

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 18, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 402 N Thornton/1440 E Johnson, Tenney Park

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations on a landmark site

Legistar File ID # [52018](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 10, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Caroline Hoffman, Tenney Lapham Neighborhood Association

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of signs of historic postcard images on a landmark site.

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The landmark site is located at 1440 E Johnson.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) NA
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Analysis and Conclusion

The applicant applied for and has been awarded a Neighborhood Improvement Grant by the Planning Division for the installation of signs. The applicant must receive proper approvals from all Boards and Commissions and the Wisconsin Historical Society before moving forward with the project.

41.18 (1)(a) instructs the Commission refer to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. A brief discussion of the applicable standards for the installation of signs follows:

2. The signs are proposed to be installed in an unused area of the park where three paths converge. The grouping of the signs in one area instead of spreading them throughout the park allows the historic character of the landmark site to be retained and preserved. No historic features or spaces that characterize the property are being removed.
8. Tenney Park is known to contain multiple archeological sites and this proposal must undergo a compliance review by the State Historic Preservation Office.
9. The new signs are contemporary and simple in visual appearance and are being located in a grouping. The signs are being differentiated as new elements to protect the integrity of the historic environment and will not destroy historic materials that characterize the property.
10. The signs are being installed on simple footings that could be removed in the future without the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment being impaired.

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. The alterations made to landmark sites should be carefully evaluated to ensure the long-term retention of historic significance and character. The signs are promoting the interesting history of the historic resource.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of the signs are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request as submitted.