

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

June 18, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name & Address: 126 S Hancock, Festner House

Application Type(s): Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration on a landmark site located in a historic district

Legistar File ID # [51825](#)

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: June 11, 2018

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Chris Hacker, Chads Design Build

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of all windows and trim,

Background Information

Parcel Location/Information: The landmark site is located at 126 S Hancock Street in the First Settlement Historic District.

Relevant Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
 - (a) In the case of exterior alteration to a designated landmark, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (b) In the case of exterior alteration or construction of a structure on a landmark site, the proposed work would meet the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.
 - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
 - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.
2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.
3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.

4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.
5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
8. Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.
9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.
10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

41.26 FIRST SETTLEMENT HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All additions, exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the First Settlement Historic District. The standards listed below are intended to maintain a historically accurate appearance. Modern materials that do not meet the exact requirements of the standards but which duplicate the historic appearance may be considered on an individual basis for a variance as listed in sec. 41.19 of this chapter.
- (a) Porches. Not applicable
 - (b) Decks. Not applicable
 - (c) Accessibility Ramps. Not applicable
 - (d) Windows. On the front facade and on side facades within ten (10) feet of the front facade, all original windows or pre-1930 windows that are compatible with the historic character of the structure shall retain their existing historic size, appearance, and trim detail. If any of the original windows or pre-1930 windows that are compatible with the historic character of the structure have true divided lights (i.e., with small panes of glass between muntin bars), replacement sash shall duplicate the existing appearance and have true divided lights. If windows have been altered in the past, restoration to the original appearance is encouraged. On side facades not within ten (10) feet of the front facade and on rear facades of the structure, the sills of original windows or pre-1930 windows that are compatible with the historic character of the structure may be raised to serve bathrooms and kitchens. In other respects, the design shall duplicate the original appearance of the existing window. On side facades more than ten (10) feet from the front facade and on rear facades, new windows in locations where no window previously existed may be approved, provided they retain a similar ratio of height to width as original windows on the structure, are the same type of window as others on the structure (e.g., double-hung or casement), and are trimmed and finished to match the appearance of the other windows.
 - (e) Entrance Doors. If the entrance door is original or is pre-1930 and blends with the historic character of the structure, it should be retained unless the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that it is beyond repair. Metal doors may be

approved, provided they blend with the historic appearance of the structure. Unpaneled, modern-style doors, and doors with a fake wood grain are prohibited. All doors shall be painted or varnished.

- (f) Double or Multiple Doors. Not applicable
- (g) Storm Windows and Doors. Storm windows and doors shall be enameled, painted or otherwise coated with a colored surface to resemble a painted surface. Raw aluminum or other metallic finishes on storm windows and doors are prohibited. Painted or varnished storm doors of wood and glass to match the original design on the structure or on similar structures in the district are encouraged. Storm doors of simple design with no stylistic references may be used. Full view storm doors will be permitted. Storm doors with metal grills are prohibited.
- (h) Skylights. Not applicable.
- (i) Roof Materials. Not applicable
- (j). Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. Not applicable
- (k) Chimneys. Not applicable
- (l) Siding. Original wood siding or pre-1930 siding that blends with the historic character of the structure shall be retained and restored as necessary, except that if the owner can demonstrate to the Landmarks Commission that the original siding is beyond repair, it may be replaced with wood, composite wood, or concrete clapboard siding to match the original or existing pre-1930 appearance. Restoration of original wood decorative details is encouraged. Soffits may be replaced or sided with wood or artificial materials, provided the appearance of the proposed material matches as closely as possible the original appearance.

