PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 5, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address:	2702 Waunona Way (District 14 – Ald. Carter)
Application Type:	Conditional Use
Legistar File ID #	<u>50225</u>
Prepared By:	Sydney Prusak, Planning Division Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted
Reviewed By:	Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant & Contact:	Jesus Abreu; Bouril Design Studio, LLC; 6425 Odana Road; Madison, WI 53719
Property Owner:	Ann and Kai Thompson; 2702 Waunona Way; Madison, WI 53713

Requested Action: The applicant requests approval of a demolition permit and conditional use for an addition exceeding 500 square feet for a single-family residence on a lakefront property at 2702 Waunona Way.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to remodel the lakefront home and upgrade the existing exterior wall finishes, renovate the deck area, reconfigure the vertical circulation element, remodel the kitchen, living, bathroom, and bedroom areas, relocate the garage area, and add a new entry area. The combination of these renovations exceeds 500 square feet and requires conditional use approval. The applicant has also submitted a request for a demolition permit because the proposed renovation may cause at least fifty percent (50%) of the existing structure to be demolished and is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [M.G.O. §28.185(7)], Conditional Uses [M.G.O. §28.183] and Lakefront Development [M.G.O. §28.138]. M.G.O. §28.138(2)(a) states that additions to a principal building totaling in excess of five hundred (500) square feet during any ten (10) year period on zoning lots abutting Lake Monona and associated bays shall require conditional use approval. M.G.O. §28.211 states that by definition, any an act or process that during any ten (10) year period, removes, pulls down, tears down, razes, deconstructs or destroys fifty percent (50%) or more of the area of the exterior walls of a building is considered a demolition and requires Plan Commission approval.

Review Required By: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolition and removal, conditional uses, and lakefront development are met and **approve** the conditional use request to demolish fifty percent (50%) or more of the exterior walls of a single-family residence and construct an addition exceeding five hundred (500) square feet to a principal building in the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 1) zoning district on a lakefront property at 2702 Waunona Way. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The 12,998 square-foot (approximately 0.30-acre) subject property is located on the north side of Waunona Way, near Woodley Lane. The site is within Aldermanic District 14 (Ald. Carter) and is within the limits of the Madison Metropolitan School District.



Existing Conditions and Land Use: The subject site includes the existing 2,996-square-foot, two-story single-family home with an attached front-facing garage. The home was constructed in 1940 and has three bedrooms and two bathrooms.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Lake Monona;

South: Single-family homes zoned TR-C1;

East: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C1; and

<u>West</u>: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C1, with Esther Beach Park beyond.

Adopted Land Use Plan: Both the <u>Comprehensive Plan (2006)</u> and the <u>Broadway-Simpson-Waunona</u> <u>Neighborhood Plan (1986)</u> recommend low-density residential development for the subject site and surrounding properties.

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned TR-C1 (Traditional Residential-Consistent 1).

Requirements	Required	Proposed	
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	6,000 sq. ft.	12,998.47 sq. ft.	
Lot Width	50'	More than 50'	
Front Yard Setback	20'	Adequate	
Max. Front Yard Setback	30' or up to 20% greater than block average	Adequate	
Side Yard Setback	One-story: 6' Two-story: 7'	7'8" Northeast 8'5" Northwest	
Lakefront Yard Setback	94.7' Section 28.138(4)(a)3.	93'3" (5)	(6)
Usable Open Space	1,000 sq. ft.	Adequate	
Maximum Lot Coverage	50%	28.74%	
Maximum Building Height	2 stories/35'	2 stories ((11)

Section 28.138(4)(a)3. Lakefront Yard Setback. The median setback of the principal building on the five (5) developed lots or three hundred (300) feet on either side (whichever is less), or thirty percent (30%) of lot depth, whichever number is greater.

Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	Single-family detached dwelling:	Attached garage
	1 (location only)	
Landscaping and screening	Inventory of shoreline vegetation	Yes
Building Forms	Yes	Single-family detached dwelling

Other Critical Zoning Items	Floodplain; Utility Easements
-----------------------------	-------------------------------

Tables Prepared by Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: The property is not located in an environmental corridor.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking demolition and conditional use approval to allow an addition in excess of 500 square-feet to a single-family residence on a lakefront property. The applicant proposes to demolish 50-percent or more of the existing walls of a two-story house as part of the renovation process, which requires a demolition permit. The remodel includes upgrading the existing exterior wall finishes (replacing siding and verifying the condition of the building wrap membrane), repairing and upgrading the deck areas on the lakeside portion of the home, reconfiguring the indoor staircase, remodeling the kitchen, living, bathroom, and bedroom areas, and adding a new entry room and laundry area. The applicant also intends to remodel and expand the attached front-facing garage. Together, these renovations result in 934 square-feet of additional living space. Additionally, the applicant intends to eliminate the existing walkout to the lake and remodel deck off the back of the house which will provide access to the lakefront yard.

Analysis and Conclusion

This proposal is subject to the approval standards for Demolition and Removal, Conditional Uses and Lakefront Development.

Demolition Details & Standards

In keeping with Section 28.185(7) of the Zoning Code, the Plan Commission must find that the requested demolition and proposed use are compatible with the purpose of the demolition section and the intent and purpose of the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential- Consistent 1) zoning district. A copy of this Statement of Purpose has been included as Attachment 1. The demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider and may give decisive weight to any relevant facts including impacts on the normal and orderly development of surrounding properties, and the reasonableness of efforts to relocate the building. Furthermore, the proposal should be compatible with adopted plans. Finally, the demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's Historic Preservation Planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

Staff believes that the demolition standards can be met with this proposal. This proposal is consistent with the <u>Comprehensive Plan (2006)</u> and <u>Broadway-Simpson-Waunona Neighborhood Plan (1986)</u> recommendations for low-density residential land use. Moreover, the partial removal of the existing home is not anticipated to have a negative impact on either the normal and orderly development or the improvement of surrounding properties. Lastly, the City's Historic Preservation Planner reviewed this proposal and believes that the property has historic value related to the vernacular context of Madison's built environment, but the building itself is not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

Conditional Use Standards

The Planning Division believes that the standards for Conditional Uses can be found met. This proposal requires conditional use approval because the total renovation exceeds 500 square-feet on a lakefront parcel.

In regards to the approval standards, the Plan Commission shall not approve a conditional use without due consideration of the City's adopted plan recommendations, design guidelines, and finding that all of the conditional use standards of M.G.O. §28.183(6) are met. Standard 13 relates exclusively to lakefront development which states that "when applying the above standards to lakefront development under Sec. 28.138, the Plan Commission shall consider the height and bulk of principal buildings on the five (5) developed lots or three hundred (300) feet on either side of the lot with the proposed development." As an estimate of total bulk, staff

Legistar File ID# 50225 2702 Waunona Way March 5, 2018 Page 4

utilized City Assessor's data to estimate principal building size for the homes on the five (5) developed lots on east and west sides of the subject property. This calculation for bulk includes living areas, enclosed porches, finished and unfinished basement areas, and estimated attached garage space. Using this analysis, staff found that the principal building sizes range from approximately 2,492 to 5,182 square-feet, compared to roughly 3,450 squarefeet for the proposed principal structure (which is 12.88% **below** the median of 3,960 square-feet).

The Zoning Code's definition of bulk also includes the FAR, which compares the total building floor area (on all floors) to lot area. For example, a FAR of 1.0 indicates that the total building floor area is equal to the lot area. The calculated FAR for the adjacent lots along Waunona Way range from 0.14 to 0.39. The calculated FAR for the proposed principal structure is 0.27 compared to the 0.28 estimated median for the surrounding homes. In regards to height, the proposed home appears to be under allowable height of 35 feet.

Staff believes Conditional Use Standard #4 which states that, "The establishment of the conditional use will not impede the normal and orderly development and improvement of the surrounding property for uses permitted in the district" can be found met. This home is within the range of the bulk and FAR calculations in relation to the surrounding properties. The Planning Division believes that the Conditional Use Standards can be found met.

As noted in the project description, the applicant is requesting that the Plan Commission eliminate the M.G.O. §28.031(3) requirement that the portion of the façade that contains the garage door must be recessed at least two (2) feet behind the remainder of the façade. The code allows a reduction or a waiver on lakefront properties where it is found to be infeasible to meet this standard, and such a requirement has been waived in some previous lakefront developments. The existing house already has a 480 square-foot front facing attached garage, and the new renovated garage would be approximately 613 square-feet. Some of the surrounding lakefront properties include both attached and detached garages that are not recessed behind the balance of the home.

