PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 5, 2018

PREPARED FOR THE PLAN COMMISSION

Project Address: 2512 Waunona Way (District 14 – Ald. Carter)

Application Type: Conditional Use

Legistar File ID # 49920

Prepared By: Sydney Prusak, Planning Division

Report Includes Comments from other City Agencies, as noted

Reviewed By: Kevin Firchow, AICP, Principal Planner

Summary

Applicant & Property Owner: Jeff Madson; 714 Oneida Place; Madison, WI 53711

Contact: Chris Schmidt; Classic Homes of Madison; 659 Rimpoche Lane; Oregon, WI 53575

Requested Action: The applicant requests a demolition permit and conditional use approval to demolish an existing, single-family home and construct a new single-family residence on a lakefront property at 2512 Waunona Way.

Proposal Summary: The applicant proposes to demolish an existing, one-story, single-family home along with the detached garage and then construct a two-story, 4,614-square-foot single-family home with an attached three-car garage on the lakefront parcel.

Applicable Regulations & Standards: This proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [MGO §28.185(7)], Lakefront Development [MGO §28.138], and Conditional Uses [MGO §28.183]. MGO §28.138(2)(a) states that all new principal buildings on zoning lots abutting Lake Monona and associated bays, shall require Conditional Use approval.

Review Required by: Plan Commission

Summary Recommendation: The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolitions, conditional uses, and lakefront development are met and **approve** the demolition and conditional use requests to demolish an existing one-story house and detached garaged and construct a single-family home in the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 1) zoning district on a lakefront property at 2512 Waunona Way. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The 19,694-square-foot (0.45-acre) subject property is located on the north side of Waunona Way, between Raywood Road and Fayette Avenue. The site is within Aldermanic District 18 (Ald. Carter) and is within the Madison Metropolitan School District.

Existing Conditions and Land Use: The subject site includes the existing 1,302-square-foot, one-story, single-family home. City Assessor's records indicate the home was constructed in 1924 and has two bedrooms and one-and-one-half bathrooms. The site also contains a detached, two-car garage.

Surrounding Land Use and Zoning:

North: Lake Monona

South: Single-family homes, zoned Traditional Residential – Consistent 1 (TR-C1);

East: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C1; and

West: Single-family homes, zoned TR-C1.

Adopted Land Use Plan: Both the <u>Comprehensive Plan (2006)</u> and the <u>Broadway-Simpson-Waunona Neighborhood Plan (1986)</u> recommend low-density residential development for the subject site and surrounding properties.

Zoning Summary: The property is zoned TR-C1 (Traditional Residential-Consistent 1).

Requirements	Required	Proposed
Lot Area (sq. ft.)	6,000 sq. ft.	19,964.25 sq. ft.
Lot Width	50'	86.84'
Front Yard Setback	20'	36'0"
Side Yard Setback	Two-story: 7'	14'4" West
		19'4" East
Lakefront Yard Setback	70.5′	Adequate (14)(15)
	Section 28.138(4)(a)1.	
Usable Open Space	1,000 sq. ft.	Adequate
Maximum Lot Coverage	50%	Less than 50%
Maximum Building Height	2 stories/35'	2 stories/less than 35'

Section 28.138(4)(a)1. <u>Lakefront Yard Setback</u>. The average setback of the principal building on the two (2) adjoining lots, provided that the setbacks of those buildings are within twenty (20) feet of one another.

Site Design	Required	Proposed
Number Parking Stalls	Single-family detached dwelling: 1	Attached garage
	(location only)	
Landscaping and Screening	Inventory of shoreline vegetation	Yes
Building Forms	Yes	Single-family detached
		dwelling

Other Critical Zoning Items	Floodplain; Utility Easements

Tables Prepared by Jenny Kirchgatter, Assistant Zoning Administrator

Environmental Corridor Status: While the property is not located in a mapped environmental corridor, the shoreline abutting Lake Monona is within a designated wetland per the DNR Wetlands Map.

Public Utilities and Services: This property is served by a full range of urban services.

