

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 11, 2019

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 1130 Williamson Street
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district
Legistar File ID # [54489](#)
Prepared By: Heather Bailey, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: February 4, 2019

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Kuldip Singh – MKS Petroleum, LLC
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for new signage and modification of the architectural canopy in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The size or design of the sign(s) would adversely affect the historic fabric of the structure or the district;
 - (b) The sign(s) fails to comply with Chapter 31, MGO;
 - (c) The sign(s) fails to comply with specific standards and guidelines for signs adopted in each historic district under this ordinance.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use. Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
- (a) Height
 - (b) Alterations of street façade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids
 - (c) Alterations of street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - (d) Alterations of roof shall retain its existing historical appearance.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the existing architectural canopy located above the gas pumps and replace the existing signage on the property. The Landmarks Commission approved the installation of the canopy in 1986 and since that time it has undergone slight modifications of the style and color of the fascia on the canopy. The current proposal is in keeping with past approvals. It features simple striping with a bullnose profile. The striping will not be lit and will be in a red, white, and blue color scheme in keeping with the rebranding of this business as a Heritage Amoco Brand. The new signage will use the same color scheme. The new building wall signage will not be illuminated. The replacement pole sign will have internal illumination, but will only illuminate key portions of the sign.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.23(7) as they pertain to the canopy follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (7) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Mixed-Use and Commercial Use. Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned for mixed-use and commercial use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
- (a) The proposal does not change the height of the canopy.
 - (b) This proposal does not change the solid to void ratio of the structures on the property.
 - (c) While not façades, this proposal is in keeping with the character of previous approvals for the property, going back to Landmarks' original approval to construct a canopy over the gas pumps.
 - (d) The roof form of the canopy is not changing, but the decorative detailing of the fascia is changing. The style and character of the striping is in keeping with previous approvals for the property.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.18(3) as they pertain to the signage follows:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (3) Signs. The commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for signs unless it finds that any of the following are true:
- (a) The sign and design of the signage reduces the current impacts on the district. The proposed pole sign replacement is slimmer in profile than what is currently installed and the constrained internal lighting allows it to be functional for customers while mitigating visual impacts on adjacent properties. The wall sign is in keeping with the character of the building, which is outside of the period of significance.
 - (b) N/A
 - (c) There are no specific sign standards for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

The theme of previous approvals for this property are that it is a distinct resource, outside of the period of significance for the Third Lake Ridge Historic District. Previous approvals have focused on mitigating the visual impact to the historic district, while allowing for the ongoing use of the property as a gas station. The focused illumination of the signage and the heritage branding allow for more integration of this property into the historic district.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the proposal meets the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for new fascia on the architectural canopy and new signage on the property as represented in the applicant's submission.