

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

July 23, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 1115 Rutledge
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district
Legistar File ID # [50887](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: July 15, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Joan Grosse
Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations to a building in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located on Rutledge Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant State Statute Section:

Wisc SS 62.23(7)(em)2m. In the repair or replacement of a property that is designated as a historic landmark or included within a historic district or neighborhood conservation district under this paragraph, a city shall allow an owner to use materials that are similar in design, color, scale, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.

- a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within 200 feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 - (i) Height
 - (ii) Landscape treatment
 - (iii) Rhythm of mass and spaces
- b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant requested a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof and gutter/downspout replacement and received an administrative approval on June 2, 2017.

The COA letter stated, “In accordance with the provisions of the Historic Preservation Ordinance, I have reviewed your plans to alter the existing structure located at 1115 Rutledge Street in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District and am able to provide administrative approval to replace the handrail on the existing fire - escape to match the adjacent handrail, to tear off the existing slate shingles, and to install new slate-look shingles and new half round gutters and round downspouts to match the existing. I understand the new shingles will be GAF Slateline shingles in English Gray Slate color. The gutters and downspouts shall be painted metal.”

The Applicant had K-style gutters installed instead of half rounds and requested that the K-style gutters be approved. Staff did not feel comfortable amending the administrative approval and is requesting that the Commission review this request.

The request was reviewed by the Landmarks Commission on March 19, 2018. At that meeting the Commission voted to refer the item to a future meeting to allow the property owner the time to provide more information. The property owner has provided an estimate for the installation of 6” half round gutters, an estimate for installing 4” half round gutters, photos of the property in the 1970s and photos of the gutters that were removed recently, and photos of the gutter configurations present at neighboring properties.

A brief discussion of the standards of 41.23(7) follows:

- a) NA
- b) NA
- c) The K-style gutters have a different profile and are not the original or historic element. This standard has been interpreted by the Commission in the past to mean “material” and “element”. Maintaining the specific metal of the half round gutter does not maintain the historic appearance.
- d) NA
- e) NA

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City’s historic

resources. The installation of K-style gutters is an unfortunate loss of the historic appearance which may frustrate the public interest in protecting the vernacular character and appearance of the historic resource.

The K-style gutters are not similar to half round gutters in design, architectural appearance, and other visual qualities.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of K-style gutters are not met and recommends that the Commission deny the request.