Project Description

The applicant is seeking demolition and conditional use approvals to allow the demolition of an existing two-story lakefront residence and a detached garage in order to construct a two-story 4,614 square-foot single-family residence with an attached three-car garage. The new home will be located slightly south of the existing structure, closer to the street. The existing home was constructed in 1924 and has 1,302 square-feet of living area with two bedrooms and one half bathrooms. According to the applicant, the energy efficiency of the existing home is far below the current construction efficiency standards.

The proposed building is two-stories above grade with an exposed lower level facing Lake Monona and an attached side-loaded three-car garage that sits approximately 35.57 feet in front of the balance of the home. Section 28.031(3) requires that the portion of the façade that contains the garage door must be recessed at least two (2) feet behind the remainder of the façade. The Plan Commission may reduce or eliminate this requirement as part of the conditional use process in the case of lakefront lots where physical constraints make compliance infeasible.

While four large trees would be removed for the construction of the new home, no areas within 35 feet of the ordinary high water mark would be disturbed. Exterior materials for the proposed house consist of a combination of stone and EIFS. No additional landscaping is being proposed at this time.

Analysis and Conclusion

This proposal is subject to the standards for Demolition and Removal Permits [MGO §28.185(7)], Conditional Uses [MGO §28.183], and Lakefront Development [MGO §28.138].

Demolition Details & Standards

As proposed, the existing home and detached garage would be demolished. In order to approve a demolition, Section 28.185(7) of the Zoning Code states that, the Plan Commission must find that the requested demolition and proposed use are compatible with the purpose of the demolition section and the intent and purpose of the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential- Consistent 1) Zoning. The demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider and may give decisive weight to any relevant facts including impacts on the normal and orderly development of surrounding properties and the reasonableness of efforts to relocate the building. Furthermore, the proposal should be compatible with adopted plans. Finally, the demolition standards state that the Plan Commission shall consider the report of the City's Historic Preservation Planner regarding the historic value of the property as well as any report submitted by the Landmarks Commission.

Staff believes that the demolition standards can be met with this proposal. This proposal is consistent with the <u>Comprehensive Plan (2006)</u> and <u>Broadway-Simpson-Waunona Neighborhood Plan (1986)</u> recommendations for low-density residential land use. Moreover, the removal of the existing home and garage is not anticipated to have a negative impact on either the normal and orderly development or the improvement of surrounding properties. Lastly, at their November 20, 2017 meeting, the Landmarks Commission found that the building itself was not historically, architecturally, or culturally significant.

Conditional Use Standards

The Planning Division also believes the standards for Conditional Uses can be found met. In regards to the approval standards, the Plan Commission shall not approve a conditional use without due consideration of the City's adopted plan recommendations, design guidelines, and finding that all of the conditional use standards of MGO §28.183(6) are met. As stated above, staff believe the proposal is generally consistent with both the Comprehensive Plan (2006) as well as the Broadway-Simpson-Waunona Neighborhood Plan (1986).

The conditional use standard for lakefront development (Standard 13) states that "when applying the above standards to lakefront development under M.G.O. §28.138, the Plan Commission shall consider the height and bulk of principal buildings on the five (5) developed lots or three hundred (300) feet on either side of the lot with the proposed development." As an estimate of total bulk, staff utilized City Assessor's data to estimate principal building size for the homes on the five (5) developed lots on either side of the subject property. This calculation includes living areas, enclosed porches, basement areas, and estimated attached garage space. Using this analysis, staff found that the principal building sizes range from approximately 2,101 to 6,244 square feet. The median size

of the surrounding homes is approximately 3,515 square feet, compared to the roughly 4,614 square feet for the proposed principal structure (which is 31.27% percent above the median).

The Zoning Code's definition of bulk also includes FAR, or floor area ratio, which compares the total building floor area (on all floors) to lot area. (A FAR of 1.0 would indicate that the total building floor area is equal to the lot area.) The calculated FAR for the proposed principal structure is 0.23, which is 8 percent below the estimated median 0.25 FAR for the surrounding homes. In regards to height, the proposed home appears to be under the maximum allowable height of 35 feet, at 28.33 feet when measured from the first floor line. Staff notes that the heights of the surrounding homes are varied, consisting of primarily two-story structures.

