PENNSYLVANIA PARK NEIGHBORHOOD COMMENTS

1) Sara Krauskopf

I live in the EENA neighborhood and pass through the proposed Pennsylvania park regularly on the way to my home. I live about 3 blocks from the location. I have looked through the proposals (I cannot see Zhau's piece. The link doesn't work.) and I am sending you the names of the artists I do not like followed by a few I like.

Please do not choose:

- Cristina Parreño Alonso (too modern, glass is impractical)
- <u>Deedee Morrison</u> (style also too modern, doesn't fit neighborhood, expensive pieces)
- Kathryn Martin--I do not like her campus pieces, not very imaginative, dull look
- Patrick Sullivan--ok, but a bit boxy. If he does something that isn't a box shape, might be ok
- Serrano--don't want people, prefer more abstract. If we use people we will argue over who to represent or not represent
- Ken Saiki--I have always disliked Path of Voices work as sterile and ugly (I know the content and it is not even an inviting spot to listen to the stories). the Verona public project is ok, more color and recognizable shapes.

I do like Ray Chi--whimsical, interactive and inviting
I like Shephen Fairfield--whimsical, interactive, inviting
I like Actual art size--natural feel, interactive, whimsical
I like Calderon and Delgado--bright, natural images

2) Kayne Neigherbauer

Thank you for coming to the EENA meeting last night. I wanted to provide my feedback on the proposals for Pennsylvania Park.

I particularly liked Ray Chi's proposal, not only based on his previous work photos, but his excitement to work with East High kids and really getting into the idea of inclusion in our request for art. His enthusiasm for the idea was clear. His photos seemed to be interesting, engaging, and appropriate pieces of art for the sites. Nothing overblown or over-the-top. Tasteful. contrasting, and engaging.

I also enjoyed the previous work of Cristina Parreño Alonso. The photos, especially the tower and wall pieces I found to be very exciting. She seems to be capable of something

a little more grand and attention grabbing, which I would be happy with for our park/neighborhood as we are an overlooked neighborhood in the city. I like the fact that a lot of the previous work used light in an internal glowing effect. This was something I liked in other proposals as well, the use of LED lighting etc, so long as it isn't too bright or overbearing. I think the site requires something that people can enjoy from the street (and will grad their attention from there) but also won't bother neighbors or those biking or walking by at night.

I enjoyed other ideas along the lines of evocative geometric shapes and contrasting elements from the surroundings, which I feel both of these artists are capable of. Other submissions seems either too subdued for the site (I want passersby to remember this PLACE) or too gaudy and not suited for Madison (some of the desert sited work).

Thanks for hearing our input and helping us in the place-making process of our improved park! (And sitting through our boring meetings)

3) Gail Piper (note: comments continue to next solid line)

I just spent a few hours looking over all the applications. (Stick me with a fork -- I'm done. I felt like I was back in college doing an assignment.)

Anyway, here are my observations and comments. I hope I wasn't too wordy in them, but you will notice I said less and less as I got more and more tired!

I hope you got my photos of the park in the afternoon sun....

Team of Calderón / Delgado RLD Studio, Inc. (#1 on list)

I like the proposed involvement with the community, especially local schools in that we have both an elementary and high school in our neighborhood.

In addition, I love the colorful shapes that upon closer look are images of people and places. That would make the artwork appealing from a distance (the car and bike traffic) but even more intriguing to those who pass by on foot who can get a closer look. I especially like image #1. While some EENA members said providing a place to sit is a potential problem, I disagree with that. As a person who walks by there all the time I would love a place to sit a rest a few minutes. I think providing that would not be an issue in that location.

I would rate this proposal a 10. I love it.

Cristina Parreño Alonso (#2)

I do not think her artwork as shown in the examples provided have the look or feel of what I am envisioning for this location. (personal opinion, of course)

I would rule this one out.

Morrison Studio (#3)

This one gets points for the solar powered lighting aspect of the artwork, if that is indeed feasible at the project site. The sustainability aspect of that lighting is a major plus.

As for design, the examples provided are all over the board -- from intricate scrollwork to geometric clean lines.

