

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

August 6, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1054 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): PUBLIC HEARING
Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [52526](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon & Bill Fruhling, Planning Division

Date Prepared: July 28, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Jeff Davis, Angus-Young Associates, Inc.

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a garage structure in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT**
- (8) Standards for New Structures in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use. Any new structures on parcels zoned for mixed-use and residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways: (Am. by ORD-16-00082, 9-15-16)
 - (a) Gross Volume.
 - (b) Height.
 - (c) The proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facades.
 - (d) Materials used in the street facades.

- (e) The design of the roof.
- (f) The rhythm of buildings and masses.
- (g) Directional expression.
- (h) Materials, patterns and textures.
- (i) Landscape treatment.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant is requesting to construct a detached two car garage in the Third Lake Ridge historic district. This request requires a public hearing since it is a new structure over 100 square feet. There is not an existing garage that is being proposed for replacement. The Visual Compatibility Map (VCM) is attached to this report.

41.18 (1)(c) instructs the Commission refer to 41.23. A brief discussion of the new construction standards of 41.23(8) follows:

- (a) The proposed accessory building has a gross volume that is smaller than the gross volume of primary buildings in the area of visual compatibility. The gross volume is similar to other accessory buildings.
- (b) The proposed building height meets the zoning height requirement for accessory structures. A 10:12 roof pitch is being used to make the garage roof as similar to the primary residence roof as possible. The height is similar to other accessory buildings in the visually compatible area.
- (c) The proposed garage building generally has a proportion and rhythm of solids to voids in the street facade that are similar to other garage buildings in the historic district and within the area of visual compatibility.
- (d) Please see discussion of (h) below.
- (e) The proposed garage building has a gabled roof which is similar to the roof forms present on numerous buildings in the area of visual compatibility. The roof of the primary building is gabled and the pitch is slightly steeper than the 10:12 proposed pitch.
- (f) The proposed building is being located in a logical place for a garage structure which is consistent with the rhythm of buildings and masses (which should read spaces) found in the VCM.
- (g) The directional expression of the proposed garage is very similar to the primary residence. It is mostly vertical with strong horizontals. The directional expression of the proposed building is similar to the expression found in adjacent accessory buildings.
- (h) The proposed garage has a proposed exterior wall material of beveled vinyl siding at the lower wall and shake siding (presumably vinyl) in the gables. The existing primary building has beveled wood siding with an exposure of approximately 4" and wide corner boards with scalloped shingles in the gables. The proposed beveled siding profile is common in the area of visual compatibility. The proposed shake shingles (presumably vinyl) do not match the scalloped shingles in the gables of the primary residence. The proposed band board below the gable and the window trim matches those elements of the primary residence. The proposed roof material is dimensional shingle which is common in the area of visual compatibility. The eave detail matches the eave detail of the primary residence and is not spared off.
- (i) The construction of the proposed garage will change the existing landscape treatment. The submission materials indicate that a "boulder" retaining wall is being proposed along the entire south side of the garage building. The use of a retaining wall is consistent with other landscape treatments in the historic district, but more information is needed to review the boulder material.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the new construction request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. New construction in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic character in the district.

The overall form and appearance of the proposed garage structure is similar to other garages structures in the VCM.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the garage structure are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. The garage door and person door shall have wider trim than what is shown in the drawings in order to match the door trim width of the primary residence.
2. The gable end shake shingles shall be scalloped shingles to match the primary residence or beveled siding to match the siding exposure being used on the lower wall.
3. The window and door materials are not specified. The applicant shall provide manufacturer's information about the proposed window and doors.
4. The applicant shall provide information about the material and location of the proposed retaining wall.