Lakefront Development Standards

The lakefront development standards were established to further the maintenance of safe and healthful conditions by preserving and enhancing water quality, habitats, viewsheds, and other environmental and aesthetic qualities of lakes. This section includes additional regulations including limitations on the clearing of shoreline vegetation, requirements for public sewer, environmental protections, and additional lot coverage standards. This section also includes the methodology to establish the building setback from the lake. MGO §28.138(3)(c) states that "filling, grading, and excavation of the zoning lot may be permitted only where protection against erosion, sedimentation, and impairment of fish and aquatic life has been assured." The applicant has noted a retaining wall on the east of the proposed house in order as an erosion control measure.

Staff notes that while none of the subject site is not located in a mapped environmental corridor and a small portion of the property adjacent to the lake appears to be located in a designated wetland per the DNR wetlands map. However, there is no construction or changes proposed anywhere near the sensitive 35 feet of land adjacent to the lake's edge and therefore, staff believe the lakefront development standards are met.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the Planning Division believes that the standards for Demolition and Removal, Lakefront Development, and Conditional Uses can be met. The new home is believed to be compatible with the varied development pattern along Woodward Drive. This proposal is also believed to be consistent with the Comprehensive Plan as well as the Broadway-Simpson-Waunona Neighborhood Plan (1986). The proposed house is not significantly larger than the adjacent properties in terms of bulk, FAR, or height.

At the time of report writing, staff was not aware of additional concerns regarding this proposal.

Recommendation

<u>Planning Division Recommendation</u> (Contact Sydney Prusak, (608) 243-0554)

The Planning Division recommends that the Plan Commission find that the standards for demolitions, conditional uses, and lakefront development are met and approve the demolition and conditional use requests to demolish an existing one-story house and construct a single-family home the TR-C1 (Traditional Residential – Consistent 1) zoning district on a lakefront property at 2512 Waunona Way. This recommendation is subject to input at the public hearing and the conditions recommended by the reviewing agencies.

Recommended Conditions of Approval Major/Non-Standard Conditions are Shaded

Planning Division (Contact Sydney Prusak, (608) 243-0554)

1. The following information is provided for the reference of the applicant as many lakefront properties are associated with locations of Native effigy mounds and archaeological sites.

Burial Sites Preservation (§ 157.70):

- (2r) Site Disturbance Prohibited. Except as provided under subs (4) and (5) and State Statute 157.111 and 157.112, no person may intentionally cause or permit the disturbance of a burial site or catalogued land contiguous to a catalogued burial site.
- (3) Report of Disturbed Burial Sites. (a) Except as provided under s. 979.01, a person shall immediately notify the Wisconsin Historical Society (608-264-6502) if the person knows or has reasonable grounds to believe that a burial site or the cataloged land contiguous to a cataloged burial site is being disturbed or may be disturbed contrary to the requirements of subs. (4) and (5).

Many lakefront properties are associated with locations of Native American effigy mounds and archeological sites. This site is known to be associated with archeological and historic resources. The Burial Sites Preservation statute requires that the property owner contact the Wisconsin Historical Society to discuss the location of the proposed project and any possible disturbance of an archaeological or historic resource before the work commences. During the construction work, if a burial site disturbance occurs, the work shall stop immediately until the Wisconsin Historical Society is able to assess the site.

2. The applicant's final sign-off plans shall include a grading plan that labels the finished-grade elevations at the building corners for approval by Planning Division staff.

