PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name/Address: 1706 Regent

Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for new construction of garage

(PUBLIC HEARING)

Legistar File ID # 46786

Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division

Date Prepared: April 21, 2017

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Natalie Rudolph and Christian Wolf

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness to construction of a

detached garage structure in the University Heights Historic District

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the University Heights Historic District.

Relevant Historic Preservation Ordinance Sections:

41.24 UNIVERSITY HEIGHTS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (4) <u>Standards for the Review of New Structures in the TR-V1, TR-V2, TR-U1, TR-U2, TR-C2, TR-C3, TR-C4, MNX, TSS, and LMX Zoning Districts</u>.
 - (b) Accessory Structures. Accessory structures, as defined in Section 28.211 of the Madison general ordinances, shall be compatible with the design of the existing structures on the zoning lot, shall not exceed fifteen (15) feet in height and shall be as unobtrusive as possible. No accessory structure shall be erected in any yard except a rear yard. Exterior wall materials shall be the same as those for construction of new principal structures as set forth in sec 41.24(4)(a)2.
 - (a) <u>Principal Structures</u>.
 - 2. <u>Materials</u>. Materials for the exterior walls shall be the same as or similar to materials prevalent in the University Heights Historic District. Permitted materials include brick, narrow gauge horizontal clapboards four or less inches in exposed width, stone, stucco, smooth shingles or combinations of the above provided the combinations occur in a manner and location similar to the materials on existing structures in University Heights (e.g., brick on first floor with clapboard on second floor). Other materials, such as aluminum or vinyl must be visually compatible with structures within 200 feet of the subject property. The following materials are prohibited: concrete block, asbestos, wide clapboards over four inches in exposed width, diagonal boards, vertical boards, rough sawn wood, rough split shingles, shakes.



Analysis and Conclusion

The proposed garage is a new structure in the historic district that is over 100 square feet and therefore requires a public hearing.

A brief discussion of 41.24(4)(b) follows:

The garage is compatible with the design of the existing structure on the lot and is being constructed in the rear yard. The exterior wall material is horizontal beveled siding, but the exposure is not noted. The elevations show a wide exposure. The house has a wide siding exposure that is prohibited by ordinance. The foundation material is poured concrete on the sides and rear. The proposed material for the soffits and fascia is aluminum. The window and door trim material is not noted and not shown in elevation. The windows are proposed to be vinyl and the passage door is proposed to be steel. The garage door material is not noted. The height shall be reviewed with Zoning, but the proposed height appears to be under 15 feet.

There seems to be a scale issue with the site plan and the garage footprint.

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of the garage may be met and recommends approval by the Landmarks Commission with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. The Applicant shall review the site plan scale and describe any changes that may be necessary. The site plan does not show the driveway connecting to the proposed garage. In addition, the submission materials show a very large tree that would interfere with the proposed garage.
- 2. Applicant shall confirm the exposure of the siding proposed for the garage. The Landmarks Commission shall discuss the proposed siding exposure to determine if it meets the ordinance.

Legistar File ID #46786 1706 Regent May 1, 2017 Page **3** of **3**

- 3. Doors and windows shall have trim on the jambs and head that matches the width of the trim on the house. The window and passage door shall have show sills. The jamb trim shall die into the top of the sloped show sill.
- 4. In order to create a compatible design, the Landmarks Commission should discuss having the eave detail angled to be similar to that of the main residence. This request may be more difficult with the "kit garage" but would not be impossible.
- 5. In order to create a compatible design, the Landmarks Commission should discuss the low pitch of the proposed garage roof and if the pitch should be more similar to that of the main residence. This request may be more difficult with the "kit garage" but would not be impossible. The garage height shall be reviewed with Zoning.
- 6. In order to create a compatible design, the Landmarks Commission should discuss having the garage windows match the configuration of the main house windows. The main house double hung windows have upper sash that are divided 4 lites wide.