

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 18, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 1219-1221 Jenifer Street

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [52019](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 10, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Edward Kuharski, Green Design Studio

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations including second and third floor window replacement in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The subject site is located in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS. A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.

- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) NA
 - (b) NA
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

41.23 THIRD LAKE RIDGE HISTORIC DISTRICT

- (9) Standards for Exterior Alterations in the Third Lake Ridge Historic District - Parcels Zoned for Residential Use.
 - (a) Any exterior alterations on parcels zoned residential use that are located within two hundred (200) feet of other historic resources shall be visually compatible with those historic resources in the following ways:
 1. Height.
 2. Landscape treatment.
 3. Rhythm of mass and spaces.

- (b) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical proportion and rhythm of solids to voids.
- (c) Alterations of the street façade(s) of any existing structure shall retain the original or existing historical materials.
- (d) Alterations of the roof of any existing structure shall retain its existing historical appearance.
- (e) Alterations of the street facade(s) shall retain the original or existing historical proportional relationships of door sizes to window sizes.

Analysis and Conclusion

The Applicant is requesting the replacement of some original wood sash windows and some replacement units in the second and third floors. According to the submission materials, there are three original windows on the front elevation in the second and third floors that would be restored. The Palladian window components, which the applicant does not believe to be original, would be replicated with new to match the existing configuration and appearance.

41.18 (1)(c) instructs the Commission refer to 41.23. A brief discussion of the applicable standards of 41.23(9) follows:

- (a) Not applicable
- (b) Not applicable
- (c) In the submission materials, the applicant explains that the sash components of the Palladian window are not original wood sash, but does not explain why this conclusion is made. The applicant does not indicate if the flanking double hungs on the bay window are original wood sash or replacement units. The Pella 250 series vinyl windows do not have a similar appearance to original wood windows and are not of wood material. The upper sash of the proposed Pella window product projects past the frame and it is unclear how the trim would relate to the frame.
- (d) Not applicable
- (e) The windows sizes are not being changed.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The alterations made to structures in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure retention of historic significance and character in the district. Retaining and repairing historic materials and elements protects and conserves the historic resources better than installing new materials and elements.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the window replacements may be met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

1. If replacement of the Palladian window components is approved by the Commission, the applicant shall provide staff with the details and manufacturer information for final review and possible approval.
2. Windows with details more similar to the existing windows shall be used in the two bay window double hungs. The applicant shall provide staff with the details and manufacturer information for final review and possible approval.