TOF MAD SO

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name/Address: E Gorham and N Blair PUD-SIP

Application Type: Planned Unit Development conditions of approval for properties on E Gorham

and N Blair Streets

Legistar File ID # 46892

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: April 23, 2017

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Mike Fisher, Gorham Apartments LLC

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting Landmarks Commission review of rehabilitation

work related to properties located on E Gorham and N Blair Streets in

accordance with conditions of approval in the original PUD-SIP.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject sites are located at 315, 319 and 323 North Blair Street and 615, 619 and 623 E Gorham Street.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

The Landmarks Commission review of this request relates to PUD-SIP language which states:

K. Individual Building Plans: The final architectural and landscaping details for the individual buildings located at 315-323 N. Blair Street and 601-625 E. Gorham Street shall be approved by city staff and the Landmarks Commission prior to issuance of the permits for construction. Plan submittals shall include a detailed site plan, contextual site information, the existing and proposed interior floor plans, building elevations with materials and colors, and a building specific perimeter landscaping will be planted on each site as part of the individual building renovation (the landscaping of the central area will occur as part of the construction of the E. Johnson Street apartment buildings). The plans will be reviewed by the Planning and Building Inspection staff for compliance with the PUD-SIP and the applicable building codes. In addition, the exterior renovations will be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission for aesthetic appearance and compatibility within the surrounds given due consideration to the location of the building within the National Historic District. After approval by Planning staff and the Landmarks Commission, plans may be presented to the Building Inspection Department for review and a building permit requested. Any appeal of the staff decision shall be made to the Plan Commission for consideration.

Analysis and Conclusion

Taken from the language above, the Landmarks Commission shall use this language for the review of this proposal:

The exterior renovations will be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission for aesthetic appearance and compatibility within the surrounds given due consideration to the location of the building[s] within the National [Register] Historic District.

<u>623 E Gorham</u> The front porch update and the removal of the rear enclosed porches enhance the appearance and highlight the historic qualities of the building. The Applicant shall confirm the treatment of the decorative leaded glass window.

619 E Gorham As the Applicant was preparing the plans for the alterations, there was discussion about the existing front porch columns and the architectural style of the house. The existing form could be considered a vernacular Queen Anne which would suggest that the existing Classical front porch columns and porch detailing would be appropriate. The stucco and horizontal banding and brick column bases relate to a Craftsman/Prairie Style and may be later alterations or may be original vernacular hybrid style treatments. The residence was constructed in 1904 which would be early for Craftsman/Prairie style influences so it is most likely that these Prairie/Craftsman features were later additions and resulted in this hybrid style. Because the stucco, horizontal banding and brick column bases are not being removed during this work and because the existing Classical porch columns are in poor condition, the decision was made to add features that are compatible with the hybrid style. The proposed alterations will enhance the appearance.

<u>615 E Gorham</u> The proposed banks of new windows, replacement of front faux dormer window, and change in dormer siding color will enhance the appearance and highlight the historic qualities of the building.

323 N Blair The addition of the roof at the turret and the construction of a wrapped front porch will enhance the appearance of the Queen Anne structure and highlight historic qualities of the building.

319 N Blair The removal of the front porch enclosure and creation of an open air porch and installation of new columns to match existing square column will enhance the appearance and highlight historic qualities of the building.

<u>315 N Blair</u> The update to the front entry and the side entry and the removal of shutters will enhance the appearance and highlight historic qualities of the building.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the proposed alterations generally enhance the appearances of the buildings and highlight historic qualities and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. Applicant shall confirm the treatment of the leaded glass window at 623 E Gorham. The retention and repair of an original leaded glass feature should be a priority.
- 2. The Applicant determined that many of the existing windows were in good condition and will remain in place at this time. When those windows need to be replaced, the replacement units will be historically appropriate in their appearance.