I rate this proposal a 9. But the solar lighting might be a stumbling block.

stutz-dinh (#4)

From pricing on the image list, we would not get much of an item for our budget.

I would rule this one out.

Keven Brunett (#5)

While I like the statements about what the artwork should reflect and the knowledge the artist has of Madison, the Isthmus, etc., I don't think glass would be a good medium and the other samples that are metal (weathervanes) look easily damaged by wind, etc. Perhaps he would come up with something less fragile? The weathervanes and mobius examples he sited as prime examples look like they would not hold upl.

Positives: He does suggest artwork that would engage both the moving traffic and have further interest upon closer inspection enjoyed by foot traffic. I like that.

I would consider this one as long as the artwork is durable. And, I am not excited about moving things in the space, but that's my personal opinion.

kathryn e. martin (#6)

This artist has local ties, which I like. The samples provided aren't too appealing to me (exception is the stainless steel sculpture at Chadborne Hall in Madison). But the wide range of artwork she has shown in the photos tells me she is flexible and would work with us to develop something appropriate for the space.

P. Sullivan (#7)

I love these stone sculptures. I especially love the ones with some colored art on them. Downside to these -- there would be very little chance for people to see the back of one if placed in Penna Park. Exception would be foot traffic, which I suppose could make it a bit interesting in that the artist could put something intriguing and surprising on the "back" for only people on foot to see. I envision something relating to sustainability -- and the people on bikes who stop and walk around the statue, or the person on foot who ventures over to see it and walk around it, would be thanked somehow or praised for promoting sustainability by walking and/or biking.

(Actually, that aspect of any artwork placed there could be considered when discussing things with the artist chosen to do the work.)

I rate this one a solid 10. (plus the image list pricing looks ball park for us)

RAY CHI (#8)

This Wisconsin (points for that) artist mentions being an architect helps him with "challenges of structure, safety and durability", which I feel is very important. He values "function and interactivity" with his pieces, which some people in EENA seemed to frown upon (eg no benches), but I do not object and like the idea as long as the piece can take the potential abuse handed to it by local high school students. But, he is into durability plus he is an educator so he knows kids.

His example entitled "pebble forms" especially appeals to me.

Stephen Fairfield (#9)

Another artist who might incorporate solar lighting, if feasible, of course. Price of that interesting example was beyond our budget, however...

I like that he used nature in most of the samples provided and that he suggests perhaps working with students from East High.

Urbanrock Design (#10)

I'm struggling to come up with a nice way to say the samples do not appeal to me at all. Most have very strong lines and angles and look a bit too industrial to me. Given that fact, they DO say their work is very site-specific.

My personal opinion is to rule them out even though they are probably ok budget-wise.

Suikang Zhao (#11)

Probably out of our price range.

Linda Serrao

I love her piece "One World", an orb with carvings. But, she seems to do more human figures and I don't recall anyone saying they wanted statues of people in the park. I think it would kind of unsettling at night for bikers and people getting of the bus at that corner.

Pereyra-Hunter-Matioc (#12)

I'm afraid I personally do not care much for any of the artwork submitted as examples. I know Mr. Hunter is local. but I still do not think they should be considered. Sorry.

Actual Size Artworks (#13)

Wide variety of budgets, materials, and shapes, etc in the examples provided. This team would probably be very flexible in both theme, effect, and look of the final piece.

KSD (#14)

In that an emerging artist is part of this team, I think they should be seriously considered. My only concern is that Ms Belknap seems to be very much into detail and I'm not sure highly detailed artwork is suitable for the site in that most people viewing it would be driving or biking by.

At the EENA meeting this week neighbors were saying the park doesn't get sunshine due to it facing North, when it actually faces Northwest along Johnson Street -- same as my house, and I can't grow shade plants in my front yard due to all the mid-day and afternoon sun. (The end at Second Street does face more North...)

It was also stated that shadows on the grass would not be very visible or effective. My photos attached beg to disagree with that statement.

Karin Wolf was wondering if it really does or does not get that afternoon sunshine, so yesterday the sun cooperated and made a nice appearance.

