TOF MAD

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name & Address: 952-956 Spaight Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in a historic district.

Legistar File ID # 53566

Prepared By: William Fruhling, Acting Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: October 30, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Benjamin Fritz

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate

of Appropriateness for window and door replacement

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The site is located at 952-956 Spaight Street in the Third Lake Ridge Local Historic

District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- **41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
 - (1) <u>New construction or exterior alteration</u>. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) <u>Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District Parcels Zoned for</u> Residential Use.
 - a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
 - b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
 - c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
 - d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
 - e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The owner replaced a double-hung window on the side of the house with glass block without obtaining a Certificate of Appropriateness. The owner is also is proposing to replace a door on the side of the house. Although these alterations are not historically appropriate, they are not on a street façade.

A discussion of the relevant ordinance section of Chapter 41.23 follows:

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (9) <u>Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District Parcels Zoned for</u> Residential Use.
 - a) The proposed alterations do not affect the height or landscape treatment, and since the window replacement and new door are occurring within existing openings, they do not change the rhythm of mass and spaces.

Recommendation

Staff believe that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request.