Lakefront Development Standards

The lakefront development standards were established to further the maintenance of safe and healthful conditions by preserving and enhancing water quality, habitats, viewsheds, and other environmental and aesthetic qualities of lakes. This section includes additional regulations including limitations on the clearing of shoreline vegetation, requirements for public sewer, environmental protections, and additional lot coverage standards. This section also includes the methodology to establish the building setback from the lake. In keeping with the Zoning Administrator's findings, Planning Staff believes that the lakefront development standards can be found met.

At the time of report writing, staff was not aware of concerns regarding this proposal.

Recommendation

Planning Division Recommendation (Contact Sydney Prusak, 243-0554)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolition and removal, conditional uses, and lakefront development are met and **approve** the conditional use request to construct an addition exceeding 500 square-feet to an existing residence in the TR-C1 zoning district on a lakefront property at 2702 Waunona Way. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Legistar File ID# 50225 2702 Waunona Way March 5, 2018 Page 5

Recommended Conditions of Approval

Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Sydney Prusak, (608) 243-0554)

1. The applicant's final sign-off plans shall include the finished-grade elevations at the building corners for approval by Planning Division Staff. The site plan submitted for final-sign off shall also include legible grade elevations.

Engineering Division (Main Office) (Contact Brenda Stanley, (608) 261-9127)

- 2. The Applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off but after all revisions have been completed, a digital CAD file (single file) to the Engineering Division with any private storm and sanitary sewer utilities. The digital CAD file shall be to scale and represent final construction. The CAD file shall be in a designated coordinate system (preferably Dane County WISCRS, US Ft). The single CAD file submittal can be either AutoCAD (dwg) Version 2013 or older, MicroStation (dgn) V8i Select Series 3 or older, or Universal (dxf) format and shall contain the only the following data, each on a separate layer name/level number:
 - a) Building Footprints
 - b) Internal Walkway Areas
 - c) Internal Site Parking Areas
 - d) Other Miscellaneous Impervious Areas (i.e. gravel, crushed stone, bituminous/asphalt, concrete, etc.)
 - e) Right-of-Way lines (public and private)
 - f) Lot lines or parcel lines if unplatted
 - g) Lot numbers or the words unplatted
 - h) Lot/Plat dimensions
 - i) Street names
 - j) Private on-site sanitary sewer utilities (including all connections to public sanitary)
 - k) Private on-site storm sewer utilities (including all connections to public storm)

All other levels (contours, elevations, etc) are not to be included with this file submittal.

NOTE: Email CAD file transmissions are preferred to: <u>bstanley@cityofmadison.com</u> (East) or <u>ttroester@cityofmadison.com</u> (West). Include the site address in the subject line of this transmittal. Any changes or additions to the location of the building, sidewalks, parking/pavement, private on-site sanitary sewer utilities, or private on-site storm sewer utilities during construction will require a new CAD file.

- The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off but after all revisions have been completed, digital PDF files to the Engineering Division. Email PDF file transmissions are preferred to: <u>bstanley@cityofmadison.com</u> (East) or <u>ttroester@cityofmadison.com</u> (West). The digital copies shall be to scale, and shall have a scale bar on the plan set. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2))PDF submittals shall contain the following information:
 - I) Building Footprints
 - m) Internal Walkway Areas
 - n) Internal Site Parking Areas
 - o) Other Miscellaneous Impervious Areas (i.e. gravel, crushed stone, bituminous/asphalt, concrete, etc.)
 - p) Right-of-Way lines (public and private)
 - q)Lot lines or parcel lines if unplatted
 - r) Lot numbers or the words unplatted
 - s) Lot/Plat dimensions
 - t) Street names
 - u) Stormwater Management Facilities
 - v) Detail drawings associated with Stormwater Management Facilities (including if applicable planting plans).

Engineering Division (Mapping) (Contact Jeffrey Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

4. The current Sanitary Sewer Easement (Doc 861664) is only 5' wide. This width is inadequate for the existing Public Sanitary Sewer Facilities. An amendment to the sanitary sewer easement shall be recorded to provide adequate width. The Applicant shall have their Surveyor locate the manholes on each side of this parcel and provide a map exhibit and legal description for an amended 10' Wide easement area. The site plan shall reflect this new easement area. Provide this information to Jeff Quamme (jrquamme@cityofmadison.com). He will set up a Real Estate project to administer the easement amendment. No improvements shall be permitted within the easement area.