Original brick, stone and stucco siding shall be retained. Installation of artificial siding on such structures is prohibited. Painting of unpainted brick is prohibited. Mortar and other materials used in brick repair shall match the original in color, hardness, and appearance.
- (m) Foundations. Not applicable
- (n) Additions. Not applicable
- (o) Fire Escapes and Rescue Platforms. Not applicable
- (p) Lighting Fixtures. Not applicable
- (q) Permanently Installed Air Conditioners. Not applicable.
- (r) Shutters. The installation of new shutters requires approval of the Landmarks Commission. Shutters will be permitted, provided they are compatible with the historic character of the structure and are of a size that, if the shutters were workable, would cover the window opening.
- (s) Repairs. Repairs to structures shall either match the existing or the original appearance. Restoration to the original appearance is encouraged.
- (t) Alterations to Post-1930 Structures. Not applicable

Analysis and Conclusion

41.18(1)(a) instructs the Landmarks Commission to review the alteration request using the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Only the standards that seem applicable to this alteration request are discussed below.

1. The property is being used as it was historically.
2. The historic character of this property is being retained and preserved. Distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize this property will be retained. The applicant explained that most of the windows are already replacements.

3. Conjectural features are not being added. The applicant is requesting to alter a rear door and make it a window with infill brick below. The brick infill will be set back from the wall plane so that the original opening is conveyed in the wall appearance.
4. Not applicable
5. Retention of original windows is preferred to replacement, but the applicant notes that the majority of the windows have already been replaced.
6. The deteriorated windows are proposed to be replaced to match the original in design and appearance.
7. Not applicable
8. Not applicable
9. The new windows will replicate the appearance of the original windows so that the character of the property can be retained. Window trim is being milled to match existing profiles. The infill of the original rear door is being executed so that the door opening is conveyed in the appearance of the wall. The brick infill will be held back from the existing wall plane to indicate an area of later infill. This will help to differentiate the infill from the original construction of the rear addition. The infill materials shall match the size of the existing adjacent materials. Any additional repairs to soffit, fascia, brackets, etc. shall be completed in-kind.
10. Not applicable

41.18(1)(d) instructs the Landmarks Commission to determine if the alteration request frustrates the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources. Alterations to designated landmark buildings and properties in historic districts should be carefully evaluated to ensure appropriate treatment of the building and the retention of architectural, cultural or historic significance.

41.18(1)(c) instructs the Commission to review the applicable standards in 41.26(5). A brief discussion of the applicable standards follows:

- (d) Windows. The existing windows will be removed and replaced with replacement windows that will replicate the appearance of the original windows. The replacement windows will have simulated divided lights. The window trim detail will be replicated in new material to match the existing profile. On the rear addition, this standard stipulates that a new window can be installed in locations where no window previously existed provided the window retains a similar ratio of height to width as original windows, are the same type of window (double hung), and are trimmed and finished to match the appearance of the other windows.
- (e) Entrance Doors. The rear door is being proposed for replacement. The existing rear door is possibly already a replacement door, but may be pre-1930s. The applicant explains that the existing door is warped and does not close. The existing door does not have an applied frame at the glass, but the proposed door does. It is unclear if the proposed door has simulated divided lights. Muntins must project past the plane of the glass instead of being tape-like or held between the glass.
- (g) Storm Windows and Doors. The current door system has a storm door, but a storm door is not being proposed to be installed.
- (l) Siding. This section is applicable to the review because of the brick infill proposed to be installed under the window where the rear door is being removed. The area under the window is proposed to be infilled with brick. The area of brick infill will be painted to match the adjacent painted brick. New mortar shall match the existing adjacent mortar in joint profile and size.
- (r) Shutters. The existing shutters may not be the actual original shutters, but the current proposal requests the removal of the shutters altogether.
- (s) Repairs. Repairs to related trim, soffits, fascia, brackets, etc. shall be in-kind to retain the original appearance.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior alterations may be met and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions of approval:

1. The applicant notes that the proposal includes removing the existing shutters and not replacing them. While the existing shutters may not be the originals, the existence of shutters on the house may be important for its historic character. The Commission shall discuss the removal of the shutters and determine if it is appropriate to not replace the shutters.
2. The applicant shall provide more information about the proposed rear door. The Commission shall discuss the existing door and the appropriateness of the applied trim detail at the glass. In addition, the applicant shall confirm that the proposed new door has simulated divided lights. Muntins must project past the plane of the glass instead of being tape-like or held between the glass.