I walked over at 3pm and took a few pictures and sent them to Karin. I made reference to them in my email to her with comments, so I though I should share them with you as well, especially if this issue comes up at future discussions. (I have a nice short, panoramic video I took with my iPhone but it's kind of a big file and hard to email.)

It's true the trees in the center of the park provide some nice shade but there is plenty of space with plenty of afternoon sunshine at the First Street end of the space, even back from the space that city engineering is claiming as theirs.

See you Monday at 3pm at Supercharge.





4) Indira Ceylan

Once again, as Emerson East resident and EENA Co-Chait I thank you for coming to the EENA meeting on Wednesday and for staying until at 8:30pm! I appreciate your experience and helpful guidance through this process.

Please find my comments and thoughts regarding the 15 submissions below.

Thank you!

Comments by Indira Ceylan, Emerson East resident, regarding Pennsylvania Park Public Art Submissions, November 17, 2017:

I'm intrigued by a characteristic in several submissions: the artwork that resembles natural objects, especially over-sized ones. For example: "Host" by Actual Size

Artworks, the planter acorn, "Frog for Dinner" by Stephen Fairfield, "Wolf Plaza" by Michael Stutz and James Dinh, and "Pebbleworks" by Ray Chi. These works have a playful character and connect nicely to the neighbors' enthusiasm for local food,

gardening, pets, and sustainability. **Emily Belknap**'s artwork makes me think that she could be part of a project that creates artwork with this kind of character.

The use of <u>natural materials</u> that several artists employ is great and fits with how this neighborhood self-identifies. Examples: Use of urban ash wood by <u>Adrian Pereyra, Ben Hunter, and Stefan Matioc</u>, <u>"Palo Verde" by Jose Calderon and Roberto Delgado</u>, and especially the playful and dynamic grass scapes of <u>"Serpent" by Ray Chi</u>.

Among the abstract art, I like the aesthetic of the <u>laser cut and colorful/lit sculptures</u> by <u>Deedee Morrison such as "Borrowed Light"</u>. The idea of having solar powered light in the park is great, especially since it lights up the art and not the too much the are (nuisance for nearby residents).

It would be great to see <u>Adrian Pereyra, Ben Hunter, and Stefan Matioc</u> move on to the next round. This is due to the aesthetics of their works and since they <u>are as local as you can be</u>. They have relevant experience, yet it seems this might be there largest public Art project yet - so I would hope to see something that is different from their previous works but draws on our community's strengths and uniqueness.

<u>Cristina Parreño Alonso describes a process</u> in her submission that sounds very desirable as it heavily relies on input from the neighborhood while it prefers the artist's desire to his or her own expression. It would be even more desirable to see a newcomer and local artist employ this kind of process. Perhaps the lack of clarity that this is the newcomer's desire is due to their limited experience with RFQs? Newcomers I would welcome to engage in this process are <u>Kathryn Martin</u> or <u>Saiki Design and Emily Belknap</u>.

I'm <u>not</u> intrigued by the aesthetics of <u>Linda Serrao</u> and <u>Patrick Liam Sullivan</u>. Theirs styles seem a little outdated and predictable to me and don't fit with our neighborhood identifying as young, contemporary, and innovative.

5) Diane Farsetta

Thank you for coming to the EENA meeting last week and for compiling people's input for the MAC subcommittee meeting! I look forward to hearing who the subcommittee invites to the site visit.

Overall, my preferences are for artwork that:

- is by Wisconsin artists
- uses natural and/or reclaimed materials
- is more abstract and whimsical

- is engaging year-round e.g., visible and interesting after a heavy snow
- can engage people as they move through or by the park (pedestrians, bicyclists and drivers), perhaps on different levels

Of the submissions, I especially like Ray Chi's for his use of natural materials and engaging forms; Ken Saiki Design for the strong visual impact; and Actual Size Artworks for their integration of the natural landscape into their work. I also appreciate the process, thoughtfulness and local roots of the Pereyra, Hunter and Matioc submission, though their work examples feel more distant from what I envision for Pennsylvania Park.

