

PLANNING DIVISION STAFF REPORT

February 20, 2017

PREPARED FOR THE LANDMARKS COMMISSION



Project Name/Address: 1500 Rutledge
Application Type: Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration in historic district
Legistar File ID # [46057](#)
Prepared By: Amy L. Scanlon, Preservation Planner, Planning Division
Date Prepared: February 9, 2017

Summary

Project Applicant/Contact: Sam Breidenbach

Requested Action: The Applicant is requesting that the Landmarks Commission approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations which include the construction of a new rear dormer and installation of new skylight and paired double hung window unit in the Marquette Bungalows historic district.

Background Information

Parcel Location: The subject site is located in the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.

Relevant Landmarks Ordinance Section:

41.25 MARQUETTE BUNGALOWS HISTORIC DISTRICT.

- (5) Standards for the Review of Exterior Alterations and Repairs. All exterior alterations and repairs must be compatible with the historic character of the structure and the Marquette Bungalows Historic District.
 - (a) Re-Siding. NA
 - (b) Roof Materials. NA
 - (c) Skylights. Skylights on street-facing roof slopes are prohibited. Skylights may be permitted on side roof slopes provided the front edge of the skylight is at least ten (10) feet back from the front edge of the main roof. Skylights on any roof area not visible from the street may be permitted. The design should be as simple as possible, of the flat type (not bubble) and painted to blend with the color of the roof.
 - (d) Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. New dormers shall be greater than three (3) feet from the front edge of the roof. New dormers shall match original dormers on the structure (or original dormers on similar structures in the district) in roof shape and material, width of overhang, siding, window design and trim details. The ridge line of a new dormer shall not extend above the ridge line of the main roof of the structure. The dormer walls shall not extend beyond the line of the main structure wall below. Shed dormers behind existing dormers or gables on non-street sides of the structure may be approved provided that the roof material, siding, window design and trim details match the original features of the structure. Other roof alterations shall be compatible with the roof shape and other features of the structure, such as siding and trim details, and shall not extend above the ridge line of the structure.
 - (e) Chimneys. NA

(f) Windows and Doors.

1. General Standards. The original appearance of leaded glass and other non-rectangular decorative windows (e.g., curved top windows) on any facade of the structure shall be retained. Replacement of such windows shall duplicate the original in size, configuration and appearance. Picture windows are prohibited. Trim on new or remodeled windows shall match the original window trim on the structure.
2. Street Facades. Windows and doors on the front or street facade of the structure and on side faces within ten (10) feet of the front facade of the structure shall retain their original or existing appearance, including true muntins where they exist. Replacement windows and doors may be approved if they match the original appearance.
3. Non-Street Side Facades. Retention of the original appearance of windows and doors on the sides of the structure is encouraged. However, if replacement or new windows are proposed, the muntin design of the original windows on the structure may either be replicated with true-divided lights or with exterior or interior applied grids or with grids applied between the panes of glass. New windows shall either be casement windows or double-hung windows. Sash on new windows over four (4) feet square shall be divided by muntins or mullions. Bay windows may be approved if they have sides perpendicular to the wall and if they do not extend beyond the eaves of the roof.
4. Rear Facade. Replacement, remodeling or installation of new doors and windows on the rear facade will not be restricted except as discussed under "General Standards" above.

(g) Porches. NA

(h) Second Exits. NA

(i) Additions and Other Alterations. New additions on the front of the structure are prohibited. Additions on the sides or rear shall be permitted if they are compatible with the structure in architectural design, scale, color, texture, proportion and rhythm of solids to voids and proportion of widths to heights of doors and windows. Materials and architectural details used in additions and alterations shall duplicate in texture, appearance, and design, the materials and details used in the original construction of the structure or of other structures in the district. The Landmarks Commission may approve an exception to this policy where the existing structure materials and architectural details differ from the original. Additions and exterior alterations that exactly duplicate the original materials in composition are encouraged. Additions or exterior alterations that destroy significant architectural features are prohibited. Side additions shall not detract from the design composition of the original facade.

(j) Foundations. NA

(k) Tuckpointing and Brick Repair. NA

(l) Storm Windows and Doors. NA

Analysis and Conclusion

As described in the submission materials, the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations which include the construction of a new rear dormer and installation of new skylight and paired double hung window unit.

A brief discussion of the ordinance standards follows:

- (c) Skylights. The skylight is proposed to be installed on the rear roof slope. The design of the skylight is rectangular and simple.
- (d) Dormers and Other Roof Alterations. The proposed dormer is a shed dormer and is proposed to be installed on the rear roof slope. Due to the configuration of the site, the dormer may be visible from the street; however, it matches the roof shape of other dormers in the district and will match other features of the house including siding details and material, window design and trim details. The ridge line of the proposed dormer is held below the main ridge and the dormer walls are held within the line of the main structure walls below. The appropriateness of the windows proposed for the dormer is discussed below.
- (f) Windows and Doors.
 - 1. General Standards. The proposed window trim at the dormer will have a width similar to the existing window trim. The proposed window trim at the new pair of double hung windows at the second floor will match the original trim in width, sill appearance and head trim.
 - 2. Street Facades. The pair of double hungs that is proposed for replacement to meet egress standards is located on the side, but due to the configuration of the lot, these windows may be visible from the street.
 - 3. Non-Street Side Facades. The replacement windows are being proposed on the side elevation in order to meet egress requirements for sleeping rooms on the second floor. The proposed windows are slightly larger than the existing windows and the appearance of the proposed windows will match the existing windows as closely as possible. The windows will be 9-over-1 simulated divided lights.
 - 4. Rear Facade. The windows proposed for use in the new dormer match the configuration of existing windows on the side elevation.
- (g) Porches. NA
- (h) Second Exits. NA
- (i) Additions and Other Alterations. The proposed exterior alterations will not destroy significant architectural features.
- (j) Foundations. NA
- (k) Tuckpointing and Brick Repair. NA
- (l) Storm Windows and Doors. NA

Recommendation

Staff believes that the standards for granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed exterior alterations are met and recommends that the Landmarks Commission approve the request with the following conditions of approval:

- 1. The skylight shall be finished to blend with the color of the roof.
- 2. The window trim shall not be mitered diagonally.