

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 18, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 1937 Arlington Place

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in University Heights Historic District

Legistar File ID # [52017](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 7, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Juda Shohet

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of siding and restoration of stucco in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) Not applicable
 - (b) Not applicable
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs in TR-C2, TR-C3, and TR-C4, Zoning Districts.
 - (d) Restoration. Projects that will restore the appearance of a structure to its original appearance are encouraged and will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if such projects are documented by photographs, architectural or archeological research or other suitable evidence.
 - (f) Alterations Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. Alterations visible from the street, including alterations to the top of structures, and alterations to street facades shall be compatible with the existing structure in architectural design, scale,

color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials used in such alterations shall duplicate in texture and appearance, and architectural details used therein shall duplicate in design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the existing structure or of other structures in University Heights of similar materials, age and architectural style, unless the Landmarks Commission approves duplication of the texture and appearance of materials and the design of architectural details used in the existing structure where the existing building materials and architectural details differ from the original. Alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side alterations shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

- (g) Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. Additions and exterior alterations that are not visible from any streets contiguous to the lot lines upon which the structure is located will be approved by the Landmarks Commission if their design is compatible with the scale of the existing structure and, further, if the materials used are compatible with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural details. Additions and alterations shall harmonize with the architectural design of the structure rather than contrast with it.

Analysis and Conclusion

A discussion of the relevant standards of 41.24(5) follows:

- (d) Restoration. The existing beveled siding was installed over the original stucco surface. There are places where the original stucco is visible under the later siding. The date of the installation of the siding is not known. There is not a building permit record for this work. The removal of beveled siding and the restoration of the stucco will restore the original appearance of the structure.
- (f) Alterations Visible from the Street and Alterations to Street Facades. The removal of the siding will possibly result in gaps or missing trim pieces needed to transition to the adjacent stucco. These details should be reviewed with staff as they come up during the work.
- (g) Additions and Exterior Alterations Not Visible from the Street. See comments from (f).

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed alteration are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the understanding that issues related to missing or altered trim pieces resulting from the removal of the siding shall be reviewed with staff as they come up during the work.