Zoning (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

- 5. Show the Zoning required lakefront yard setback (94.7') on the site plan. The lakefront yard setback is the median setback of the principal building on the five (5) developed lots or three hundred (300) feet on either side (whichever is less), or thirty percent (30%) of lot depth, whichever number is greater.
- 6. Show the lakefront setback distance as measured from the Ordinary High Water Mark to the second floor deck. The second floor deck may not encroach into the lakefront yard setback.
- 7. Section 28.185(7)(a)5. requires that if a demolition or removal permit is approved, it shall not be issued until the reuse and recycling plan is approved by the Recycling Coordinator, Bryan Johnson (608-266-4682).
- Section 28.185(10) Every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185 (7)(a)5. shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition.
- 9. Section 28.185(9)(a) A demolition or removal permit is valid for one (1) year from the date of the Plan Commission.
- 10. Show the height above ground level of the deck landing and stairs connecting to the lower at-grade deck. The deck landing and stairs may not exceed three (3) feet above adjacent ground level.
- 11. Show the height of the proposed building on the elevations. The maximum height is two stories/ 35 feet. Height is the average of the height of all building facades. For each facade, height is measured from the midpoint of the existing grade to the highest point on the roof of the building or structure. No individual facade shall be more than fifteen percent (15%) higher than the maximum height of the zoning district.
- 12. Filling, grading and excavation of the zoning lot may be permitted only where protection against erosion, sedimentation and impairment of fish and aquatic life has been assured. Obtain necessary erosion control permits.
- 13. Per Section 28.186(4)(b), the property owner or operator is required to bring the property into compliance with all elements of the approved site plans by the date established by the Zoning Administrator as part of the site and building plan approval. Work with Zoning staff to establish a final site compliance date.

Fire Department (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

14. Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D. Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition

website: https://homefiresprinkler.org/building-residential-fire-sprinklers/

Water Utility (Contact Adam Wiederhoeft, (608) 266-9121)

15. All operating private wells shall be identified and permitted by the Water Utility in accordance with MGO 13.21. All unused private wells shall be abandoned in accordance with MGO 13.21.

ZONING CODE * ATTAINMENT + *

Sec. 28.040(2)

	Single-family attached	Multi-family	Nonresidential
Lot Area (sq. 19)	2,000/d.u.	2,000/d.u.	6,000
Lot Width	20/d.u.	and a state of the	50
Front Yard Setback	25	25	25
Side Yard Setback	6 (end units)	10	One-story: 6 Two-story or more: 7
Reversed Corner Side Yard Setback	12	12	25
Rear Yard	Lesser of 25% lot depth or 30	Lesser of 25% lot depth or 30	Equal to building heigh but at least 30
/laximum height	3 stories/40	4 stories/52	35
Maximum lot coverage	60%	60%	60%
Maximum building coverage	n/a	n/a	50%
Jsable open space (sq. ft. per d.u.)	500	500	The second se

28.041 TRADITIONAL RESIDENTIAL - CONSISTENT DISTRICTS.

(1)Statement of Purpose.

> The TR-C Districts are established to stabilize, protect and encourage throughout the City the essential characteristics of the residential areas typically located on the Isthmus, near East and near West portions of the City, and to promote and encourage a suitable environment for family life while accommodating a full range of life-cycle housing. The districts are also intended to:

- Promote the preservation, development and redevelopment of traditional residential (a) neighborhoods in a manner consistent with their distinct form and residential character.
- Ensure that new buildings and additions to existing buildings are designed with (b) ' sensitivity to their context in terms of building placement, facade width, height and proportions, garage and driveway placement, landscaping, and similar design features.
- Maintain and improve the viability of existing housing of all types, while providing for (c) updating of older housing in a context-sensitive manner.
- Maintain or increase compatibility between residential and other allowed uses, and (d) between different housing types, where permitted, by maintaining consistent building orientation and parking placement and screening.
- Facilitate the preservation, development or redevelopment goals of the comprehensive (e) plan and of adopted neighborhood, corridor or special area plans.