6) Barb Jenkin

I have looked at all 15 submissions. Here are my top 4 picks (not in any order of preference): Calderon & Delgado, Stutz & Dinh, Stephen Fairfield, and Actual Size Artwork.

7) Tracey Teodecki, SRES

Hi there - I like the idea of having something to sit on with lighting at night. I really don't like big concrete forms

Urban Rock - Angle of Repose Actual Size - Sown Ray Chi - Serpent and Pebble forms

8) Terri Pepper

1 - Jose Calderon and Roberto Delgado

My personal favorite from a design perspective. Appears very durable and well suited to high traffic/transit areas. With their approach of including a large number of images in colorful design, there would be the potential for many aspects of our diverse community to be visually represented. Also, given the emphasis on the park as a path/corridor, I like that artwork in the pavement itself would be an option.

2 - Deedee Morrison

I think this artist's focus on sustainability & solar power would be a good match for our project. I appreciate her description of the research she does in representing a meaningful aspect of the area's biodiversity in her work.

3 - Various local/Wisconsin artists

I would be interested to see one of the Wisconsin-based artists invited to submit a proposal.

I plan to attend the 3pm meeting at Supercharge. Thanks for finding a neighborhood location!

9) Janet Parker

Thank you so much, Commissioners and Karin, for all your work to bring art to our city, and to our neighborhood park! I am glad to be able to give input regarding the RFQ process from teams proposing art work in Pennsylvania Park. I live a few blocks away, on Upham Street, and I bike and walk through the park almost daily.

I love the application from Pereyra - Hunter - Matioc. How fantastic to have these vibrant artists apply from our own neighborhood! I already knew their public work in recent years, and am delighted with their spirit and commitments to environmental sustainability.

I love what I see in their application. They stand out because of the spark they would bring artistically, as well as the small ecological footprint and community interweaving they would offer by working close at hand. Re-purposed materials, youth, community involvement, Sector 67 ... Wow!

The Chi application also stands out for me. He's created appealing public work, and he's nearby in Wi

10) Linda Uitvlugt

I think it's great that the art department asks the locals for input on the public art in their neighborhood.

My number one preference is Linda Serrano. I would love to see a large bronze statue of

a woman walking her dog as this is the area that all the women in the neighborhood (and there are a lot of them) walk with their dogs. All sorts of women and dogs. My second favorite is Stutz/Dinn. Again something around women and dogs would be very cool.

11) Chris Heaton

Jose Calderon and Roberto Delgado

I like the vertical murals, however since the park doesn't not have any vertical surfaces at present, I assume it will more likely be a mural on the horizontal surface such as the bike path. I found their examples of the horizontal murals less appealing. I also worry, if inlayed into the bike path, the durability in this climate- (the examples in Minnesota were vertical). I prefer the more abstract and primitive animal images rather the images of people.

Cristina Parreño Alonso

I liked their use of solid transparent shape creation. The Tectotranparenency I thought was wonderful, (however i am aware that it is only 1'x1'x1'). I isn't what i envisioned for the area but I could imagine something like The Wall or Tectotranparenency would look beautiful riding past. I didn't like the Tower as much. I wonder about lighting/power and if it will be available at the site?

Deedee Morrison

I have problems seeing their work translated to park. Not a fan of the Global Convergence, however i am impressed with the work that went into it. I do like the Parallel Frames of Frames of reference, is beautiful but as I said to get an artwork with the same effect, I am not sure how it would translate.

Michael Stutz and James Dinh

While Michael Stutz work is totally beautiful and would look great in any park, to get an artwork with the same effect seems out of our price range. James Dinh Circles of a Ripple is lovely, I don't think seating is what we want in the small park and anyway it is again out of our price range.

Keven Brunett

The tables are breath-taking but I am not sure how to translate them to this project. I feel for the tall artworks, Source and Kinetic Model, while beautiful, to get an artwork with the same effect, its height would be disadvantage here, since most of the patrons of the park's artwork will be in biking past and not look up.

