

## PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

July 31, 2017

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



**Project Name/Address:** 11 N Allen

**Application Type:** PUBLIC HEARING  
Alterations and Addition over 100 square feet in the University Heights Historic District

**Legistar File ID #** [47997](#)

**Prepared By:** Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

**Date Prepared:** July 17, 2017

### Summary

**Project Applicant/Contact:** James McFadden

**Requested Action:** The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations and for the construction of an addition over 100 square feet in the University Heights Historic District.

### Background Information

**Parcel Location:** The subject site is located on Regent Street in the University Heights Historic District

#### Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Sections:

- 41.18 STANDARDS FOR GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS.** A certificate of appropriateness shall be granted only if the proposed project complies with this chapter, including all of the following standards that apply.
- (1) New construction or exterior alteration. The Landmarks Commission shall approve a certificate of appropriateness for exterior alteration or construction only if:
    - (a) N/A
    - (b) N/A
    - (c) In the case of exterior alteration or construction on any property located in a historic district, the proposed exterior alteration or construction meets the adopted standards and guidelines for that district.
    - (d) In the case of any exterior alteration or construction for which a certificate of appropriateness is required, the proposed work will not frustrate the public interest expressed in this ordinance for protecting, promoting, conserving, and using the City's historic resources.
- 41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.**
- (6) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs in the TR-VI, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, NMX, TSS and LMX Zoning Districts.
    - (a) Height. No alterations shall be higher than the existing structure; however, if the existing structure is already nonconforming, no alteration shall be made thereto except in accordance with Section 28.192 of the Madison General Ordinances. In addition, all alterations, including alterations to the top of a structure, shall conform to the height restrictions for the zoning district in which the structure is located.
    - (b) Alterations. Alterations shall be compatible in scale, materials and texture with the existing structure.

- (c) Repairs. Materials used in repairs shall harmonize with the existing materials in texture, color and architectural detail.
- (d) Re-Siding. The standards for the review of re-siding are the same as the standards for review of re-siding in the TR-C2, TR-C3 and TR-C4 Zoning Districts set forth in sec. 41.24(5)e.
- (e) Roof Shape. Roof alterations to provide additional windows, headroom or area are prohibited unless permitted under Chapter 28 of the Madison General Ordinances or otherwise approved pursuant thereto as a variance or as part of a conditional use. In addition, all roof alterations shall be visually compatible with the architectural design of the structure.
- (f) Roof Materials. All repairs shall match in appearance the existing roofing materials; however, when a roof is covered or replaced, roofing materials shall duplicate as closely as practicable the appearance of the original materials. Thick wood shakes, French method, interlock and Dutch lap shingles are prohibited. Rolled roofing, tar and gravel and other similar roof materials are also prohibited except on flat or slightly sloped roofs which are not visible from the street.
- (g) Parking Lots. No new parking lots will be approved unless they are accessory to and on the same zoning lot as a commercial structure or multiple family dwelling.

## Analysis and Conclusion

41.18(1)(c) Instructs the Landmarks Commission to use the standards of 41.24(6) to determine the appropriateness of the proposed alterations and addition. A discussion of the standards of 41.24(6) follows:

- (a) The height of the proposed rear addition is lower than the existing structure. The existing building is two stories with a pitched roof and the proposed addition is one story with a pitched roof.
- (b) The proposed alterations and repairs include the painting of existing window frames and siding, installing new light fixtures and a new sign, installing a new side stair, constructing a rear addition and other items. Proposed alterations requiring additional information include the replacement of soffits, constructing a new door in the rear brick wall of the existing building, infilling a portion of the existing rear window to accommodate the proposed addition, brick and concrete restoration, replacing all or a portion of the transom, and installing awnings. For repairs (c) and alterations (b), the work shall be compatible in scale, materials, texture, and architectural details with the existing structure. With additional information from the applicant, the Landmarks Commission shall determine the appropriateness of the work.
- (c) Please review discussion of alterations (b) above.
- (d) The proposed beveled siding of the new addition is similar to the existing siding at the upper level of the building.
- (e) The existing roof shape will not be affected by the proposed alterations and addition. The proposed addition roof shape is a gabled form and the pitch of the new roof will match the pitch of the existing.
- (f) The roof materials are not specified, but are drawn to look like standard asphalt shingles. The Applicant shall confirm the type of shingles proposed for the addition.
- (g) This standard is not applicable as a parking lot is not part of the proposal.

## Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting the Certificate of Appropriateness for the alterations and new addition may be met and recommends approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions of approval:

1. The Applicant shall indicate the roof shingle material.
2. The Applicant shall provide more information about the replacement of soffits, constructing a new door in the rear brick wall of the existing building, infilling a portion of the existing rear window to accommodate the proposed addition, brick and concrete restoration, replacing all or a portion of the transom, and installing awnings. The Landmarks Commission shall determine if the work is compatible with the scale, materials, texture, and architectural details of the existing structure.
3. The Applicant shall provide the exposure of the proposed siding and the existing siding to confirm that the dimensions are similar and will create a similar appearance.
4. The Applicant shall provide more information about the proposed sign.