No individual facade shall be more than fifteen percent (15%) higher than the maximum height of the zoning district.

City Engineering Division - Mapping (Contact Jeffrey Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

6. The site plan shall include a full and complete legal description of the site or property being subjected to this application.
7. The site plan shall show correct street names. C100. The street is Adams Street.

Parks/Forestry Review (Contact Kathleen Kane, 608-261-9671)

8. If future plans for second floor of garage include an Accessory Dwelling Unit (ADU), Park Impact Fees (comprised of the Park Infrastructure Impact Fee, per MGO Sec. 20.08(2)), and Park-Land Impact Fees, per MGO Sec. 16.23 (8)(f) and 20.08(2) will be required for all new residential development associated with this project. This development is within the East Park -Infrastructure Impact Fee district.