Kathryn E. Martin

They have shown a wide range of styles and so it is hard for me to imagine what they might come up with in the instance. Topos really spoke to me, however with no vertical

surfaces at the park currently, it might not work here. Also outdoor WI weather is a factor. While Prowess could be an example of what the artist might do in the park, my first thought that the tubes would be full of leaves and a nesting place for rats and alike. The Ellipsoid and A Place to Sit, didn't really inspire me and I could not see it working in park. But their variety does show a flexibility to the environment the artwork will life in and so that is a plus.

Patrick Liam Sullivan

While very striking and beautiful, I would worry that to get an artwork with the same effect, the artwork 'weight' would unbalance the park. Motion, with its shallower depth, does seem to express less weight and therefore gives me hope that stone carving on this scale might work. I am worried that the budget might not be significant to get a powerful stone carving.

Ray Chi

The Serpent and Rack are my favourite. They are whimsical and both I feel would work in the park, esp as art the will be enjoyed by bikers and walkers without needing them to stop. They are within budget and since they are at Milwaukee, I assume will stand the climate. I do wonder about water needs and grass/plant maintenance. The pebbles are nice too, I wonder about maintenance and, since they are not actual rock, what is their weight limit?

Stephen Fairfield

I really like the Frog for Dinner; simple but striking. The artworks with light while could be fun I wonder about accessibility to power (and/or sun since they do use solar panels) and distraction to drivers. The rings are a great representation of the gateway to the neighborhood, however to get an artwork with the same effect might be out of our price range.

UrbanRock Design

Half of their examples are seating related that I don't think is the direction we want to be going. An artwork with the same effect, as inside outside could look really nice, in the afternoon with the shadows going across the bike paths. However due to the limit sunlight hours for 4/5 months or the year, the majority of people commuting through the park will not see this effects in those months, unless there was artificial lighting.

Linda Serrao

I don't think her artwork is what we are looking for. But I do appreciate that "[t]hey can be touched and handled, becoming a physical and visual part of the art experience." and I do think touch is important in any artwork for this park.

Suikang Zhao

An artwork similar to Hands, would be a great gateway to the neighborhood, however the cost of it might make a similar artwork impossible. Most of their work is either inside or outside on vertical surfaces so I find it hard to imagine their art would work in the park. I find the books creepy.

Adrian Pereyra, Ben Hunter, and Stefan Matioc

Their submission shows that they con definitely work in small budgets. The YumYum standing tables are creative use of functional words. I am worried that there is no examples of outdoor permanent artworks that are not painted murals or the Tricor sign. If they could translate the one-line murals to a free standing metal sculpture (like the YumYum tables) I think that could work very well in the space.

Actual Size Artworks

Sown really spoke to me and I thought it would be wonderful to have a series of similar light post lining the path, but i think they might be out of our price range. I would be worried about any art like Host, would become a habitat for rats and alike.

Ken Saiki Design

While I do think Emily Belknap is a talented artist, her lack of experience is an obvious disadvantage. There is a good team collaborating with her but this lack outdoor public art, I have problems seeing their work translated to park.

Over all my top picks are (on order):

- 1.Ray Chi
- 2.Cristina Parreño Alonso
- 3. Adrian Pereyra, Ben Hunter, and Stefan Matioc
- 4. Stephen Fairfield
- 5.Kathryn E. Martin
- 6.Ken Saiki Design

12) Brian Spindel

Thanks for giving neighbors the opportunity to review the work of artists competing for the project to put public art in Pennsylvania Avenue.

I have reviewed all proposals, and have these general thoughts and one recommendation:

- Foremost, the art should be vandalism/graffiti-resilient. The park is 3 blocks from East High School, so there is strong potential for damage.
- Perhaps the art should reflect the industrial character of the neighborhood? Wisconsin-Southern rail yard is across the street from the park, as is a

concrete industrial/warehouse facility, and of course Oscar Mayer 1/2 mile down the street.

- Color is a good thing. Lighting to keep that color alive after dark and to discourage damage would be good, too.

There are plenty of carved/painted rock/concrete sculptures throughout the City. Perhaps that concept is overdone. However, given they are sturdy, damage-resilient, and grounded, maybe 'Picture This' by Urban Rock Design would be wise. This piece/concept brings a height aspect, which along with bold color would keep the art from fading into background.