PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

March 20, 2017



PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Project Name/Address:	200 S Pinckney Street (Block 88 & Block 105 development)
Application Type:	Development adjacent to a landmark
Legistar File ID #	46063
Prepared By:	Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared:	March 9, 2017
Summary	
Project Applicant/Contact:	Stephen Mar-Pohl, InSite Consulting Architects, LLC
Requested Action:	The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission provide an advisory recommendation related to development adjacent to landmarks.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located on the eastern portion of Block 88 adjacent to the designated landmark Municipal Building and on the western portion of Block 105 adjacent to the designated landmark Fess Hotel.

Relevant Ordinance Section:

28.144 DEVELOPMENT ADJACENT TO A LANDMARK OR LANDMARK SITE. Any development on a zoning lot adjoining a landmark or landmark site for which Plan Commission or Urban Design Commission review is required shall be reviewed by the Landmarks Commission to determine whether the proposed development is so large or visually intrusive as to adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark or landmark site. Landmarks Commission review shall be advisory to the Plan Commission and the Urban Design Commission.

Analysis and Conclusion

The development proposal came before the Landmarks Commission for an informational presentation on February 20, 2017. At that time, the Landmarks Commission provided general comments related to the design and its affect on the adjacent landmark sites. Their discussion included general comments about the massing of the proposed buildings, the space between the proposed buildings and the landmark buildings, the internal programming of spaces and how that relates to the use of the exterior spaces, the appearance of the building exterior, the material treatment at the street level, and the appropriate treatment of the exposed wall of the Fess Hotel.

The Applicant has submitted for a formal advisory recommendation related to the adjacency of the development to the landmark sites. The current submission materials (dated February 6 and 22, 2017 and March 3, 2017) are similar to those previously reviewed; however, the size and treatment of the openings at the street levels of Block 105 appear to have been modified to respond to the Commissions' previous concerns.

Legistar File ID # 46063 200 S Pinckney (Judge Doyle Development Blocks 88 and 105) March 20, 2017 Page 2 of 2

Block 88/Madison Municipal Building

The eastern portion of Block 88 where the development is proposed has served as a parking lot which was presumably used by mail trucks and potentially as parking for judges and other officers of the court at the time the adjacent landmark building was constructed as the U.S. Post Office and Federal Courthouse. The Madison Municipal Building (formerly U.S. Post Office and Federal Courthouse) has not shared the block with another structure. The context/setting of the Madison Municipal Building will be affected by the adjacent development. The landmark nomination document discusses the architectural significance of the Municipal Building as a civic/institutional building in the Neo-Classical Revival style. The historic character of the building form and architectural treatment are not being affected by the adjacent development.

The Landmarks Commission must determine if the proposed adjacent development's size or visual presence will adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark or landmark site. While the adjacent development on Block 88 will affect the context of the landmark Madison Municipal Building, the affect does not seem to be adverse. The development on the eastern portion of Block 88 would not preclude the Municipal Building from maintaining its architectural significance or its context/setting related to Martin Luther King, Jr. Boulevard, East Doty Street or East Wilson Street.

Block 105/Fess Hotel

The western portion of Block 105 where the development is proposed has served as a parking structure since 1958 and before that it was the location of early commercial and residential structures. The construction of the parking structure disrupted the historic context of the Fess Hotel. The context/setting of the Fess Hotel will be changed by the adjacent development; however, the historic character of the building form and architectural treatment are not being affected by the adjacent development. It should be noted that the treatment/alteration of the exposed exterior wall of the Fess Hotel will require review by the Landmarks Commission.

The Landmarks Commission must determine if the proposed adjacent development's size or visual presence will adversely affect the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmark or landmark site. While the adjacent development on Block 105 will affect the context of the landmark Fess Hotel, the affect does not seem to be adverse. The development on the western portion of Block 105 would not preclude the Fess Hotel from maintaining its historic significance.

Recommendation

Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission advise the Plan Commission and Urban Design Commission that the proposed development is not so large or visually intrusive that it adversely affects the historic character and integrity of the adjoining landmarks or landmark sites.