Engineering Division (Main Office) (Contact Brenda Stanley, (608) 261-9127)

- 3. Prior to approval, the owner or owner's representative shall obtain a permit to plug each existing sanitary sewer lateral that serves a building which is proposed for demolition. For each lateral to be plugged the owner shall complete a sewer lateral plugging application and pay the applicable permit fees. The permit application is available on line at http://www.cityofmadison.com/engineering/permits.cfm. (MGO CH 35.02(14))
- 4. All outstanding Madison Metropolitan Sewerage District (MMSD) charges are due and payable prior to Engineering sign-off, unless otherwise collected with a Developer's / Subdivision Contract. Contact Mark Moder (608-261-9250) to obtain the final MMSD billing a minimum of two (2) working days prior to requesting City Engineering signoff. (MGO16.23(9)(d)(4)
- 5. The site plan shall be revised to show all existing public sanitary sewer facilities in the project area as well as the size, invert elevation, and alignment of the proposed service. (POLICY)
- 6. The site plans shall be revised to show the location of all rain gutter down spout discharges. (POLICY)
- 7. The plan set shall be revised to show more information on proposed drainage for the site. This shall be accomplished by using spot elevations and drainage arrows or through the use of proposed contours. It is necessary to show the location of drainage leaving the site to the public right-of-way. It may be necessary to provide information off the site to fully meet this requirement. (POLICY)
- 8. The applicant shall submit, prior to plan sign-off but after all revisions have been completed, digital PDF files to the Engineering Division. Email PDF file transmissions are preferred to: bstanley@cityofmadison.com (East) or ttroester@cityofmadison.com (West). The digital copies shall be to scale, and shall have a scale bar on the plan set. (POLICY and MGO 37.09(2))PDF submittals shall contain the following information: a) Building Footprints b) Internal Walkway Areas c) Internal Site Parking Areas d) Other Miscellaneous Impervious Areas

(i.e. gravel, crushed stone, bituminous/asphalt, concrete, etc.) e) Right-of-Way lines (public and private) f) Lot lines or parcel lines if unplatted g) Lot numbers or the words unplatted h) Lot/Plat dimensions i) Street names j) Stormwater Management Facilities k) Detail drawings associated with Stormwater Management Facilities (including if applicable planting plans).

Engineering Division (Mapping) (Contact Jeffrey Quamme, (608) 266-4097)

- 9. The Survey and Site Plan shall show the location and denote the Ordinary High Water Elevation and limits per the published elevation of 845.82. All ties on the site plan shall be adjusted accordingly.
- 10. The description on the site plan on sheet 7 shall be modified to read: The East half of Lot 4, all of Lot 5, Block 1, Hoboken Beach, City of Madison, Dane County, WI.

Zoning (Contact Jenny Kirchgatter, (608) 266-4429)

- 11. Section 28.185(7)(a)5. requires that if a demolition or removal permit is approved, it shall not be issued until the reuse and recycling plan is approved by the Recycling Coordinator, Bryan Johnson (608-266-4682).
- 12. Section 28.185(10) Every person who is required to submit a reuse and recycling plan pursuant to Section 28.185(7)(a)5. shall submit documents showing compliance with the plan within sixty (60) days of completion of demolition.
- 13. Section 28.185(9)(a) A demolition or removal permit is valid for one (1) year from the date of the Plan Commission.
- 14. Identify and label the Ordinary High Water Mark on the site plan.
- 15. Show the lakefront setback distance on the site plan as measured from the Ordinary High Water Mark to the closest part of the proposed deck or stairs elevated three (3) feet or more in height above adjacent ground level. The elevated deck and portion of the stairs elevated more than three (3) feet in height above adjacent ground level must meet the lakefront yard setback.
- 16. Filling, grading and excavation of the zoning lot may be permitted only where protection against erosion, sedimentation and impairment of fish and aquatic life has been assured. Obtain necessary erosion control permits.
- 17. Per Section 28.186(4)(b), the property owner or operator is required to bring the property into compliance with all elements of the approved site plans by the date established by the Zoning Administrator as part of the site and building plan approval. Work with Zoning staff to establish a final site compliance date.

<u>Fire Department</u> (Contact Bill Sullivan, (608) 261-9658)

- 18. Madison Fire Department recommends the installation of a residential fire sprinkler system in accordance with NFPA 13D. Additional information is available at the Home Fire Sprinkler Coalition website: https://homefiresprinkler.org/building-residential-fire-sprinklers
- 19. Please consider allowing Madison Fire Dept. to conduct training sequences prior to demolition. Contact MFD Training Division to discuss possibilities: Division Chief Tracy Burrus at tburrus@cityofmadison.com or (608)266-5959.