

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 11, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1229 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in the Third Lake Ridge historic district.

Legistar File ID # [54857](#)

Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: March 7, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Ann and Brian Knox

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located at 1229 Jenifer Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all of the windows in the building. Staff has emphasized to the applicant the need to provide more detailed documentation on the condition of the existing windows and how the dimensions of the replacement windows match the specific dimensions of the current windows. (see attached correspondence)

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.18 and 41.23 follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
- (a) N/A
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) Project must meet the historic district standards.
 - (d) The City Attorney's Office has previously determined that replacement rather than repair of historic windows would "frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources." Staff has previously directed the applicant that they need to make a case that the windows are beyond repair, but also that distinctive windows (such as the large picture windows) should be retained in place. (memo attached)

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
- a) N/A.

- b) The proposed alteration would preserve the proportions of solids to voids as it would be replacing the existing windows with windows of similar design, function, and appearance.
- c) The proposal is not to retain any of the historic windows, therefore it does not meet this standard, which requires for changes to the street façade that: “any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.”
- d) N/A
- e) The proposal appears to meet this standard in that the window sizes are likely the same.

Recommendation

Based on the materials submitted, staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness have not been met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission either deny this request or ask the applicant for additional information and refer to a future meeting.