

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 23, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1219-1221 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [52019](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: July 15, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Edward Kuharski, Green Design Studio

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including second and third floor window replacement in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

- (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - 1. Height.
 - 2. Landscape treatment.
 - 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.
- (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant is requesting the replacement of some original wood sash windows and some replacement units in the second and third floors. This proposal was reviewed by the Landmarks Commission on June 18, 2018 and at that time, the Commission requested that the Applicant provide information about the condition of each window proposed for replacement. Since that meeting, the proposal has been revised to retain more original sash. According to the submission materials, there are five original windows that are in poor condition on the east (side) elevation (three on the second floor and two on the third floor) and three windows (one on the second floor and two on the third floor) on the rear elevation that are proposed for replacement. All other windows of the second and third floors will be repaired as needed.

41.18 (1)(c) instructs the Commission refer to 41.23. A brief discussion of the applicable standards of 41.23(9) follows:

- (a) Not applicable
- (b) Not applicable
- (c) The windows of the front façade are being retained and repaired.
- (d) Not applicable
- (e) The windows sizes are not being changed.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The alterations made to structures in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic significance and character in the district. Retaining and repairing historic materials and elements protects and conserves the historic resources better than installing new materials and elements.

The Anderson window product being proposed appears to be similar in design, color, scale, and architectural appearance. The replacement window will not have the visual qualities of the original wavy glass that are likely present in these windows.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the revised window replacement submission are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request as revised.